国際仏教学大学院大学研究紀要

第 20 号 (平成 28 年)

Journal of the International College for Postgraduate Buddhist Studies Vol. XX, 2016

The 'Dul bar byed pa (Vinītaka) Case-Law Section of the Mūlasarvāstivādin Uttaragrantha: Sources for Guņaprabha's Vinayasūtra and Indian Buddhist Attitudes towards Sex and Sexuality

Shayne Clarke

The 'Dul bar byed pa (Vinītaka) Case-Law Section of the Mūlasarvāstivādin Uttaragrantha: Sources for Guņaprabha's Vinayasūtra and Indian Buddhist Attitudes towards Sex and Sexuality

Shayne Clarke*

Introduction

The $M\bar{u}lasarv\bar{a}stiv\bar{a}da$ -vinaya is comprised of four main divisions: (1) the Vibhangas or canonical analyses on the rules enumerated in the prātimokṣa-sūtras for monks and nuns, (2) the 17 Vastus or chapters dealing with corporate law or transactions of the sangha, (3) the Kṣudrakavastu or chapter on miscellany, and (4) the Uttaragrantha. Of these four divisions, the least studied is the Uttaragrantha.¹

^{*} The research for this paper was conducted during a very fruitful stay as a Research Fellow at the International Institute for Buddhist Studies (Sep. to Dec. 2012). I express my heartfelt thanks to the faculty and staff of the Institute, especially Professors Florin Deleanu, Ochiai Toshinori, and Mr. Hori Shin'ichirō, for their generous support and kind hospitality. A draft version of this paper was read at the Institute on Nov. 30, 2012 under the title "An Unnoticed Collection of Indian Buddhist Case Law: The 'Dul bar byed pa of the Mūlasarvāstivādin Uttaragrantha"; a revised version, titled "In All the Wrong Places: Sources for a History of Indian Buddhist Attitudes toward Sexuality and the Development of the 'Best Book' of Monastic Law," was read at the Harvard Buddhist Studies Forum (Feb. 22, 2013). I thank the participants in both lectures for stimulating conversation. I wish to thank Dr. Klaus Wille for making his unpublished transliterations of the Private Collection, Virginia, available to me. I thank Drs. Jens Borgland, Petra Kieffer-Pülz, Ryōji Kishino, Klaus Wille, Fumi Yao, and Prof. Jens-Uwe Hartmann for useful comments, all of which have improved this paper. I alone remain responsible for any errors.

50

The Uttaragrantha is comprised of ten² substantial sections (or possibly "texts"),³ and preserved in its entirety only in Tibetan translation. Although a small number of Sanskrit fragments are preserved in various international collections, at present no complete text of any of the ten sections contained in the Uttaragrantha is known to exist in Sanskrit. Two of the ten sections were translated into Chinese by Yijing 義淨 (635-713 CE) at the beginning of the 8th century.⁴ At least six (and possibly eight)⁵ sections known from the Tibetan translation of the Uttaragrantha ('Dul ba gzhung dam pa) are also preserved in the Sapoduo-bu pini modeleqie 薩婆 多部毘尼摩得勒伽 (hereafter Modeleqie; T. 1441) translated by Sanghavarman 僧伽跋摩 in 435 CE. Moreover, there are close parallels to eight (and possibly all ten) preserved in the Shisonglü 十誦律 (T. 1435) or "Vinaya in Ten Recitations," a text generally attributed to the Sarvāstivādins.

The focus of the present paper, which is divided into three sections, is the second of the aforementioned ten sections of the *Uttaragrantha*,⁶ the

¹ There are two *Uttaragranthas* preserved in Tibetan: one incomplete (*'Dul ba gzhung bla ma*), the other complete (*'Dul ba gzhung dam pa*). See page 70, below. See also Kishino 2006; Clarke 2015, 77–80.

² If one includes the brief section consisting of a single question and answer known as the *Upālis kun dris* pa (Sanskrit title unattested), then one may count 11 sections (12 if one includes the colophon). Even Tibetan commentators disagree on the number of sections/texts included in the *Uttaragrantha*, the disagreement seemingly centering on whether or not to include the 11th section in the overall count; see Kishino 2013, 22n72.

³ I use "sections" to avoid confusion with the fourfold division of texts (or sections) into *Vibhangas*, *Vastus*, *Kşudrakavastu*, and *Uttaragrantha*.

⁴ The *Nidāna* and *Muktaka*, translated in a single text, T. 1452; see Clarke 2001; 2002; 2015, 76–77; Kishino 2013; Kishino 2016.

⁵ It is possible that the *Pañcaka* and *Sodaśaka* are included within the *Ekottarikā* section, thus yielding 8 sections; see Clarke 2015, 78, 81, 82. For a list of the contents of the *Uttaragrantha*, see Table 1, below.

⁶ See Table 1, row 4. 9. The 'Dul bar byed pa is the second section in the Tibetan

51

section known in Tibetan as 'Dul bar byed pa and sometimes abbreviated to 'Dul byed. As is the case for all section titles in the Uttaragrantha, the Sanskrit behind the Tibetan title is unattested in the extant Sanskrit folios of the Mūlasarvāstivāda-vinaya itself.7 Accordingly, in Section One, I introduce evidence in order to determine the Sanskrit title behind Tibetan 'Dul bar byed pa. In Section Two, I survey the parallels to the 'Dul bar byed *pa* preserved in Tibetan. Chinese, and Pāli. In this section I observe that the 'Dul bar byed pa has extremely close parallels in the Modelegie, and also parallels-albeit not particularly close-in all other extant Vinayas including the Shisonglü 十誦律. I suggest that identification of these parallels will allow us to understand better the close relationship between the Mūlasarvāstivāda-vinaya and the Modelegie, and the degree of distance between these two and the Sarvāstivādin Shisonglü 十誦律. I conclude this section by demonstrating that all available evidence suggests that the Sanskrit term for 'Dul bar byed pa is vinītaka. In Section Three, I discuss a number of quotations and paraphrases from the *Vinītaka* preserved in Gunaprabha's (Yon tan 'od; 德光; c. 5th-7th cents.)⁸ Vinayasūtra and its Autocommentary, the Vinayasūtravrttyabhidhānasvavyākhyāna. I also consider the relationship between the *Vinitaka* known to Gunaprabha and the various versions preserved in Tibetan and Chinese translations. My goal in this section is to ascertain whether the Sanskrit sources quoted by Gunaprabha may be identified with the 'Dul bar byed pa, its Chinese parallel in the Modelegie, or some other extant version.

The 'Dul bar byed pa and its parallels begin with what is perhaps the most detailed accounts of Indian Buddhist case-law concerning transgressions of the first *pārājika* rule preserved in any extant Buddhist text.

arrangement of the Uttaragrantha.

⁷ Tokuoka 1968, 30, suggests *Praśamaka*, but like many of his other "restorations" this must be disregarded.

⁸ For the dating, see Schopen, [1994] 2004, 312-313.

Although the main focus of this paper is the structure and recensional history of the *Uttaragrantha* collections, in order to present my case about the shared, core structure of the various versions of the *Vinitaka*s, in Appendix 1 and 2, I have compiled a detailed catalogue of case-law concerning the rule of celibacy. While not the focus of the present paper, the case-law pertaining to this rule is likely the richest source of Indian Buddhist attitudes towards sex and sexuality currently available to us in any language, a source which to date has remained largely unknown. I trust that these appendices will serve as helpful guides to those interested in furthering our knowledge of Buddhist notions of sex, sexuality, gender, and transgression.

Section 1: Sanskrit Title

Chinese and Tibetan terms are often reconstructed with unattested or inadequately attested Sanskrit words. These words enter the scholarly lexicon and are accepted without sufficient questioning. In order to establish the Sanskrit word underlying Chinese or Tibetan translations, it is not sufficient simply to cite a Chinese-Sanskrit or Tibetan-Sanskrit dictionary. Rather, evidence of attestation must be presented; an argument for the adoption of Sanskrit terms must be made on a case-by-case basis. Although I propose that the Sanskrit term underlying Tibetan 'Dul bar byed pa is vinītaka, that this is the case must be demonstrated and not simply asserted. Below I review some of the evidence.

An important reference to the 'Dul bar byed pa is found in one of the introductory verses to Viśeṣamitra's (勝友; Khyad par bshes gnyen; dates unknown; referred to in earlier literature as Jinamitra⁹) commentary on the *Bhikṣu-prātimokṣa/vibhaṅga* of the *Mūlasarvāstivāda-vinaya*, the

⁹ On the two Jinamitras, see Teramoto 1928, 307n8.

Vinayasamgraha (根本薩婆多部律攝; 'Dul ba bsdus pa). The Vinayasamgraha is one of only two Mūlasarvāstivādin Vinaya commentaries extant in both Chinese and Tibetan (the other being the Vinayakārikā, with 14 folios [approx. 344 verses] preserved in a mostly unedited and unpublished Sanskrit manuscript preserved in the Sānkrtyāyana Collection). Although Visesamitra's Vinayasamgraha seems not to have been particularly popular in Tibet, where Gunaprabha's commentarial tradition dominates even down to the present day, it is important to note two things with regard to Visesamitra's commentarial tradition. First, even though Yijing knew of Gunaprabha, he seems to have opted to translate not Gunaprabha's Vinayasūtra and related sub-commentaries but Visesamitra's Vinayasamgraha. In fact, Yijing translated this text in 700 CE, three years before completing the translation of the canonical Vinaya. Thus, although it is clear that the commentarial tradition on the Mūlasarvāstivāda-vinaya was important to Yijing, it appears that this commentarial tradition, favoured in Nālandā where Yijing was based, differed from that in vogue in Mathurā and transmitted in the work of Gunaprabha.¹⁰ It is also important to note that despite its lack of continued popularity in Tibet, the Vinayasamgraha is extremely well represented in the corpus of Tibetan manuscripts from Dunhuang,¹¹ something that cannot be said of Gunaprabha's commentaries.

The *Vinayasamgraha* has not received sufficient scholarly attention; I know of only a handful of modern studies in which it has been discussed in any detail.¹² The most detailed study of the *Vinayasamgraha*'s introductory verses is the pioneering study by Sasaki Kyōgo 佐々木教悟 (1915–2005).¹³

¹⁰ See the colophon in which the connection between the *Autocommentary* and Mathurā is made explicit; Vinayasūtra's Pravrajyāvastu Study Group 2012, 37 (mention of Mathurā is omitted in Bapat and Gokhale's edition [1982, 59]).

¹¹ See Yang 2012.

¹² Shaku Keihō 1939; 1940; Sasaki Kyōgo 1976; 1977; Yang 2012.

¹³ Sasaki Kyōgo 1976. The only other reference to these verses of which I am

As we will see, however, Sasaki's interpretation is not without significant problems. The verse in question reads as follows:

佛說廣釋并諸事	尼陀那及目得迦
增一乃至十六文	鄔波離尊之所問
摩納毘迦申要釋	比尼得迦并本母
我今隨次攝廣文	令樂略者速開悟14

don (Peking [P]: dan) gang gzhi dang phran tshegs gleng gzhi sil bu la yod rnam par 'byed las gang gsungs dang ||

gang dag lnga pa dang ni bcu drug pa dang nye ba 'khor gyis zhus las bshad pa dang ||

gang dag bram ze'i bu mo dang ni <u>'dul byed</u> de bzhin¹⁵ gang dag (P: ga) ma mo las bshad pa ||

rin chen yon tan '
od 'bar b
zhin du yon tan 'bar ba de dag 'dir ni rim b
zhag $\|^{16}$

To be sure, there are a few minor discrepancies between the Chinese and Tibetan versions, especially in the last line, and even a few textual problems that remain to be resolved. Nevertheless, it should be clear to all who work their way through it that Viśeşamitra's verse contains what was almost certainly intended to be a complete list of the contents of the

aware is the series of annotations found in the five volume, Edo-period printing of the *Vinayasamgraha* (説一切有部律攝) preserved in Ryūkoku University Library (for a description of the volumes and the extent of the annotations, see Clarke 2006, 26-28). The first volume contains a foreword (附言) by the Japanese Mūlasarvāstivādin monk Gakunyo 學如 (1716-1773) dated to 1764 (明和甲申).

14 Vinayasamgraha: T. 1458 (xxiv) 525a8-11 (juan 卷 1).

¹⁵ Somewhere around here one would expect a reference to the *Kathāvastu*; I wonder whether *kathā* was somehow conflated with *tathā* resulting in Tibetan *de bzhin*.

¹⁶ Derge (4105), *bstan 'gyur, 'Dul ba* (vol. 253) NU 88a2-3; Peking (5606), *bstan 'gyur, 'Dul ba'i 'grel pa* (vol. 120) PHU 121a4-6. In the last line we seem to have a possible reference to Gunaprabha in Tibetan.

55

Mūlasarvāstivāda-vinaya. In order to clarify which sections are enumerated in this verse, below I provide a table (Table 1) listing the known Sanskrit titles of the sections of the *Uttaragrantha*, and, in columns 5 and 6, the exact location of these sections as they have come down to us in Tibetan (sTog Palace edition) and Yijing's Chinese translation (Taishō). I have also included the Tibetan and Chinese terms used to translate or transliterate the Sanskrit titles in their respective translations as a basis for comparison with the terminology of Viśeşamitra's verse.

