

(様式 6)

博士論文の要約(公表用)

論文題目

Restriction and exclusion in Indian Buddhism: A study of the *icchantika* in the *Mahāparinirvāṇa-mahāsūtra* and other *Tathāgata-garbha* texts

氏 名 Golding, Corin



This dissertation traces the emergence in Indian Buddhism of a class of person (Skt. *icchantika*; Tib. 'dod chen po/pa; Chin. 一闍提) who is denied the capacity to achieve awakening. At the same time, and in the same corpus of texts, the teaching was introduced that all beings have the potential to become a Buddha; or, in the canonical formulation(s), variations of the following: Skt. *sarvasattvās tathāgata-garbhāḥ*; Tib: *sems can thams cad la de bzhin gshegs pa'i snying po yod*; Chin. 一切眾生悉有佛性 (often translated along the lines of 'all beings have a Buddha Nature'). The figure of the *icchantika* is well known within the Buddhist world, as also within the world of Buddhist Studies, especially in East Asia, where it was the subject of much controversy, primarily in China. Several modern studies of the *icchantika* exist, to some extent in western languages, though more voluminously in Japanese. However, the overwhelming impression from the scholarship is that the *icchantika* contradict the fundamental principle of *Tathāgata-garbha* thought, namely that all beings have a Buddha Nature. Similarly, the pivotal relationship between the *icchantika* and *bodhihetu* has, at best, been underemphasised, and in most cases, neglected or misunderstood; the logic by which the lack of *bodhihetu* connects with the many other characterisations of the *icchantika*, primarily that they lack wholesome roots (e.g., *sarvakuśalamūlotsarga*) and reject the (new) Buddha Dharma (e.g., *sūtrapratikṣepa*), has yet to be pursued in any sustained manner. It is the primary purpose of this thesis to correct these omissions.

Of course, while their precise doctrinal and socio-cultural origins remain obscure, the *icchantika* did not emerge in a vacuum. Indeed, Buddhism from the earliest known texts elaborates a surprisingly wide-ranging taxonomy of restriction, exclusion and, from a modern perspective, discrimination. There are many examples in the Pali canon as well as the Mahāyāna literature, from prohibitions on certain categories of person (and non-person) entering the monastic order or listening to the Buddha's teachings, to more comprehensive statements against those who are denied the capacity to achieve Buddhahood. I therefore locate my study of the *icchantika* within a wider discussion of categories and discourses of exclusion in Indian Buddhism. My thesis begins in Chapter 1 by tracing some of the possible antecedents to the *icchantika* found in the Pali tradition, before presenting in Chapter 2 sections from a Mahāyāna treatise in which we are introduced to the

category of *agotrastha*, ‘one lacking in the predisposition (or lineage) (for attaining *nirvāṇa*)’, who has much in common with the *icchantika*. I then take a slight detour in Chapter 3 to present important passages from canonical and commentarial sources that will help clarify two key descriptors of the *icchantika* that we will meet often in Part 2: namely, that they have destroyed all ‘wholesome roots’ (*kuśalamūla*) and lack ‘the cause of awakening’ (*bodhihetu*).

Chapters 4, 5 and 6 are devoted to the *Mahāparinirvāṇa-mahāsūtra*. This is the first scriptural source known where we encounter the *icchantika*, and is also where they receive their most sustained elaboration. In addition, at least in one witness, the *icchantika* are simultaneously, or rather alternately, condemned forever to wander aimlessly in *saṃsāra*, denied any seed of goodness that might lead them to *nirvāṇa*, while also decreed to be absolved and assured of awakening. The whole picture is further clouded by the fact that there are at least three independent witnesses (one Tibetan, and two separate Chinese translations), as well as a limited number of Sanskrit fragments, each of which, in several places and to a lesser or greater degree, contradicts the other. Thus, while several other, sometimes related, texts will help clarify some of the key themes that are discussed in the *Mahāparinirvāṇa-mahāsūtra* chapters, and will do so on occasion in critical ways, they will nonetheless play an altogether secondary role in the body of this thesis. Chapters 4 and 5 treat those passages on the *icchantika* that, broadly speaking, are common to all three main witnesses, while Chapter 6 focuses on the presentation of the *icchantika* in the material that is unique to the longer Chinese version.

While the figure of the *icchantika* continued to occupy a prominent place in the commentarial traditions in East Asia for at least several centuries, in India, their career seems to have been somewhat more short-lived and restricted mainly to references in the *Tathāgatagarbha* literature. Chapter 7 turns to the most important of these, the *Āṅgulimālīyasūtra*, the *Ratnagotravibhāga Mahāyānottaratantraśāstra*, and the *Laṅkāvatārasūtra*. In the process, we have the chance to notice shifts in register and nuance as each text in its own way reflects the tensions that the category creates in their wider philosophical frameworks and the struggles they go through to resolve those conflicts.

In addition to the developing thematic of social and soteriological exclusion, taking us from specific injunctions on who may qualify as a monastic to the incapacity to achieve Buddhahood, I frame the analyses of the *icchantika* around the following sets of tensions in the *Mahāparinirvāṇa-mahāsūtra*, which, though often presented in the literature as a contradiction, are, I argue, fundamental to the logic of that text: *icchantika-Bodhisattva*; *icchantika-*buddhadhātu*; and, *icchantika-bodhihetu*.

Table of Contents

Introduction: *Dissertation overview*

PART 1 ANTICIPATING THE *ICCHANTIKA*

Chapter 1

Restrictions on membership in the community: Antecedents to the icchantika in Indian Buddhism

The Milindapañha

The Vinaya

Chapter 2

Exclusion from attaining the ultimate goal of Buddhism: Common themes in the Yogācāra

Gotra discourse

The Gotrabhūmi

Chapter 3

Requirements for awakening: Laying the ground for the charge against the icchantika

Wholesome roots and burnt seeds: kuśalamūla

Causes of enlightenment: bodhipakṣā dharmāḥ, bodhihetu

PART 2 PURSUING THE *ICCHANTIKA*

Chapter 4

First impressions: The Mahāparinirvāṇa-mahāsūtra

Historical background

Key themes

Secondary literature: English

Secondary literature: Japanese

Chapter 5

The icchantika in material common to all versions of the Mahāparinirvāṇa-mahāsūtra

General characterisations

The search for origins

Icchantika within and without

The icchantika as a call to arms: The relation of faith to practice

Buddhadhātu, bodhihetu

Chapter 6

The icchantika in material unique to the Dharmakṣema translation

The threat of the icchantika to wider system of Mahāyāna thought

Nothing is forever: The icchantika re(de)defined

Chapter 7

The icchantika in the wider Tathāgatarbha literature

The Aṅgulimālīyasūtra

The Ratnagotravibhāga Mahāyānottaratantraśāstra

The Laṅkāvatārasūtra

Conclusion

Appendices

Bibliography