	Sanskrit Titles	Chinese (Viśeșamitra)	Tibetan (Viśeșamitra)	sTog Palace	Yijing trans.
1	vibhanga	guangshi 廣釋 translation	rnam par 'byed translation	'dul ba rnam par 'byed pa CA 29b7-JA 555a7; NYA 34b7-442a6	guangshi 廣釋 ¹⁷ T. 1442-1443
2	vastus	zhushi 諸事	gzhi translation	'dul ba gzhi KA-NGA	zhushi 諸事 or shi 事 ¹⁸ T. 1444-1450
3	kșudrakavastu	translation	phran tshegs translation	phran tshegs kyi gzhi TA 465a7-THA 484a7	zashi 雜事 T. 1451
4.1	nidāna	nituona 尼陀那 transliteration	gleng gzhi translation	gleng gzhi NA 100b5-203b6	nituona 尼陀那 T. 1452, 415a1-435b27
4.2	muktaka	mudejia 目得迦 transliteration	sil bu translation	rkyang pa NA 203b7-291b6	mudejia 目得迦 T. 1452, 435c1-455c1
4.3	*ekottarikā	zengyi 增一 translation	—	gcig nas 'dzegs pa NA 32a5-68a1	—
4.4	*pañcaka	naizhi 乃至? "down to" ¹⁹	lnga pa translation	lnga pa NA 68a2-87b5	—
4.5	*șoḍaśaka	shiliuwen 十六文 translation	bcu drug pa translation	bcu drug pa NA 87b5-100b5	—
4.6	upāliparipŗcchā	wubolizun zhi suowen 鄔波離尊之所問 transliteration + translation	nye ba 'khor gyis zhus translation	upalis zhus pa DA 127a3-398b4	_
4.7	*māņavikā	monapijia 摩納毘迦 ²⁰ transliteration	bram ze'i bu mo translation	ma na bi ka NA 320b3-338b2	_
4.8	kathāvastu	shenyaoshi 申要釋? ²¹ translation?	—;	gtam gyi dngos po — NA 291b6-320b3 —	
4.9	vinītaka	binidejia 比尼得迦 transliteration	'dul byed translation	'dul bar byed pa — DA 398b4-417a7; NA 1b1-32a5	
4.10	mātŗkā	benmu 本母 translation	ma mo translation	ma lta bu NA 338b2-453a3	_

Table 1: Contents of the Mūlasarvāstivāda-vinaya According to Viśesamitra

It is important to note that Viśeşamitra does not use the term *Uttaragrantha* (or any variant). He does, however, seem to list most, if not all, ten constituent sections thereof. Accordingly, I have numbered the section titles mentioned by Viśeşamitra following the fourfold division outlined above, with sections of the *Uttaragrantha* numbered from 4.1 to 4.10. The focus here is to establish the Sanskrit title underlying number 4.9 above, namely *binidejia* 比尼得迦 in Chinese and '*dul byed* or '*dul bar byed pa* in Tibetan.

Sasaki states that the Chinese term *binidejia* 比尼得迦 is a transcription of the Sanskrit term *Vinayapițaka.*²² At first glance, this looks

¹⁸ T. 1452 (xxiv) 426a14: 及諸事 (full context given in note above).

¹⁹ Although the **Pañcaka* is not specified, I take the inclusive "down to" (*naizhi* \mathcal{B} Ξ), suggesting an abbreviation in the list, to indicate its presence.

²⁰ On the **Māṇavikā*, see Clarke 2015, 79-80. In the annotated version of the *Vinayasamgraha* mentioned in note 13, above, (fasc. 1, p. 8) *monapijia* 摩納毘迦 "*Māṇavikā*" is glossed as follows, indicating that it was understood as a text's title (摩納毘迦今ノ第十軽訶戒下ニ出ッ即書目也). It seems that what exactly it refers to was unknown to our Edo-period commentators, as one would expect since the two extant Chinese versions do not contain titles.

²¹ In the annotated version of the *Vinayasamgraha* mentioned in note 13, above, (fasc. 1, p. 8) *shenyaoshi* 申要釋 seems not to be understood as a title of a specific text.

²² Sasaki Kyōgo 1976, 989: "この中の諸事とは諸犍度を、尼陀那 Nidāna は因縁 を、目得迦 Māṭṛkā は行母を、増一乃至十六文は十七の事 Vastu を指すとおもわれ る。また、Mānavaka 摩納毘迦は儒童の意味であるが、ジャータカでは燃灯仏のも とにおける釈迦仏の少年時を指すところから、ここでは釈尊のことをいうのであり、 比尼得迦 Vinaya-piṭaka は律蔵を、本母は Māṭṛkā を指す。" Nearly all of these identifications are incorrect. I agree with only the first (*Vastus*; 諸事) and last (*Mātṛkā*; 本母).

¹⁷ See, for instance, T. 1453 (xxiv) 483b25-28: 有五種事不應書者。一謂波羅底木 叉。二并此<u>廣釋</u>。三諸餘毘奈耶。四并廣釋。五謂諸有施主所施之物。及別人己物; T. 1452 (xxiv) 426a12-14: 佛言。有五種物皆不應書。謂別解脫戒經。<u>別解脫廣釋</u>。 及諸事等與律教相應之義。并私己物。於己物上不應書字。可作私記憶持。; T. 1451 (xxiv) 282a8: 此頌與<u>廣釋</u>盜戒不異; T. 1459 (xxiv) 617c11: 戒經及<u>廣釋</u>.

reasonable: *bini* 比尼 often transcribes *vinava*; *de* 得 is likely transcribing *ta* or ta^{23} and *jia* ia is a standard transcription of Indic ka. Phonetically, however, there are two problems with Sasaki's suggestion. The main problem is the lack of any transcription for "pi"; the lack of a transcription for "*va*" is less problematic since this is sometimes abbreviated in any case. Given that this verse lists the component parts of the Vinayapitaka, however, the only way Sasaki's interpretation would be possible is if the verse were telling us that the aforementioned titles comprise the Vinayapitaka. But this is not what the verse says. This should be clear, for instance, from the fact that after Chn. binidejia 比尼得迦 /Tib. 'Dul byed the verse—and hence also the list—continues, listing another *Vinava* text, the Mātrkā (benmu 本母; ma mo). That the verse/list does not end at Chn. binidejia 比尼得迦 / Tib. 'dul byed suggests that these terms are the names of a specific section or text of the Mūlasarvāstivāda-vinaya. Although *binidejia* 比尼得迦 is a relatively poor transcription of *Vina*[*vapi*]*taka*, it is a perfectly good transcription of Vinitaka.

Section 2: The Extant Corpus of Vinītakas

The 'Dul bar byed pa is approximately 50 folios long in Tibetan. As noted in Table 1, there is no Chinese translation preserved in the Mūlasarvāstivādin corpus translated by Yijing. In terms of content, at least at first glance, the

In the annotated version of the *Vinayasaṃgraha* mentioned in note 13, above, (fasc. 1, p. 8) *binidejia* 比尼得迦 is glossed as follows, possibly indicating an awareness of the relationship between this section and the "miscellaneous section" of the *Modeleqie* (比尼得迦摩得伽論三丁十六云毘尼摩得勒伽雑事ト云ヘリ). Note, however, the *Risshō kōroku* 律攝講録 (Anon.) (on which, see Clarke 2006, 28), wherein *binidejia* 比尼得迦 seems to be understood as the *Modeleqie* 摩得勒伽 (fasc. 1, p. 19).

 $^{^{23}}$ Clearly transcribing a voiceless, unaspirated dental or perhaps retroflex consonant (i. e., t or t).

'Dul bar byed pa resembles the Bhikşu-vibhanga, in which the rules of discipline for monks are introduced in order of diminishing gravity from the four pārājikas onwards, almost invariably²⁴ all with stories explaining how and why the rules were introduced. The 'Dul bar byed pa, however, covers only nine—the first nine—vibhanga rules: the four pārājikas and the first five sanghāvaśeṣa offences. Why coverage extends only to these nine rules is not clear.²⁵ Although there is some overlap with the content of the vibhanga, the 'Dul bar byed pa is a discrete textual unit and is not to be confused with the vibhanga.²⁶ The 'Dul bar byed pa appears to contain case-

²⁴ The possible exception being the *śaikṣa* section in which several rules are sometimes delivered on the basis of a single frame story in Yijing's translation but not in the Tibetan translation.

²⁵ The fact that the first five *saṅghāvaśeṣa* rules deal with matters related to sexuality (from masturbation to matchmaking) may lend some credence to the theory proposed here—albeit with very little confidence—that the 'Dul bar byed pa was intended to deal with only the most serious of monastic offences, being the pārājika rules (concerning first and foremost sexuality) and the saṅghāvaśeṣa offences related to sexuality. Hirakawa [1960] 1999-2000, vol. 2: 252 also comments on the fact that in the Vinayas preserved in Chinese these sections cover only down to saṅghāvaśeṣa 5 or 8; why they do not continue is unclear: "まぎらわしい実例に関 する説明が、僧残法第五条ないし第八条までで、なぜ中断されているかは不明であ る。"

In his Autocommentary, Guṇaprabha states: sāñcaritrottānām vibhāvanam vinītakāni (see VSSMsB sūtra number 98 [VSPVSG 2007, 34. 16–. 17; 45. 17; trans. on p. 62 must be corrected]). Although I do not fully understand this, it seems to be telling us that the Vinītakas are an elucidation/examination or even judgement (vibhāvana) of the rules up to (stretching down to? $ut\sqrt{tan}$?) the fifth saṅghāvaśeṣa concerning go-betweens (sāñcaritra).

²⁶ In his book on monastic administration, Jonathan Silk discusses two *Vinaya* passages quoted in Śākyaprabha's *Ārya-mūlasarvāstivādi-śrāmaņerakārikā-vṛtti-prabhāvatī*. Both passages are introduced in Tibetan with a precise textual reference, itself cited by Silk (2008, 266–267), in which we are told that the source is the '*Dul bar byed pa*: '*dir gzhung ni 'dul byed las*. Silk, however, is unable to locate the original source of Śākyaprabha's quotations; he states, "I have not yet identified

law, that is, cases purporting to be of specific events attributed to specific individuals, and as a general rule—at least as they are presented—not hypothetical situations such as those found in the casuistry of the *vibhangas*, for instance.

Similar incidents or case-law histories are recorded in all extant Sthavira Vinayas, viz., Sarvāstivāda-vinaya,²⁷ Dharmaguptaka-vinaya,

the passage in the *Vibhaiga* to which this apparently refers." Silk, then, seems to understand 'dul byed to be a reference to the *Vinaya-vibhaiga*, perhaps having confused Tibetan 'dul ba rnam par 'byed pa or rnam 'byed with 'dul bar byed pa or 'dul byed. Both passages may be located in the 'Dul bar byed pa. The source for Silk's "Textual Materials 56" concerning a resident monk who is said to incur a duşkrta but not a pārājika for, with the intention of stealing, taking goods belonging to the Community of the Four Quarters from one monastery to another is found at (*Vinītaka pārājika 2*): sTog 'Dul ba NA 6a1-2; T. 1441 (xxiii) 587c15-16; T. 1435 (xxiii) 430c15-17. Interestingly, the 'Dul bar byed pa clearly states that this is a sthūlātyaya (nyes pa sbom por 'gyur ro); Śākyaprabha, however, states that it is a duşkrta; this is also the position of the *Vinītaka*s in the Modeleqie and Shisonglū. The discrepancy between Śākyaprabha and the received Tibetan 'Dul bar byed pa further suggests the existence of multiple Mūlasarvāstivādin *Vinītaka*s and multiple Mūlasarvāstivādin legal traditions; see p. 94.

Silk's "Textual Materials 55" involves a resident monk who has someone plough a sangha-owned field. The sangha's field happens to be very close to a householder's field, and this proximity gives rise to a dispute over ownership. Non-humans are called as witnesses. After the householder goes away, the monk restarts the ploughing, only to be caught by the householder. The source for this is found at (*Vinītaka pārājika 2*): sTog '*Dul ba* NA 4a6-b3; T. 1441 (xxiii) 587b6-14; T. 1435 (xxiii) 430a22-b4.

By my admittedly very quick count, the '*Dul bar byed pa* is cited no less than 45 times in Śākyaprabha's *Ārya-mūlasarvāstivādi-śrāmaņerakārikā-vṛtti-prabhāvatī*. For a number of references to Śākyaprabha's commentary, see most recently Pagel 2014 (Index, p. 182, s. v. *mūlasarvāstivādiśrāmaņerakārikāvṛttiprabhāvatī*).

²⁷ In asserting that it is primarily only modern, Western scholars who use terms such as "the *Vinaya* of the Sarvāstivādins" and "*Sarvāstivāda-vinaya*," Kishino (2013, 4 and 5n17) overlooks earlier Japanese scholarship such as Nanjio's 1883 catalogue (see, for instance, page 246) and even Nakamura 1980 (51: *Dharmaguptaka-vinaya*,

Mahīšāsaka-vinaya, and the Pāli Vinaya. There are also parallels in the Mahāsānghika-vinaya, but those parallels do not follow the same structure as those preserved in the Vinītakas of other schools. To the best of my knowledge, Hirakawa Akira 平川彰 (1915-2002) was the first modern scholar to notice the correspondence between the Mahāsānghika Vinītaka section and the parallels in the Dharmaguptaka, Mahīšāsaka, Sarvāstivādin, and Pāli Vinayas.²⁸ Hirakawa, however, does not discuss the Modeleqie or the Mūlasarvāstivāda-vinaya, the latter's parallels being preserved only in the Tibetan translation of the Mūlasarvāstivāda-vinaya which is not well covered in his otherwise magisterial survey of Vinaya literature.

Below in Table 2, I provide a brief outline of the various versions of the extant *Vinītakas*. Due to space constraints, in Table 2 and Section Three below, I restrict myself to a discussion of the various versions of the first rule, $p\bar{a}r\bar{a}jika$ one. A similar comparative study could easily be undertaken on the remaining eight rules. The present study, however, will suffice as a test case in order to introduce part of the text of the Tibetan 'Dul bar byed pa and the genre of the Vinītakas as a whole.

²⁸ Hirakawa [1960] 1999-2000, vol. 2: 249-252.

Mahīšāsaka-vinaya). One reason why some scholars may refer to *Vinayas* preserved in Chinese, especially when writing in English (or any other European language), in terms of their *nikāya*-affiliation is the simple fact that the English writer cannot—or should not—leave untranslated or unromanized Chinese characters in the main body of the text. A Japanese author may refer to the *Shisonglü* 十誦律, for instance, without any modification of the Chinese characters in the title, and still be understood. The English author has three main choices: translate (e. g., *Vinaya* in Ten Recitations), transliterate (e. g., *shisonglü*), or gloss (e. g., *Sarvāstivāda-vinaya*). As long as the gloss is understood as a gloss, and not as a translation of the text's title, then I see no harm. It would be problematic to understand the use of the definite article in "the *Vinaya* of the Sarvāstivādins" or "the *Sarvāstivāda-vinaya*" to imply that the *Shisonglü* was the sole *Vinaya* of the Sarvāstivādins. I thank Drs. Kishino Ryōji and Yao Fumi for drawing my attention to possible misunderstandings here.

Table 2: Parallels to the 'Dul bar byed pa in All Known Vinaya Texts

	Sthavira Vinayas						
Vinaya	(1) MSV sTog 'Dul ba Mülasarvästiväda -vinaya	(2) 薩婆多部毘尼 摩得勒伽 T. 1441 *Sarvāstivāda- vinaya- mātŗkā	(3) 十誦律 T. 1435 Sarvāstivāda	(4) 四分律 T. 1428 Dharmaguptaka	(5) 五分律 T. 1421 Mahīšāsaka	(6) Pāli Vinaya	(7) 摩訶僧祇律 T. 1425 Mahāsāṅghika
Division	Uttaragrantha		binisong 比尼誦, biqiusong 比丘 誦, shansong pini 善誦毘尼				
Title	'dul bar byed pa	zashi 雜事 (mistaken?) ²⁹	_	<i>tiaobu</i> 調部	<i>tiaofufa</i> 調伏法	vinītavatthu	vinītāni; <i>bini duandangshi</i> 比尼斷當事; <i>pinifa</i> 毘尼法
Full text	DA 398b4-NA 32a5	582b13-593b20	424b16-445a12	971c8-990b7	182a5-185a27	$\begin{array}{c} Pa i: Vm III 33. 35-40. 25\\ Pa 2. Vm III 55. 25-67. 38\\ Pa 3. Vm III 75. 1-86. 26\\ Pa 4. Vm III 108. -109. 19\\ Sa 1. Vm III 108. -109. 19\\ Sa 2. Vm III 103. -16-131. 24\\ Sa 4. Vm III 103. -16-131. 24\\ Sa 5. Vm III 134. 10 34\\ Sa 5. Vm III 134. 30-144. 21^*\\ \end{array}$	464c14-470c20
Pārājika 1	DA 398b4-411b3	582b13-585b29	424b16-427a11	971c8-975b21	182a5-c28	BD 1: 51-63; Trans. KP 2001, 67- 71 = 2014, 354-359	Cases: 1, 4, 5, 6, 17, 25, 28, 29 ³⁰
Number of cases (Pā 1)	ca. 85	ca. 83	ca. 38	ca. 87	ca. 26	ca. 54	8

På = *Påråjika*; Sa = *Sanghāvašeşa*; BD = *The Book of the Discipline* (Horner [1938-1966] 1996-1997); KP 2001 = Kieffer-Pülz 2001 = Kieffer-Pülz 2014; Vin = Oldenberg [1879-1883] 1969-1982.

*English translations from Pāli as follows: *BD* 1: 51-63; 93-114; 136-150; 171-190; 197-198; 211-213; 218-221; 226-228; 243-245; KP 2001 (and in 2014 reprint of *BD* 1, 349-372).

(1): 'Dul bar byed pa

The Tibetan 'Dul bar byed pa is preserved in the Uttaragrantha of the Mūlasarvāstivāda-vinaya. In the sTog Palace edition of the Kanjur, the 'Dul

²⁹ See, however, the second paragraph of note 22, above.

 $^{^{30}}$ See note 68, below.

bar byed pa runs from '*Dul ba* DA 398b4 to NA 32a5 (approximately 50 folios). The first $p\bar{a}r\bar{a}jika$ runs from DA 398b4 to 411b3, and contains, according to my classification of the stories, approximately 85 cases.³¹ Characteristic of most but not all³² sections of the *Mūlasarvāstivāda-vinaya*, the '*Dul bar byed pa* is structured around a series of verse summaries (*uddānas* and *piņdoddānas*).

(2): *Sarvāstivāda-vinaya-mātṛkā (Sapoduo-bu pini modelegie 薩婆多 部毘尼摩得勒伽); T. 1441

There has been considerable confusion about the *Modeleqie*. It is usually considered to be a commentary on the Sarvāstivādin "*Vinaya* in Ten Recitations" (*Shisonglü* 十誦律). This view, which can be traced back at least as early as 1276 CE³³ (and I suspect much earlier, perhaps to the

In the Tokugawa-period (1603–1868), Japanese Mūlasarvāstivādin monks such as Myōzui 妙瑞 (1696–1764) studied the *Modeleqie* (and not the *Shisonglā*) alongside the *Mūlasarvāstivāda-vinaya* in their attempts at reviving a Mūlasarvāstivādin ordination tradition in Japan (Clarke 2006, 11). During his itinerant lecture travels, Myōzui read a number of Mūlasarvāstivādin *Vinaya* works and catalogued them, compiling a topical index which he titled *Ubu hyōmoku* 有部標目 in 2 fascicles (Ueda 1939, 14). This text now seems to be lost, but Ueda saw it and reported briefly on its contents, reproducing the 8 colophons compiled by Myōzui after reading 8

³¹ This numbering is somewhat arbitrary and is not found in the texts themselves; it is provided merely for the purposes of classification and comparison. There is ample room for further analysis of each case-law episode and both expansion and amalgamation of some of my classifications.

 $^{^{32}}$ The two sections that lack an *uddāna* system are the *Mātrkā* and the *Kathāvastu*; see Clarke 2015, 79.

³³ In his Un'ushō 雲雨鈔 written in 1276, the Japanese scholar-monk Gyōnen 凝然 (1240-1321) identifies the Modelegie as a commentary on the Shisonglü (摩得勒伽論 十巻釋十誦律 [Dainihon bukkyō zensho 大日本佛教全書, vol. 105: 41a]). It is also mentioned in question 38 of his Risshū kōyō 律宗綱要 (T. 2348 [lxxiv] 16a14: 毘尼母。 磨得勒伽。薩婆多。此三並十誦律; English trans. in Pruden 1995, 113), but this is a much later work (1306 CE).

Vinaya works (Ueda 1939, 15–16). Of these 8 texts, 7 are translations of the *Mūlasarvāstivāda-vinaya* and related commentarial literature, all translated by Yijing; the eighth, however, is the *Modeleqie*. As I suggested previously (Clarke 2006, 11), "the addition of this text [the *Modeleqie*] would at least suggest that Myōzui and the other Japanese Mūlasarvāstivādin monks may have considered it to be Mūlasarvāstivādin, and not Sarvāstivādin."

It should be noted, however, that the *Modeleqie* is not one of the prescribed 12 *Vinaya* texts (173 fascicles; see Clarke 2006, 17n68) in Kūkai's 空海 Shingonshū shogaku kyō-ritsu-ron mokuroku 眞言宗所學經律論目録 [Catalogue of Sūtras, *Vinayas*, and Śāstras to be studied in Shingonshū] written in 823 CE. Eleven of the texts are Mūlasarvāstivādin (根本有部); one is Sarvāstivādin (being T. 1440, *Sapoduo pini piposha* 薩婆多毘尼毘婆沙, a commentary on the Shisonglū). Kūkai famously prescribes no Dharmaguptaka Vinaya texts. It seems, however, that his admonition fell on deaf ears for nigh on a thousand years (Clarke 2006, 17). It is curious that amongst 11 Mūlasarvāstivādin texts, Kūkai includes the Sarvāstivādin *Vinayavibhāşa*, but not the *Modeleqie*. If he had have been aware of the Mūlasarvāstivādin affiliation of the *Modeleqie*, he surely would have included it. But his reason for including the *Vinayavibhāşa* is unclear, especially since he does not include the *Shisonglū* itself.

In the annotated version of the *Vinayasaṃgraha* mentioned in note 13, above, (fasc. 1, p. 8) *benmu*本 (Japanese *honmo*) 本母 "*mātṛkā*" is glossed as follows, citing Gyōnen's *Un'ushō* 雲雨鈔 as the source for the attribution of the *Modeleqie* as a commentary on the *Shisonglū*: 本母謂夕摩得伽論十卷多論九卷毘尼母論八卷並二釈 十誦雲雨鈔出.

Note also the unattributed, brief entry in Ono 1930-1932, vol. 3: 531, under *Konpon ubu matorogya* (*sic*) 根本有部摩得勒伽, clearly identifying it with the *Mūlasarvāstivāda-vinaya*; this entry refers the reader to the more detailed entry under *Sappata-bu bini matokurokka* (*sic*) 薩婆多部毘尼摩得勒伽 (vol. 4: 49) by Izumi Hōkei 泉芳璟, which does not explicitly refer to the *Modeleqie* as a commentary. The entry refers to the sectarian affiliation of the *Modeleqie* only as transmitted by the Sarvāstivādins [有部所傳] in the wider sense, making no mention of the *Vinaya* in Ten Recitations.

Satō, who translated the *Modeleqie* into literary Japanese (a syntactical rearrangement following Japanese word order and grammar) and thus certainly was familiar with the content, states in his introduction that there can be no doubt that the original source for this text is the *Shisonglü* (1936, 72: "本書の本據の典籍 は疑いもなく十誦律である。"). He states further (1936, 69): "本書は薩婆多部と銘

64

記するが如く、十誦律に依って造られたもので、その内容は続いて論ずる如く、他 の律書とは趣きをことにし、律中の戒相を集聚せるもので、十誦律六十二卷〔マ マ〕を餘蘊なく整理し、攝収し、卷末に言ふが如く七千偈に括めて、以つていやし くも律制に關する限りに於いてのあらゆる論題を單的な命題として記すものであ る。"Compare with Kasai Akira's 笠井哲 entry in *Daizōkyō zenkaisetsu daijiten* 大蔵 経全解説大事典(Kamata et al. 1998, p. 389), the first part of which is borrowed without acknowledgement from Izumi; the second part unacknowledged from Satō, even adopting his incorrect counting of 62 fascicles for the *Shisonglū*, the only changes being a modernization of the language: (薩婆多部と銘記するように十誦律 によって作られたもので、〔中略〕十誦律 1435 六十二〔ママ〕巻を余す所なく整理 し、摂取し、〔中略〕。).

Ueda 1976, 177, classifies the *Modeleqie* as a commentary on the *Shisonglū*. Nishimoto 1955, 81, mentions its traditional classification as one of the five *śāstras* 五 論 (of the Four *Vinayas* and Five *Śāstras* 四律五論) and its affiliation with the *Shisonglū*. Whether or not Nishimoto accepts this is unclear, but he does state that the classification of Four *Vinayas* and Five *Śāstras* is now no longer appropriate ("四 律五論なる語は相應せざるを覺ゆ") since modern Buddhist Studies has many more texts available, including Yijing's translations, the Tibetan translation, and the Pāli *Vinaya*.

Other scholars have been somewhat more careful with regard to pronouncements on the *Modeleqie*'s sectarian affiliation, although to my knowledge other than a few recent studies (Clarke 2006, 11-12; Kishino 2008; Hakamaya 2011, 12-13) most scholars have considered it to be a commentary and not a canonical Buddhist *Vinaya* text. Hirakawa, for instance, states that "on the basis of the content, there is no room to doubt that this text is a commentary of Sarvāstivādin lineage" ([1960] 1999-2000, vol. 1: 268: これも説一切有部系の註釈であることは、内容からみて疑問の余地はな い)." Hirakawa is careful not to state that it is a commentary on the "*Vinaya* in Ten Recitations" (*Shisonglü* +誦律). In fact, he states very clearly that the text is not of the same lineage as the *Shisonglü* +誦律 : "すなわち同じ説一切有部の律文献でも、 + 誦律と『薩婆多部毘尼摩得勒伽』とでは系統が異なるのである。" ([1960] 1999-2000, vol. 1: 89; cf. Kishino 2008, 183n1; corrected in Kishino 2013, 35n36). However, Hirakawa certainly does not suggest that the text might be Mūlasarvāstivādin. Funayama 2013, 34, refers to it as a "specialized commentary on the *Vinaya* of the Sarvāstivāda school (薩婆多部の律の専門的注釈書)."

Others, however, even after Hirakawa, have not always been so careful. Tokuda 1974, 3, classifies it under the *Shisonglü* and not under the Mūlasarvāstivāda (page 8: *shin ubu* 新有部 "New Sarvāstivāda"; the *Mūlasarvāstivāda-vinaya* was previously

works of Daoxuan 道宣 [596-667 CE] and his school),³⁴ however, is incorrect on two counts: first, as will be established when the parallels to the canonical *'Dul bar byed pa* are presented, the *Modeleqie* is not a commentary but a canonical *Vinaya* text; second, as will be demonstrated by the remarkable correspondence of said parallels, the text clearly does not belong to the same tradition as the *"Vinaya* in Ten Recitations" (*Shisonglü* 十誦律)³⁵ but rather is closely related to the *Vinaya* traditions of the Mūlasarvāstivādins.

Close parallels between the *Modeleqie* and Guṇaprabha's *Vinayasūtra* and *Autocommentary* have been noted on several occasions in the excellent work by Nakagawa Masanori 中川正法 in the late 1980s to early 1990s. In 2006, in the context of research into other parts of the *Modeleqie*, that is to say, not the parallels to the '*Dul bar byed pa*, I suggested that the *Modeleqie* "may even be an early translation of parts of the *Uttaragrantha*, some three hundred years earlier than Yijing's incomplete translation of the *Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya* corpus."³⁶ On the basis of a study of the *Upāliparipṛcchā* section of the *Modeleqie* and parallels in the Tibetan *Uttaragrantha*(s), Kishino Ryōji 岸野亮示 concluded in 2008 that the *Modeleqie* contains elements close to both the Sarvāstivādin Shisonglü 十誦 律 and the *Mūlasarvāstivāda-vinaya*, thereby suggesting the need to rethink the received affiliation of the *Modeleqie* and the scholarly

referred to generally only as *ubu-ritsu* 有部律 [see, for instance, Ueda 1932, 1, and 2-3 on the two meanings of *ubu-ritsu* 有部律]). Nakamura states that this text "was made upon the 十誦律" (1980, 55n), inferring that the *Modeleqie* is a commentary on the "*Vinaya* in Ten Recitations" (*Shisonglü* 十誦律).

³⁴ Note, however, the Edo-period citation of Gyōnen's $Un'ush\bar{o}$ 雲雨鈔 as the source for this understanding (see note 33, above).

³⁵ This much was recognized by Hirakawa; see the penultimate paragraph of note 33, above.

³⁶ Clarke 2006, 12; note also the discussion on 11-12. See also Clarke 2004, 86n32 and 91n61; 2009b, 128n35.

misunderstanding of it as a commentary.37

66

Below, I will demonstrate that the 'Dul bar byed pa and the corresponding section in the Modeleqie are almost word-for-word identical. Similarities occur not only in wording but also in the order in which the various case-law episodes are presented within each version. By comparing the Tibetan 'Dul bar byed pa and the Modeleqie with the "Vinaya in Ten Recitations" (Shisonglü + 誦律), I will demonstrate that there can be no doubt that the so-called Modeleqie is much closer to the Uttaragrantha of the Mūlasarvāstivāda-vinaya than to the corresponding sections in the Vinaya in Ten Recitations. The fact that this text, translated in 435 CE, is titled *Sarvāstivāda-vinaya-mātṛkā, clearly identifying it as Sarvāstivādin and not Mūlasarvāstivādin, provides important evidence for our understanding of the relationship between the Sarvāstivādin and Mūlasarvāstivādin vinaya traditions in India, and this, of course, throws light on the issue of the much-contested identity of the Mūlasarvāstivādins.³⁸

The *Modeleqie* contains approximately the same number of cases related to the first $p\bar{a}r\bar{a}jika$ as the '*Dul bar byed pa* (83 by my count). The parallel is found in a section confusingly—and perhaps mistakenly—titled *zashi* $\hat{\pi}$ 事 or "miscellaneous recitation."

(3): Shisonglü 十誦律; Vinaya in Ten Recitations; T. 1435

The Vinītaka parallel in the Sarvāstivādin Shisonglü runs from 424b16 to

³⁷ Kishino 2008, 184. That there is some relationship between the *Modeleqie* and the *Uttaragrantha* has also been recognized in Hakamaya 2011, 13.

³⁸ Frauwallner 1956; Tokuoka 1960; Iwamoto 1988; Enomoto 1998; 2000; Yao 2007; Wynne 2008. For an early discussion of the term *mūla* in the *Mūlasarvāstivādavinaya*, see Tamayama 1940, 1–7, and even earlier in the work of Ryūkai (mentioned on Tamayama 1940, 1, although the referent is unclear: "…根本の二字は後世に冠 らせた名であると龍海和上は料簡せられてゐる。"; the source is perhaps Ryūkai's 龍海 [1756-1820] *Daranishū shogaku ubu ritsugi* 陀羅尼宗所學有部律義 [1791] 1793, 29b [fiche number 524]).

445a12³⁹ (or possibly to c6).⁴⁰ This section opens without a title to indicate the beginning of a new section; it begins, rather, with the heading "*Pārājika Dharma*: First Precept" (波羅夷法 初戒) introducing not the section as a whole but the first part of its content.

The number of cases related to $p\bar{a}r\bar{a}jika$ one in the *Shisonglü* parallel is surprisingly few, approximately 38. The *Shisonglü* parallel, then, covers less than half the number of cases dealt with in sources one and two; this itself suggests a considerable distance between the *Shisonglü* and the *Modeleqie*.

(3a): Excursus on the Titles Preserved in the Shisonglü 十誦律

The parallel in the *Shisonglü* is preserved in the tenth of the ten recitations (十誦) (fasc. [*juan* 卷] 56-61), a recitation (*song* 誦) containing primarily

³⁹ The parallels between the *Vinītaka*s embedded in the *Modeleqie* and the *Shisonglü* have been misunderstood in Chung 2002, 97n56.

⁴⁰ On the basis of comparison with most other versions, one would expect this section to end after the rules concerning the fifth sanghāvaséesa (viz, a12); the text from a12 to c6 deals with hypothetical situations in a question-answer format, beginning with an aniyata offence and then a pārājika offence, and then select naihsargika-pāyantikā, pāyantikā, and pratidesanīya offences, thus looking quite out of place here. I tentatively treat 445a12-c6 as an unidentified section; see Clarke 2015, 71-72. But see the note at 442c25 in which we read that the [relevant passages] on the five types of rules—sanghāvaśesa, aniyata, naihsargika-pāyantikā, pāyantikā, and pratideśanīya—have been asked in abbreviated form (略問僧殘不定 捨墮單提悔過此五篇略問), and that those on the *śaiksa* and *adhikaranaśamatha* have not been asked (不問眾學七滅諍也). Whether this note originally was part of the text is unclear; it may be a later annotation. In any case, the use of the verb wen 問 "to ask" here seems to suggest a failure to understand the nature of the Vinitaka section (for it is not an Upālipariprcchā, even if Upāli does occasionally ask questions in this section). Hirakawa [1960] 1999-2000, vol. 2: 252 also notes that the parallel in the Shisonglü contains references to naihsargika-pāyantikās and pāyantikās: "...t だし十誦律では、なおそのあとに捨堕法や波逸提法中の二、三の条文についても、 補足的な説明がなされている。"

Sarvāstivādin counterparts to sections known from the Mūlasarvāstivādin *Uttaragrantha.*⁴¹ The beginning of each fascicle from 56 to 61 records the title of this division variously among different editions as *binisong* 比尼誦 "*Vinaya* Recitation," *biqiusong* 比丘誦 "*Bhikşu* Recitation," and *shansong pini* 善誦毘尼 ("Good Recitation [of the] *Vinaya*" or perhaps "Well-Recited *Vinaya*," possibly suggesting that this division indicates the end of the *Vinaya*).⁴² These division titles are distributed as follows.

Table 3: Distribution of Division Titles *biqiusong* 比丘誦, *shansong* 善誦, and <u>binisong</u> 比尼誦

Titles (Divisions)	T. 1435	juan 卷	song 誦	Sections	Uttaragrantha counterpart?	
biqiusong 比丘誦 & shansong 善誦	410a3	56	10			
shansong 善誦	418c12	57	10	Mātṛkā(410a3-423b9)	Yes	
	418c14	57	10			
binisong 比尼誦	427b20	58	10		Yes	
	438b17	59	10	Vinītaka (424b16-445)		
shansong pini xu 善誦毘尼序 ⁴³	445c10	60	10	First Council (445c8-450a26)	No	
	453b13	61	10	Second Council(450a27-456b8)	No	
shansong pini 善誦毘尼	456b9	—	10	0 Muktaka (456b9-470b19)	Yes	
shansong 善誦	461c1	—	10	Muktaka (45009-470019)	res	

Although a fuller survey of early manuscript evidence for the use of

⁴¹ On the contents of the 10th recitation, see Clarke 2015, 71-72.

⁴² It is important to note that some of these titles have not been included in the main text reproduced in the Taishō edition, and appear only in the apparatus denoting variant readings in other, earlier editions and manuscripts.

⁴³ It is possible that the *shansong pini xu* 善誦毘尼序 ("Good Recitation *Vinaya* Preface"), which seems to have been added by Vimalākşa (see note 58, below), differentiates itself from the *Uttaragrantha* counterparts with the addition of the term *xu* 序 "Preface." If so, it may be important to note that this "Preface" is found in what I consider to be non-*Uttaragrantha* counterparts. In other words, apart from this "preface," all other sections found in the *Shansong* Division are *Uttaragrantha* counterparts. See Hirakawa [1960] 1999–2000, vol. 1: 127–135 on the translation of the *Shisonglü*.

69

these titles is a desideratum, the above table should be enough to establish (1) that the usage of *biqiusong* 比丘誦, *shansong* 善誦 (and variants), and *binisong* 比尼誦 is unsystematic and probably corrupt, and (2) that these titles appear in a division of the *Shisonglü* that contains primarily parallels to the Mūlasarvāstivādin *Uttaragrantha*. A few words on each of these titles will not be out of place.

The title *bigiusong* 比丘誦 ("Bhiksu Recitation") might make sense if it were a title for the *Bhiksu-vibhanga*, but—as indicated in Table 3—this division contains chiefly parallels to Mūlasarvāstivādin Uttaragrantha material. Accordingly, *bigiusong* 比丘誦 makes little sense. It has been suggested that qiu f is a scribal error for ni \mathbb{R} , and that therefore biqiusong 比丘誦 is merely an error for the next term, binisong 比尼誦.44 The term binisong 比尼誦 ("Vinaya Recitation"), however, also makes little sense if we understand it as a transcription-cum-translation of Vinayaadhyāya ("Vinaya Recitation"). Indeed, the whole Vinaya could be termed Vinaya-adhyāya; this, then, is not a meaningful term.45 According to the Gaosengzhuan 高僧傳 (Biography of Eminent Monks), this title was added by Vimalāksa, changing shansong 善誦 to binisong 比尼誦. Of the three Chinese titles under discussion here, the only one that makes any sense is shansong pini 善誦毘尼 ("Good Recitation [of the] Vinaya" or perhaps "Well-Recited Vinaya"). The question, however, is what exactly is meant by this term, and what-if anything-might have been the Sanskrit title underlying it.

Lamotte gives both Kuśalaparivarta⁴⁶ and Kuśalādhyāya⁴⁷ as the

⁴⁴ Hirakawa [1960] 1999-2000, vol. 1: 131, 136n14. Vimalākṣa changed *shansong* 善誦 to *pinisong* 毘尼誦 (syn. *binisong* 比尼誦).

⁴⁵ It is not impossible that *binisong* 比尼誦 is to be understood as a reference to a "*Vinīta* Recitation." I find this improbable, however.

⁴⁶ Lamotte [1944] 1981, 105n2.

⁴⁷ Lamotte [1958] 1988, 168.

Sanskrit title behind Chinese *shansong* 善誦.⁴⁸ Lamotte, however, provides neither evidence nor an argument to justify taking *shan* 善 as *kuśala*, whether it be a *parivarta* or an *adhyāya*. Demiéville seems to understand Chinese *shansong* 善誦 as synonymous for the recitation of the *Tripițaka* at the first council: "Compilation, par les cinq cents *bhikşu*, du *Kuśaladharma* du Tripiţaka (récit du premier concile)."⁴⁹

Two factors make it difficult to conclude that, as it has come down to us, the *shansong* 善誦 is the Sarvāstivādin equivalent to the Mūlasarvāstivādin *Uttaragrantha*. First, the tenth recitation (fasc. 56-61) does not contain all known *Uttaragrantha* counterparts: the *Nidāna*, **Ekottarikā*, *Kathāvastu*, *Upāliparipṛcchā*, and **Mānāvikā* counterparts are found earlier in fasc. 48 to 55, suggesting perhaps that the *shansong* 善誦 might have extended from fasc. 48 to 61. Second, the tenth recitation includes accounts of the councils which are not *Uttaragrantha* sections.⁵⁰ Nevertheless, that the final recitation of the *Shisonglü* is constituted predominantly of sections that are known collectively in the Mūlasarvāstivādin tradition as the *Uttaragrantha* (*gzhung dam pa*) is indisputable.

It is also a fact that there are two Tibetan translations of the *Uttaragrantha*: one complete, one incomplete. Although the titles of both texts are transliterated as *Uttaragrantha* in Tibetan (*Ud ta ra gran tha*), the two texts actually have different Tibetan titles in translation: '*Dul ba gzhung bla ma* and '*Dul ba gzhung dam pa*. While it is clear that *gzhung bla ma* translates <u>Uttara-grantha</u>, Claus Vogel has pointed out that *gzhung dam pa* is more correctly a translation of <u>Uttama-grantha</u>.⁵¹ Since Uttama, which

⁴⁸ Lamotte [1944] 1981, 104, gives *Kuśalavarga* for the *Dazhidulun* 大智度論 passage. Bareau [1955] 2013, 175, gives *kuśalaparivarta*; Yuyama 1979, 1. 15–19. C. 2: *kuśalādhyāya*.

⁴⁹ Demiéville 1951, 243.

⁵⁰ See note 43, above.

⁵¹ Vogel 1985, 110.

means "best," etc., could very easily be translated by Chinese *shan* 善 "good," then *shansong* 善誦 is *perhaps* best understood as a translation of *Uttama-grantha* (or some other variant). Indeed, in terms of content, the *shansong* 善誦 contains primarily *Uttamagrantha/Uttaragrantha* parallels.

Of course, difficulties still remain. As far as I know, Chinese *song* 誦 is not an attested translation of Sanskrit *grantha*. However, it should be noted that *song* 誦 is not the only Chinese term used in this context. In the *Dazhidulun* 大智度論, we find the following enumeration of the contents of a *Vinaya* text, the so-called *Vinaya* in Eighty Divisions (八十部毘尼藏):

二百五十戒義作三部、七法、八法、比丘尼毘尼、增一、憂婆利問、 雜部、<u>善部</u>。如是等八十部作毘尼藏。⁵²

Here, in the *Dazhidulun* 大智度論, we find mention of a *Vinaya* that is structurally very close to the *Shisonglü*, containing a section or division known as *shanbu* 善部 ["Good Division"], which is clearly differentiated from the *vibhangas* (Divisions 1–3, 6; see Table 4, below), *vastus* (4–5), **Ekottarikā* (7), *Upāliparipṛcchā* (8), and *Kşudraka* "Miscellaneous" (9) Division. Leaving aside the question of how best to map the 80 "divisions" on to the 10 "recitations,"⁵³ if we compare the enumeration of the contents of the *Vinaya* in Eighty Divisions with the arrangement of the extant *Vinaya* in Ten Recitations, we see—as laid out in Table 4, below—that they match relatively well,⁵⁴ even if the order of the "divisions" does not match

⁵² T. 1509 (xxv) 69c13-15 (*juan* 2); Lamotte [1944] 1981, 104.

⁵³ See Matsumoto 1922.

⁵⁴ On this point, there seems to be general agreement; see Hirakawa [1960] 1999–2000, vol. 1: 128, and 135n4 (listing scholars starting with Matsumoto Bunzaburō 松本文三郎 [1865–1944]). For an earlier reference, see Ryūkai's 龍海 (1756–1820) *Daranishū shogaku ubu ritsugi* 陀羅尼宗所學有部律義 [1791] 1793, 32– 33; on Ryūkai's text, see Clarke 2006, 20–22, and references therein (note that in Clarke 2006 I give the last character in the title as *gi* 儀, translating it as "decorum" in "[*Mūla-*]*sarvāstivāda Vinaya* decorum to be studied by the Dhāranī School"; this should probably be corrected to *gi* 義 "significance": "Significance of the [*Mūla-*]

exactly with the "recitations."55

Vinaya in Eighty Divisions			Recitations (Shisonglü)
1-3	二百五十戒義作三部	Explanations of 250 Precepts in 3 Divisions	1-3
4	七法	7* vastus	4
5	八法	8* vastus	5
6	比丘尼毘尼	Bhikșuņī-vinaya	7
7	增一	*Ekottarikā	9
8	憂婆利問	Questions of Upāli	8
9	雜部	Miscellaneous Division	6
10	善部	Good Division	10

Table 4: Comparison of the Structure of the *Vinaya* in Eighty Divisions and the *Shisonglü*

Much later in the *Dazhidulun* 大智度論, we are told of a *Vinaya* tradition from Kaśmīr in which the *avadānas* and *jātakas* had been deleted, leaving only the important points in 10 "divisions" *shibu* 十部 (罽賓國毘尼 除却本生、阿波陀那。但取要用作十部).⁵⁶ This *Vinaya* in Ten Divisions (*shibu* 十部) has been traditionally understood as referring to the *Vinaya* in Ten Recitations (*Shisonglü* 十誦律).⁵⁷

It seems, then, that *shansong* 善誦 and *shanbu* 善部 are interchangeable, and they would both appear to refer to what is known in the

sarvāstivāda Vinaya to be studied by the Dhāraņī School"; note, however, that the variant title [*gi* 儀 "decorum"] is commonly found in secondary literature [e. g., Tokuda 1974, 139; Ueda 1976, 328, 330, 332]).

⁵⁵ Perhaps we are to understand titles such as **Ekottarikā* and *Upālipariprcchā* here as representative and not exhaustive titles. Thus, the terms **Ekottarikā* or *Upālipariprcchā* here may be intended to include other smaller *Uttaragrantha* sections/texts.

⁵⁶ T. 1509 (xxv) 756c3. Frauwallner 1956, 26-27.

⁵⁷ See Lamotte [1958] 1988, 174; Frauwallner 1956, 27. Both Lamotte and Frauwallner agree that the *Vinaya* from Kaśmīr is to be identified with the *Shisonglü*. Lamotte and Frauwallner disagree on their identification of the *Mūlasarvāstivāda-vinaya*.

73

Mūlasarvāstivāda-vinaya as the *Uttama-grantha (or Uttara-grantha).

In lieu of any other reasonable explanation of what "Good Recitation" might otherwise mean or to what it might refer, I would like to suggest until more manuscript evidence comes to light—that *shansong* 善誦 "Good Recitation" was likely intended as a translation of *Uttamagrantha* (or some other variant). This is certainly plausible given the presence of three *Uttamagrantha/Uttaragrantha* counterparts found in this last recitation.⁵⁸

Now, if *song* 誦 can translate *grantha*, then we may need to reconsider the commonly accepted Sanskrit title of the *Vinaya* in Ten Recitations. Although many Sanskrit fragments from Central Asia have been identified with the so-called *Sarvāstivāda-vinaya* (*Shisonglü* 十 誦 律), we do not actually know what the Sanskrit title of the *Vinaya* preserved in Chinese as *Shisonglü* 十誦律 was, if it even had a title (of course, it may simply have been called "the *Vinaya*"). Nevertheless, scholars have posited a number of Sanskrit titles, including *Daśādhyāya-vinaya*⁵⁹ and *Daśabhāṇavāravinaya*.⁶⁰ But these seem to be reconstructions, even if they are not usually indicated as such. To the best of my knowledge, however, outside of dictionaries (all lacking citations), there is no solid evidence to support any of these reconstructions.

If, however, we accept that song \mathbbm{i} and bu \mathbbm{i} can both translate

⁵⁸ In response to an earlier draft of this article, Kishino 2013, 34n34, raised doubts about the possibility of *shansong* translating *Uttamagrantha*. Here, in this expanded version, I have attempted to deal with his objections (which I myself partly share; see also note 43, above). It is likely that the final fascicles of the *Vinaya* in Ten Recitations, which were rearranged by Vimalākṣa after the death of Kumārajīva and reworked from 58 fascicles (completed on the basis of a manuscript brought by Dharmaruci after the death of *Puṇyatāra) into 61 fascicles, are confused, making any definitive statement impossible.

⁵⁹ Nanjio 1883, 246; Takakusu 1896, 13, 20; Ueda 1933–1934, vol. 5: 1; Ueda 1976, 168; Chung 2002.

⁶⁰ Nakamura 1980, 51; Hirakawa 1982, 7.

Sanskrit *grantha* ("book"), as suggested above in relation to the translation of *shansong* 善誦 as *uttama-grantha*, then it is possible—not certain, but possible—that the Sanskrit title for *Shisonglü* 十誦律 may have been *Daśa-grantha*. Although it cannot be established beyond doubt, this Sanskrit reconstruction, and perhaps it alone, has at least some support.

(4): Sifenlü 四分律; Four-Part Vinaya; T. 1428

The parallel preserved in the Dharmaguptaka Sifenlü 四分律 is found in a section titled tiaobu 調部. To the best of my knowledge, the Sanskrit for this section title is also unattested, but tiaobu 調部 [translated without reference to the underlying Indic: "Section on Taming/Controlling"] could easily translate Sanskrit *Vinita* or *Vinitaka*. Although the Dharmaguptaka parallel seems to be unimportant in terms of the relationship between the Sarvāstivāda-vinaya (Shisonglü) and the Mūlasarvāstivāda-vinaya, it should be noted that Yijing reports in his travel record (南海寄歸内法傳) that the Dharmaguptakas are a branch or sub-branch of the Mūlasarvāstivādins.⁶¹ In that connection, it is interesting to note the number of cases relating to *pārājika* one in the Dharmaguptaka Vinītaka: approximately 87 by my count—the most cases related to *pārājika* one and certainly very close in number to sources one and two. This correspondence may suggest that more attention should be paid to Yijing's statement about the relationship between the Mūlasarvāstivādins and the Dharmaguptakas.62 The Dharmaguptaka parallel continues down to sanghāvaśesa 8.63

⁶¹ Takakusu 1896, 20.

⁶² This statement is not unique to Yijing; it is also found in Vinītadeva's *Samayabhedoparacanacakre nikāyabhedopadeśanasamgraha*; for convenience, see Tsukamoto [1966] 1980, 428-429.

⁶³ Hirakawa [1960] 1999-2000, vol. 2: 252.

(5): Wufenlü 五分律; Five-Part Vinaya; T. 1421

The parallel preserved in the Mahīśāsaka *Wufenlü* 五分律 is found in a section known in Chinese as *tiaofufa* 調伏法 ("Rules [dharma?] on Regulating/Disciplining), a term which most likely translates a form of Sanskrit *Vinīta* or *Vinītaka*. There are remarkably few case histories in this section: approximately 26 for *pārājika* one.

(6): Pāli Vinaya

The Pāli *Vinaya* preserves, by my count, approximately 54 case histories for the first *pārājika* in the *Vinītavatthu* section embedded within the *Vibhaṅga*. In terms of the historical development of *Vinaya* literature, it is interesting to note that the Pāli parallels to the '*Dul bar byed pa* are not found in a single section as they are in all other Sthavira *Vinaya*s. Rather, they are dispersed throughout the *Suttavibhaṅga*. As is the case in most other Sthavira *Vinaya*s, the parallels run from *pārājika* one through four, and *saṅghāvaśeṣa* one through five, that is to say, the first nine rules in the *Bhikṣu-vibhaṅga*. Whereas in sources one through five, however, these case histories appear in a single, separate section, entirely distinct from the *Vibhaṅga*, in the *Vibhaṅga* of the Pāli *Vinaya* each of these nine rules concludes with its own case histories in individual sections known as the *Vinītavatthus*.

In the *Vinītaka*s, then, we have a clear case where the Pāli *Vinaya* is structurally the odd one out.⁶⁴ Although there is no doubt that this caselaw fits perfectly well inserted under each relevant rule in the *Vibhanga*, if we accept that the Pāli tradition preserves the original structure, then we would be at odds to explain how it is that four out of five Sthavira *Vinaya* traditions (and the *Modeleqie*) preserve their case-law in a separate

 $^{^{64}}$ For another case in which the Pāli is the odd one out, see Clarke 2009a on the *pārājika* penitent or *śikṣādattaka*, a monastic status recognised by all but the Pāli *Vinaya*.

section distinct from the *Vibhanga*. This agreement can hardly be a coincidence. Which format is older, however, is not entirely clear.

Petra Kieffer-Pülz has briefly discussed the Pāli *Vinītavatthus*, noting that "These are collections of exemplary cases meant to give guidance to later law specialists.⁶⁵ In my impression these sections comprise all cases collected up to the date of the redactional closing of the Vinayapiṭaka."⁶⁶ If, as Kieffer-Pülz has suggested, the *Vinītavatthus* (and by extension all extant *Vinītakas*) are compilations of case-law precedents intended for use by practicing monastic lawyers, then even despite their differences, both formats—the Pāli *Vinaya*'s embedded precedents and the other Sthavira *Vinayas*' separate section on precedents—strike me as useful for use by a lawyer. Neither format necessarily seems to be indicative of a tradition older than the other. The fact that the Pāli *Vinaya* differs from all other extant Sthavira *Vinayas*, however, will require some explanation.

(7): Mohesengqilü 摩訶僧祇律 Mahāsāṅghika-vinaya; T. 1425

The Mahāsāṅghika-vinaya parallel is called in Chinese bini duandangshi 比 尼斷當事 and pinifa 毘尼法. The Sanskrit text of the Mahāsāṅghika-vinaya has not come down to us, but the Sanskrit manuscript of the Mahāsāṅghika-Lokottaravādin Bhikṣuṇī Vinaya contains a verse summary or uddāna in which we see that bini duandangshi 比尼斷當事 is a translation of Sanskrit vinītāni.⁶⁷

⁶⁵ Here paraphrasing von Hinüber 1996, § 22.

⁶⁶ Kieffer-Pülz 2012, 4. For other studies utilizing the Pāli *vinītavatthus*, see Huxley 1999 and Pandita 2012.

⁶⁷ Shimoda 1993, 282, citing Roth 1970, 330, suggests that the Sanskrit underlying *bini duandangshi* 比尼斷當事 is *akarmāṇi vinītāni*; this is only partly correct. The term *akarmāṇi* refers to the unrelated section given earlier at T. 1425 464c7-14 (on 非羯磨). That this section is unrelated is suggested by Sasaki Shizuka (1994, 64-65), who considers the *akarmāṇi* section to be an "accidental insertion."

The parallels in the *Mahāsānghika-vinaya* are complicated for a number of reasons. First, the various case-law incidents are not organized in any readily discernible order. Whereas sources one through five record numerous incidents of case-law arranged in the order of *prātimokṣa* rules, from *pārājika* one down to approximately *saṅghāvaśeṣa* five, in the *Mahāsānghika-vinaya* we find the case-law collected in one section, but seemingly in no discernible order.

There are approximately 35 case-law incidents recorded in this section of the *Mahāsānghika-vinaya*, but, according to Hirakawa, only eight of these relate to *pārājika* one: numbers 1, 4, 5, 6, 17, 25, 28, and 29—clearly, not in any systematic order.⁶⁸ Each case ends with the statement "Thus the *Vini*[*ta*] is complete" (如是毘尼竟).⁶⁹

The importance of this section of the *Mahāsānghika-vinaya* appears to have been overlooked. Erich Frauwallner states "Under the title *Feichieh-mo* (false procedure)⁷⁰ a great group of the most various tales is gathered together (pp. 464 c 7–470 c 20)."⁷¹ Sasaki Shizuka 佐々木閑 refers to this section as containing "various kinds of small rules for the order" and thus clearly also fails to recognize the importance of the *Vinītaka* section.⁷² Sasaki does, however, make the important observation that incidents 19 onwards refer to events after the Buddha's *nirvāṇa.*⁷³ Sasaki mentions this

⁶⁸ See Hirakawa [1960] 1999-2000, vol. 2: 249-250 for the numbering. The same numbering is followed by Sasaki Shizuka 1992, 9-12, numbered 1-35; 1994, 65-67; 2000, 135-137; note, however, that number 18 is further subdivided into 3, thus yielding 37 incidents. See also note 69, below.

⁶⁹ The statement "Thus the *Vini*[*ta*] is complete" [如是毘尼竟] appears 36 times but only in the *Vinitaka* section of the *Mahāsānghika-vinaya*.

⁷⁰ See note 67, above.

⁷¹ Frauwallner 1956, 206.

⁷² Sasaki Shizuka 1994, 65. See also Sasaki Shizuka 1992, 9: "種々の規定." Sasaki Shizuka 1994, 65-67 translates *pini* 毘尼 as "Vinaya rules," but I suspect that here it translates *Vinitaka*.

only in passing, without further elaboration. The evidence for this is the statement introducing the setting in the 19th incident in which we read "After the World-Honored One [had entered/attained] *nirvāṇa*, elder monk(s) dwelled in Vaišālī" (世尊涅槃後長老比丘毘舍離住).⁷⁴ It is interesting to note that after this statement, the adjudicator of monks' actions in this section is no longer the Buddha, but the elder monk(s) (長老比丘).⁷⁵ This transition may indicate, possibly, that the order of case histories recorded in the *Mahāsāṅghika-vinaya* is chronological, and this observation in turn may have important implications for the dating of the redactional closing of this and other *Vinaya*s.

Conclusion to Section 2

On the basis of the information from the aforementioned seven sources, we can now say with some confidence that the Sanskrit word underlying Tibetan 'Dul bar byed pa is Vinītaka. This word or some variant of it is given both in Pāli (Vinītavatthu) and Sanskrit (Vinīta: Mahāsānghika-Lokottaravādin) in connection with this very section of the Vinayas. Moreover, it is highly probable that the Sanskrit term underlying both the Dharmaguptaka and Mahīśāsaka terms—tiaobu 調部 and tiaofufa 調伏法—was also Vinīta or Vinītaka. The evidence marshalled here further suggests, if not confirms, that the Chinese term binidejia 比尼得迦 in the introductory verses to Viśeṣamitra's Vinayasamgraha is a transcription of

⁷³ Sasaki Shizuka 1992, 9, 10.

⁷⁴ T. 1425 (xxii) 468a29-b1.

⁷⁵ Similar statements situating events after the Buddha's *nirvāņa* are found at: T. 1425 (xxii) 468c5-6; 470a24; 470b6. The Buddha is said to be dwelling in Śrāvastī in the 21st and 22nd incidents (468b16; 468b28), but this is clearly a misprint; it is included in the Taishō edition, but according to the footnotes therein not included in the "Three Editions" or the "Old Sung Edition."

Sanskrit Vinītaka.

Given that the term *Vinīta* seems to translate a section of the *Vinayas* in which case-law is discussed, I suggest that this term is perhaps best translated as something like "adjudicated." As the name of a section, we might call it the section on "adjudications." This translation would seem to fit not only the Sanskrit and Tibetan but also the Chinese terms *duandangshi* 斷當事, *tiaobu* 調部, and *tiaofufa* 調伏法.

Identification of the Vinitaka sections in all extant Vinayas may also allow us to make some observations about the redactional history of the versions of the Mūlasarvāstivāda-vinaya preserved in Chinese and Tibetan translations. It is still sometimes assumed that since Yijing's translation of the Mūlasarvāstivāda-vinaya dates to the beginning of the eighth century and the Tibetan translation a century or so later, that the Mūlasarvāstivāda-vinaya reflects a later stage of development than the Vinayas preserved in Chinese and translated at the beginning of the fifth century. Such a view, however, is hardly possible if the case-law preserved in the Tibetan 'Dul bar byed pa (source 1) matches almost identically with that preserved in the *Modelegie* (source 2), a text which is said to have been translated in 435 CE, around the same time that the other Vinayas were translated into Chinese. Rather, this correspondence would seem to suggest that we must accept the first half of the fifth century CE as a terminus ante quem for the redactional closing of at least the case-law sections of all Vinayas preserved in Chinese and, I would now add, Tibetan. Of course, the actual date of the redactional closing is likely to be much earlier, perhaps several centuries earlier. Indeed, untangling Lamotte's convoluted observations, Gregory Schopen generally dates the Mūlasarvāstivāda-vinaya to the first few centuries of the Common Era.⁷⁶

⁷⁶ Schopen [1999] 2005, 76. Kieffer-Pülz 2014, 52–53, briefly argues for a later date, *viz.*, fourth-fifth century CE.

Section 3: Gunaprabha's Sources

80

The first modern scholar to point out the close similarities between the *Modeleqie* and Guṇaprabha's corpus of Mūlasarvāstivādin *Vinaya* commentaries is perhaps Nakagawa Masanori. Continuing the work of Bapat and Gokhale in publishing the Sanskrit text of Guṇaprabha's *Autocommentary*, Nakagawa studied the parallels to the '*Dul bar byed pa* preserved in Chinese and Pāli, but not the '*Dul bar byed pa* itself, which, buried in the recesses of the *Uttaragrantha*, has received almost no scholarly attention. It is understandable, therefore, that Nakagawa would not have known of the existence of the '*Dul bar byed pa* as an *Uttaragrantha* section. Since Guṇaprabha often quotes the '*Dul bar byed pa*, however, an early recognition of the fact that this is an extant section of the *Uttaragrantha* preserved in Tibetan translation would certainly have aided Nakagawa's publication of the Sanskrit text of Guṇaprabha's *Autocommentary*. Of course, there is still much to publish: to date, the text of only the first two pārājikas has appeared, the second still being incomplete.⁷⁷

Guṇaprabha divides his digest of each *Prātimokṣa* rule for monks generally into four distinct sections. As noted by Nakagawa, these sections are *Vibhaṅgaḥ*, *Kṣudrakagatam*, *Pṛcchā*, and *Vinītakāni*.⁷⁸ Not all *Prātimokṣa* rules receive commentarial attention under these four sections. In regard to *Prātimokṣa* rules without headings to indicate classification

⁷⁷ For the text of *pārājika* 1, see Nakagawa 1987a (*sūtras* 1-8 with English translation); 1991b (*sūtras* 9-88). For *pārājika* 2, see Nakagawa 1996 (*sūtras* 89-109); 2000a (*sūtras* 109-110); 2000b (*sūtras* 120-123) with corrections in Nakagawa 2002, 240 (*sūtras* 122-123).

⁷⁸ Nakagawa 1991a, 333; 1991b, 251. In the case of *pārājika* one, before the fourfold classification there is a section that deals with the ritual for disrobing (*pratyākhyāna-vidhih*); see Nakagawa 1987a.

81

under the above four sections, I assume that the content of Gunaprabha's digest derives directly from the *Vibhanga* and perhaps even the wording of the rule itself. In the case of $p\bar{a}r\bar{a}jika$ one, I assume that in the first of these sections (*Vibhangah*) Gunaprabha digests (*sūtras* 9-21)⁷⁹ the relevant discussions from the *Vibhanga*, although this has yet to be fully demonstrated.

The second section (*Kşudrakagatam*) seems to contain digested passages from the *Kşudrakavastu*, although to my knowledge this too has never been adequately demonstrated. It is improbable that Guṇaprabha would refer to miscellaneous sections in the abstract. Accordingly, I think it most probable that this section refers to the *Kşudrakavastu*. The following fact may also support this hypothesis.

In the case of $p\bar{a}r\bar{a}jika$ one, the Kşudrakagatam section in Guṇaprabha's Vinayasūtra (sūtras 22-31) deals primarily (sūtras no. 24-31)⁸⁰ with the vasti (Tib. 'dzag snod), a type of leather covering worn by monks to prevent ejaculations or at least contain any spillage. This "emission pouch" is mentioned by Formigatti in his translation of the story of Nanda from the Kşudrakavastu.⁸¹ There, the Buddha's half-brother, Nanda, ejaculates on the head of Viśākhā when she touches his feet in homage; the Buddha magically transforms the emission into olibanum (Frankincense) oil.⁸² The relative rarity of mentions of the vasti in Vinaya literature, coupled with the fact that it is mentioned in the Kşudrakavastu and discussed by Guṇaprabha under his "kşudraka" section, further

⁷⁹ I follow the *sūtra* numbering assigned by Nakagawa; this varies slightly from Sankrityayana 1981, 13–15, and also from the numbering used by Taishō University's Vinayasūtra's Pravrajyāvastu Study Group's "The Digital Data of Preliminary Transliteration of the Vinayasūtra" (available at: http://www.tais.ac.jp/wp/wpcontent/uploads/2015/07/vinayasutra_trlt.pdf).

⁸⁰ Nakagawa 1987b, 81–82; 1991b, 256–257.

⁸¹ Formigatti 2009, 143.

⁸² Formigatti 2009, 141.

suggests the high probability that Gunaprabha's "ksudraka" refers to the Ksudrakavastu.

Likewise, the *Prcchā* section of *pārājika* one (*sūtras* 32–51) most probably refers to the *Upālipariprcchā*, but this too has not been established. Since there are two *Upālipariprcchās* preserved in Tibetan (one in the incomplete Kaśmīri *Uttaragrantha*, one in the complete *Uttaragrantha*), however, a comparison of Guṇaprabha's quotations and paraphrases from the *Prcchā* with the extant *Upālipariprcchās* may make for an interesting study.

As for the 'Dul bar byed pa, Nakagawa notes in his study of the Vinītakāni section for pārājika one (sūtras 52–88) that he is able to trace 28 of Guṇaprabha's sūtras to the Modeleqie, and that the identification of these sources suggests the profound relationship between these two texts.⁸³ Below, in four select examples, I will compare Guṇaprabha's text with the sources from the Modeleqie noted by Nakagawa and the overlooked 'Dul bar byed pa. My goal is to refine Nakagawa's initial observations on Guṇaprabha's quotations in light of a relatively comprehensive study of all extant sources for the Vinītakāni. I wish to ascertain whether Guṇaprabha's source may be identified with (1) the Vinītakāni parallel preserved in the Modeleqie, (2) that found in the 'Dul bar byed pa, or (3) something else entirely.

Nakagawa states that "In the commentary, Gunaprabha sometimes

⁸³ Nakagawa 1991a, 345: "Vinītakāni 節の三十七偈の中, 実に二十五の偈について, 何らかの手掛りを『摩得勒伽』に求めることができたことも, 両者の関連の深さを 示していよう。" As noted in Nakagawa's unnumbered (asterisked: ※) note on p. 347, 3 further sources were identified in a later paper (see Nakagawa 1991c, 43-45 on *sūtra*s 76-78 and 82-85). Nakagawa 1998, 171: "Especially in the Sarvāstivādavinayamātṛkā, I can find hints to understand the meaning of the 25 *sūtra*s in the Vinītakāni section." I include these three further identifications in my attribution of 28 identifications to Nakagawa.

83

quoted the phrases and the base of the judgement toward a (*sic*) offence etc. from some text. Mostly we can't discover the name of the original text, for he just said 'iti atra granthaḥ' or 'grantho'tra'."⁸⁴ Nakagawa is correct insofar as Guṇaprabha does not necessarily cite his source. Rather, Guṇaprabha simply states that he is quoting from the canonical text, the *grantha*, in what Nakagawa takes to be a vague manner. In the section under discussion, however, Guṇaprabha has already identified his source as the *Vinītakāni* in the section heading, and thus no further elaboration should be required or even expected. The following examples should confirm this.

Take for instance *sūtra* number 64 from Guṇaprabha's *Vinayasūtra*. I give the text as presented by Nakagawa, and include the Tibetan for reference:

dārudantaśailavastramayadhītikopakrāntāv indriyamātrasya ced avanāmah || 64

shing dang ba so dang rdo ba dang gos las bu mo'i gzugs byas pa la rtsol ba na gal te dbang po tsam dod na'o ||⁸⁵

As Nakagawa himself states, it is not entirely clear how best to understand the latter half of the $s\bar{u}tra$. The Sanskrit text itself may be corrupt, although the reading *avanāmaḥ* is also reported in manuscripts of the *Vinayasūtra* itself. To be sure, it is not easy to see how Sanskrit *avanāmaḥ* fits the context or how it would be rendered by the Tibetan. Nevertheless, Nakagawa courageously offers the following Japanese translation:

木・象牙・石・布よりできた(女)像に行婬をなした時、もし根が不 起の場合は(sthūlaの罪である)。⁸⁶

⁸⁴ Nakagawa 1998, 172.

⁸⁵ For Guņaprabha's *Vinayasūtra*, see Peking, *bstan 'gyur, 'Dul ba'i 'grel pa* (vol. 123) ZU 16a1.

⁸⁶ Nakagawa 1991a, 337.

84

The context, however, is relatively clear from the parallels in Chinese and in Pāli, as noted by Nakagawa. At issue is what happens in a monk's sexually approaching (*upakrāntau*) a figurine (*dhītikā*) of a woman made (*maya*) out of wood, ivory, stone, or cloth (*dāru*, *danta*, *śaila*, and *vastra*), and—although this is much less clear—if the figurine's female organ does not open, following the interpretation of the *Modeleqie* (not, I think, if the monk's organ does not function, as Nakagawa's translation [不起] seems to suggest). In the case preceding this in the *Vinītaka*, a monk had attempted to have sex with a beautiful, wooden figurine, but felt remorse when its vagina opened. Dharmamitra's commentary to the *Vinayasūtra* seems to suggest that a malevolent being ('*dre*) may have inhabited the figurine and "made room" (*skabs yod par byed la; avakāśaṃ dattaṃ*) for the monk.⁸⁷ Similar comments are also made by Prajāākāra in his *Vinayasūtra*.

In line 2 of the verso we see what is likely the source of $s\bar{u}tra$ 65 in Guṇaprabha's *Vinayasūtra* (*sarvāņģeşu sparšadāne maulam* ||). For the identification of SHT (V) 1063 as from the *Modeleqie*, see Chung 2002, 93 (also reported in Wille 2004, 409). The identification of SHT (V) 1063 with both the *Modeleqie* (Chung) and the '*Dul bar byed pa* (Clarke 2014, 228n58) is problematic insofar as both texts contain too much text between the secure identification of recto line 2 and the equally secure recto line 3. It is possible either that the scribe left out some text (found in both the *Modeleqie* and the '*Dul bar byed pa*) or that SHT (V) 1063 must be identified with an unknown Vinītaka; it cannot be identified with the *Shisonglü* parallel.

⁸⁸ For Prajñākāra's Vinayasūtravyākhyāna, see Peking, bstan 'gyur, 'Dul ba'i 'grel pa (vol. 126) SHU [ŚU] 51a8-b1.

⁸⁹ For the Vinayasūtravrtti, see Peking, bstan 'gyur, 'Dul ba'i 'grel pa (vol. 126) SU

⁸⁷ For Dharmamitra's *Vinayasūtraţīkā*, see Peking, *bstan 'gyur, 'Dul ba'i 'grel pa* (vol. 125) RU 117a4-5: *gal te nang na gnas pa'i 'dre la sogs pa'i mo'i dbang po tsam dod cing skabs yod cing* (read *par?*) *byed la / der zag byed bcug na yang sbom po ste /*; cf. *avakāśam dattam* in line 1 of SHT (V) 1063A = Verso (Sander and Waldschmidt 1985):

^{1 /// + ..} śe avakāśam dattam tasya +++ ///

^{2 /// ..} sparśan dadāti āpa[d]ya[te] pārā .. //

85

compare the *Modeleqie*'s version of this incident with that from the '*Dul bar* byed pa. I have underlined the corresponding text in Sanskrit, Tibetan, and Chinese (with a solid underline indicating correspondence, and a dotted underline indicating potential discrepancies or problems). Our goal here is not to resolve all of the problems associated with the texts, but rather only to confirm the source of Gunaprabha's *sūtras*.

⁶⁰a4-5: nang na 'dre gdon gnas pas mo mtshan nyi tshe bud med kyi dang 'dra bar gyur pa zhig la spyad na sbom por 'gyur /.

Example One: Vinītaka [44]90

Gunaprabha's source: 'Dul bar byed pa or Modelegie?

<i>Vinayasūtra</i> (Nakagawa 1991a, 336– 337; 1991b, 268)	'Dul bar byed pa (sTog DA 404b6-405a2)	<i>Modeleqie</i> (T. 1441 584a1-5)
	dge slong zhig gis shing gi gzugs brnyan byas pa gzugs legs pa blta na sdug pa mdzes pa zhig mthong ste de mthong ba dang 'dod ba'i chos skyes nas des de nyid du gzhug snyam ste rma khar btsugs pa dang des kyang phye nas dge slong de 'gyod pa skyes pa dang	有比丘見木女像端正可愛。 生貪著心。即捉彼女根欲 作姪。女根即開。尋生怖 畏疑悔。
sarvāṅgeṣu sparśadāne maulam∥ VS 65	bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa de ste <u>yan lag</u> thams cad du reg par byas na phas pham par 'gyur ro ⁹¹	乃至佛言。 <u>若舉身受樂</u> 。 <u>犯波羅夷</u> 。
dārudantaśailavastra- mayadhītikopakrāntāv in- driyamātrasya ced avanā- mah VS 64	'on te mo mtshan sprad pa tsam gyis ni nyes pa sbom por 'gyur ro ji ltar shing las byas pa de bzhin du ba so las byas pa dang rdo las byas pa dang gos las byas pa rnams kyang de bzhin no	<u>若女根</u> 不開。犯偷羅遮。 膠漆如 <u>大女</u> 、金、銀、七 寶、 <u>石</u> 女、膠漆 <u>布女</u> 。乃 至泥土女亦如是。

86

 $^{^{90}}$ The numbers in brackets refer to the classification of stories in the concordance and synoptic edition (Appendices 1 and 2); see page 97 for further details.

⁹¹ See note 87, above.

87

All *Vinaya*s except the *Shisonglü* discuss in their parallels to the '*Dul* bar byed pa figurines made out of various materials that are not to be approached sexually. The *Modeleqie* lists figurines made from resin, wood, gold, silver, seven precious jewels, stone, resin-cloth, down to clay (膠漆如 木女、金、銀、七寶、石女、膠漆布女。乃至泥土女). This list is very close to that by Guṇaprabha, although he includes ivory, which is missing from the *Modeleqie*. Guṇaprabha, moreover, does not include gold, silver, or the seven precious jewels. Here, however, the '*Dul bar byed pa* lists exactly what we have already seen in Guṇaprabha's *Vinayasūtra*: wood, ivory, stone, and cloth, and all in exactly the same order. In other words, at least in this instance, there can be no doubt that Guṇaprabha's source is not the *Modeleqie* but clearly the '*Dul bar byed pa* (or some otherwise lost, identical text).

The next sūtra in Gunaprabha's Vinayasūtra reads:

sarvāngesu sparšadāne maulam || 65

yan lag thams cad du reg þa ster na dngos gzhi'o $\|^{92}$

Nakagawa translates this as:

(木等で作られた女像に行婬をなす時,) すべての節に対して触れ た場合は,根本罪(即ち波羅夷)となる。⁹³

Nakagawa states that the situation to which Guṇaprabha refers is unclear.⁹⁴ Not able to provide an exact parallel from the *Modeleqie*, Nakagawa finds a parallel in the *Vinayasaṃgraha*. Although industrious, there is no need to look to the *Vinayasaṃgraha* since the source for this *sūtra* is already provided by the '*Dul bar byed pa* (as suggested also by its classification under this section). Again, following Dharmamitra's commentary, it seems that it is a *pārājika* offence if the monk makes full-body sexual

⁹² For Gunaprabha's Vinayasūtra, see Peking, bstan 'gyur, 'Dul ba'i 'grel pa (vol. 123) ZU 16a1.

⁹³ Nakagawa 1991a, 337.

⁹⁴ Nakagawa 1991a, 337: "これは,状況がはっきりしない."

contact (sarvangesu sparsadane)—however we understand this—with the malevolent being ('dre) inhabiting the figurine.⁹⁵ Although I do not fully understand the exact nature of the offence, it may be important to note that both the 'Dul bar byed pa and the Modelegie clearly distinguish between a $p\bar{a}r\bar{a}jika$ offence in the case of full-body sexual contact and a lesser offence involving only the figurine's inaccessible or uncooperative female sexual organ. As is clear from Example One above, then, *sūtra* number 65 is a very close paraphrase of the canonical text provided by both the 'Dul bar byed pa and the Modelegie. The only difference between the 'Dul bar byed pa and Gunaprabha's rephrasing, then, is that Gunaprabha, ever economical with words, has changed *pārājika* to *maulam*. At least by the time of the commentarial tradition subsequent to Gunaprabha, then, these passages seem to have been understood not as discussions of the use of "sex dolls" per se, but as rules pertaining to sex with non-human, malevolent spirits inhabiting such figurines. This understanding is perhaps influenced by the arrangement of this grouping of rules [44–45] directly before case histories involving sex with a [46] Nāga maiden, [47] Yaksa maiden, [48a] Apsaras maiden, [48b] Gandharva maiden, [48c] Asura maiden, [49ab] Preta maiden, [50] non-human maiden, and [51] Piśāca maiden.

A further example will serve to illustrate that the source of Gunaprabha's *Vinayasūtra* is not the *Modeleqie* but, in this case too, rather the '*Dul bar byed pa* (or an otherwise identical text). *Sūtra* number 75 concerns the three passages (*trayo mārgāh*) by which a monk may engage in sexual connection. We might translate these somewhat loosely as "anal,

⁹⁵ For Dharmamitra's Vinayasūtraţīkā, see Peking, bstan 'gyur, 'Dul ba'i 'grel pa (vol. 125) RU 117a6-7. For Prajñākāra's Vinayasūtravyākhyāna, see Peking, bstan 'gyur, 'Dul ba'i 'grel pa (vol. 126) SHU [ŚU] 51b1-2: yan lag thams cad kyis sbyor bar byed na rtsa ba'o zhes pa ni / gal te mi ma yin pa lta bus yan lag thams cad kyis bkud cing sbyar na rtsa bar 'gyur ba'o //. For Gunaprabha's Autocommentary, see Peking, bstan 'gyur, 'Dul ba'i 'grel pa (vol. 124) 'U [HU] 76a1.

89

vaginal, and oral" (*uccāramārgaḥ prasrāvamārgo mukhamārgaḥ*). As is clear from the *Autocommentary*, a monk commits a *pārājika* offence if he performs a sexual act with the notion that that which *is* one of the three passages *is not* one of the three passages (*mārge amārgasamjňā āpadyate pārājikām*), or if he was in doubt whether what turned out to be one of the three passages was one (*mārge vaimatika āpadyate pārājikām*). However, a lesser offence, a *sthūlātyaya*, is incurred if the monk performs a sexual act with the notion that that which *is not* one of the three passages (*amārge mārgasamjňā āpadyate sthūlātyayām*), or if he was in doubt whether what turned out not to be one is one of the three passages (*amārge vaimatika āpadyate sthū*[*lā*]*tyayām*).⁹⁶

As already noted by Nakagawa in his analysis of the Chinese parallels, the *Modeleqie* lacks the discussion about doubt (*vaimatika*; 疑).⁹⁷ As is clear from Example Two below, however, the two cases concerning doubt are found in the '*Dul bar byed pa*. Here, then, we have another clear case in which Guṇaprabha's source is not the *Modeleqie*, but, unquestionably the '*Dul bar byed pa* (or an identical text).

⁹⁶ In this case, we also have a fragment in the Private Collection, Virginia (F20. 9B). Unlike the Turfan fragment mentioned above (note 87), however, this fragment is undoubtedly closer to the Tibetan than to the Chinese. See Appendix 2, pp. 116–124, notes 1–9, wherein I provide my identification of the text, based on an initial transliteration by Dr. Klaus Wille, with new readings on the basis of the identified Tibetan parallel.

⁹⁷ Nakagawa 1991a, 340-341.

Example Two: *Vinītakas* [10c-10h] Guņaprabha's source: *'Dul bar byed pa* or *Modeleqie*?

(Correspondence indicated by alignment.)

<i>Autocommentary</i> (Nakagawa 1991a, 340; 1991b, 271)	'Dul bar byed pa (sTog DA 400b1-2)	<i>Modeleqie</i> (T. 1441 582c22-24)
19910, 271)		佛言。道作道想。犯波羅 夷。
grantho'tra:		
mārge amārgasamjñā āpadyate pārājikām	lam la lam ma yin par 'du shes na phas pham par 'gyur ro	道作非道想。波羅夷。
mārge vaimatika āpady- ate pārājikām	lam la the tsom par 'du shes na 'ang phas pham par 'gyur ro∥	
amārge mārgasamjītā āpadyate sthūlātyayām	lam ma yin pa la lam du 'du shes na∣nyes pa sbom por 'gyur ro∥	非道道想。偷羅遮。
amārge vaimatika āpady- ate sthū[lā]tyayām	lam ma yin pa la the tsom par 'du shes na∣nyes pa sbom por 'gyur ro∥	
trayo mārgāḥ uccāra- mārgaḥ prasrāvamārgo mukhamārga iti <i>VSA</i> 75	lam gsum la bshang ba'i lam dang gci ba'i lam dang kha'i lam mo	三道謂大便道、小便道、 口道。

Lest I give the impression that Gunaprabha's sources invariably can be traced back to the 'Dul bar byed pa over the Modeleqie, a counterexample will confirm the problems that await anyone attempting to claim that Gunaprabha utilized the same version of the 'Dul bar byed pa as has been handed down to us in Tibetan translation. In his Autocommentary to sūtra number 56, Gunaprabha quotes from the canonical source (atrāpi granthaḥ) an incident concerning an evil, forest-dweller (pāpāranyena; presumably a monk given the masculine declension) who propositions a

90

newly ordained monk with no seniority (*avārsikah*), suggesting that if they were to have sex there would be no offence since the junior monk had only just been ordained (tvam aciropasampannah abrahmacarya[m] karisyāma iti anāpattih).98 In Gunaprabha's Autocommentary, this story follows almost immediately after a case involving another (or perhaps the same) evil, forest-dweller who propositioned a *śiksamānā*, suggesting that there would be no offence if they were to have sex since she is not ordained (pāpāranyakena śiksamānā upalāpitā tvam anupasampannā abrahmacarya[m] karisyāmah anāpattir bhavisyati).99 The incident involving the seduction of the newly ordained monk is found in more-or-less identical versions in both the 'Dul bar byed pa and the Modelegie. The chief difference between these versions, however, is the fact that the incident recorded in the 'Dul bar byed pa involves not an evil, forest-dwelling bhiksu (惡阿練若比丘) as found in the *Modelegie* and, it would seem, in Gunaprabha's Autocommentary, but-unless there is another way to account for the feminine suffix—an evil, forest-dwelling nun (dgon pa'i sdig can mas). In other words, at least in this case, it would be difficult to argue that the 'Dul bar byed pa and not the Modelegie was Gunaprabha's source. Here, then, we seem to have our first indication that Gunaprabha may have known a Vinītaka that differed, albeit very slightly, from both the 'Dul bar byed pa and the Modelegie.

⁹⁸ Sanskrit text from Nakagawa 1991b, 266, with slight modification.

⁹⁹ Sanskrit text from Nakagawa 1991b, 265–266, with slight modification.

Example Three: *Vinītaka* [42a/b]

Gunaprabha's source: 'Dul bar byed pa or Modelegie?

(Underline indicates differences.)

<i>Autocommentary</i> (Nakagawa 1991b, 266)	<i>'Dul bar byed pa</i> (sTog DA 404b2-4)	<i>Modeleqie</i> (T. 1441 583c24-27)
	(sTog DA 404b2-4) <u>dgon pa'i sdig can mas</u> lor ma lon pa la khyod bsnyen par rdzogs nas ring por ma lon gyi mi tshangs par spyad kyang bdag cag la nyes par mi 'gyur ro zhes smras nas des kyang de la khas blangs te des khas blangs nas slar 'gyod pa skyes pa dang des de la ma dad bzhin du byas nas dge slong de 'di snyam du bdag la phas pham pa'i nyes pa ma byung grang snyam ste 'gyod pa skyes pa dang bcom ldan 'das kyis bka'	-
	stsal pa dga' bar ma tshor ba la ni phas pham pa'i nyes pa med de nyes pa sbom por 'gyur ro	

To complicate the picture further, let us examine one last example (Example Four). The various *Vinītakas* discuss the case of a monk who, on his alms round, squeezes past a woman in a narrow doorway. Certain body parts of the monk and the woman touch, but in all versions it is stated that the monk did not incur an offence. What is interesting, however, is the lack of agreement as to which body parts touched: their genitals in the 'Dul bar byed pa (de'i mo mtshan gyis de'i pho mtshan la reg pa) and Modeleqie (根 處相觸)¹⁰⁰; their shoulders (二人肩相觸) in the Shisonglü; and their lips in the following sūtra by Guṇaprabha:

92

sparśane caușthenaușthasya $\parallel (VS \ 78)^{101}$ mchur mchus reg ba la vang ngo \parallel^{102}

This *sūtra* is followed later on by the injunction that one should be mindful when going for alms:

[samprajānan] piņdāya ca grāmam caret || (VS 85)¹⁰³

[shes bzhin du] bsod snyoms la yang grong du rgyu bar bya'o ||¹⁰⁴ While the example below clearly suggests that Guṇaprabha was working from a text similar but not identical to both the 'Dul bar byed pa and the Modelegie, it also just as clearly demonstrates the remarkable agreement between these two texts and their mutual lack of agreement with the Shisonglü.

¹⁰⁰ Nakagawa 1991c, 45, states that it is unclear what touched in the *Modeleqie* ("どの部分が触れあったのか示されていない『摩得勒伽』"), but it appears quite clear to me.

¹⁰¹ Nakagawa 1991a, 341; 1991b, 271.

¹⁰² For Gunaprabha's Vinayasūtra, see Peking, bstan 'gyur, 'Dul ba'i 'grel pa (vol. 123) ZU 16a5.

¹⁰³ Nakagawa 1991a, 344; 1991b, 272. I have added the text in brackets following Gunaprabha's own instructions; see p. 99.

¹⁰⁴ For Gunaprabha's *Vinayasūtra*, see Peking, *bstan 'gyur, 'Dul ba'i 'grel pa* (vol.
123) ZU 16a7.

Example Four: Vinītaka [68a/b]

Gunaprabha's source: 'Dul bar byed pa or Modelegie or Shisonglü?

(Underline indicates differences.)

' <i>Dul bar byed pa</i>	<i>Modeleqie</i>	<i>Shisonglü</i>
(sTog DA 409b5-6)	(T. 1441 583c24-27)	(T. 1435 425c28-426a3)
dge slong zhig bsod snyoms spyod pa las sgo khang dog pa zhig nas byung ba dang bud med cig kyang nang du 'jug pa de'i mo mtshan gyis de'i pho mtshan la reg pa dang dge slong de 'gyod pa skyes nas bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa nyes pa med de bag yod par byos la grong du bsod snyoms spyod cig	比丘行乞食。入小巷中。 比丘入女人出 <u>根處相觸</u> 。 即生凝悔。乃至佛言。不 犯。先應作意。入聚落乞 食。	有一乞食比丘。中前著衣 持鉢入舍衛城乞食。到小 門中欲入。有女人欲出。 二人肩相觸。是比丘。生 疑。我將無得波羅夷耶。 以是事白佛。佛言。若無 心無罪。從今日應徐徐行 乞食。

Conclusion

Unless I am very much mistaken, we have here evidence of a third Mūlasarvāstivādin *Vinītaka* tradition, one that is close to both the *'Dul bar byed pa* and the *Modeleqie*, and probably closer to the former than the latter. This would seem to mean, then, that we have textual evidence for three collections of what we might call Mūlasarvāstivādin case-law, and this in turn may suggest either that these are snapshots of the same tradition in transition at various stages of development—at different times, or different places—or that we have to posit the existence of at least three Mūlasarvāstivādin *Vinaya* traditions, all very distinct and very far removed from—if at all related to—the Sarvāstivādin *Shisonglü*.

As we have seen even in this very limited sample of incidents related to the first *pārājika* (one of nine rules discussed in length in the *Vinītakas*), Buddhist case-law varies considerably by *Vinaya* tradition (which may or

may not be the same thing as varying by $nik\bar{a}ya$). Since source one, the *Vinītaka* from the *Mūlasarvāstivāda-vinaya* (trans. first decade of the ninth century), matches very closely and is in many respects identical with source two, the *Modeleqie* (trans. 435 CE), and since both sources one and two do not match particularly well with the Sarvāstivādin *Shisonglū*, then it would seem to follow that sources one and two stem from a very closely related tradition, if not the same tradition separated perhaps only by nearly four centuries and the vicissitudes of translation into different languages. Whether or not this means that we have evidence for the existence of multiple Mūlasarvāstivādin traditions will depend on how we interpret the results.¹⁰⁵

As should be clear from the concordance (Appendix 1), in which I have briefly summarized and categorized Buddhist case-law on *pārājika* one from multiple *Vinaya* traditions,¹⁰⁶ there is much more to be said about Buddhist attitudes towards sex and sexuality than is found in the Pāli *Vinaya*. A quick look at the concordance below reveals, for instance, the relative paucity of material on this topic in the Pāli *Vinaya*, despite the fact that it—especially in its English translation—is still the most commonly cited source on Indian Buddhist monasticism. Although the history of Indian Buddhist attitudes towards sex and sexuality is yet to be written,¹⁰⁷ as should be clear from this paper, anyone who attempts such a history can

¹⁰⁵ See also note 26, above.

¹⁰⁶ There are a number of parallels to the various *vinitaka* cases found in other sections of the *Vinayas*, including the casuistry section which deals with hypothetical situations. It is beyond the scope of the present study to catalogue parallels outside the *vinitakas*. I limit myself to passages explicitly identified within their own legal traditions as belonging to the genre of case-law.

¹⁰⁷ For a useful study based on the Pāli tradition, see Perera 1993; for a study utilizing Buddhist *Vinaya* materials preserved in Chinese, see Faure 1998; on homosexuality, see Zwilling 1992, and Cabezón 1993. For an overview, see most recently Langenberg 2015. See also Cabezón, forthcoming (unseen).

no longer ignore the 'Dul bar byed pa and its parallels preserved in the various Vinayas under the title Vinita(ka)s. Indeed, although to date they have remained almost entirely unknown and unidentified, the Vinita(ka)s provide us with what are almost certainly the richest sources for the study of not only Indian Buddhist monastic case-law but also for Indian Buddhist attitudes towards sex, sexuality, and transgression.

Notes on the Appendices

In Appendix 2, I provide a synoptic edition of the complete text of the section on *pārājika* one from the Mūlasarvāstivādin 'Dul bar byed pa (Tibetan; sTog Palace edition [modified ACIP text]), the Modeleqie (Chinese; Taishō edition [modified CBETA version]), and the Sarvāstivādin Shisonglü (Chinese; Taishō edition). I have included information about the presence or absence of case histories in the Dharmaguptaka, Mahīšāsaka, and Pāli Vinayas in a concordance (Appendix 1). For both the synoptic edition and concordance, I have taken as my base text the Tibetan 'Dul bar byed pa. I have presented the texts without any textual rearrangement. The only additions to the texts reproduced in the edition are return carriages which I have used to align the various parallels. At a glance one should be able to determine not only the presence or absence of care, basic structure of the texts (preserved in the edition with the addition of a number of cross-references; rearranged slightly in the concordance).

For the purposes of classification,¹⁰⁸ comparison, and cataloguing, in the concordance I provide in bold a brief English synopsis above each textual unit (case history). Numbers in parentheses () at the beginning of the text of each case history indicate the order of appearance of each

¹⁰⁸ See note 31, above.

textual unit in the respective text; these numbers always run sequentially: from 1 to 85 in the 'Dul bar byed pa; 1 to 83 in the Modeleqie; and 1 to 38 in the Shisonglü—the last number indicating the total number of stories related to pārājika one in each version, as listed in Table 2 above. Numbers in brackets [] appearing in the synopsis line are for comparative purposes across Vinayas. Not all Vinayas include all stories, and even when certain stories are found they are not always found in the same order. Thus, although the numbers in parentheses always run sequentially, the numbers in brackets do not in all cases. In the Shisonglü, for instance, story number [4] concerning an Āraņyaka monk and a baby elephant is not found; story [13b], the story of the monk Nandika, is present in the Shisonglü, but it appears much later in the text (26) than its position in the 'Dul bar byed pa (21) and the Modeleqie (18).

In addition to numbering the stories, I have further classified them with the use of lowercase letters (e. g., [6a], [6b], [6c], etc.). The use of lowercase letters appended to story numbers given in brackets (never parentheses) indicates some discrepancy between otherwise similar stories. In some cases the stories do not match entirely in details; in other cases, in one version a particular story may be abbreviated but given in full in another version. After the story concerning an Āraṇyaka monk and an elephant (separate from the story concerning a baby elephant), for instance, we find abbreviated references to incidents involving various other animals. In order to catalogue which stories are found in which *Vinītaka*, I have assigned letters such as the following: [6a] mare, [6b] camel, [6c] deer, [6d] donkey, [6e] ewe, [6f] female dog, [6g] sow.

In both the synoptic edition and the concordance, I have included references to *sūtras* in Guņaprabha's *Vinayasūtra* and *Autocommentary*, and also to Sanskrit fragments of the *Vinītakas* preserved in two collections (the Private Collection, Virginia [PCV] and the Berlin Turfan Collection [SHT]). In the edition, I have underlined the Tibetan or Chinese text with a

thick underline where it matches well with the text of Gunaprabha's *Vinayasūtra* or *Autocommentary*; where there is some discrepancy, I have used a wavy underline. To indicate parallels in Sanskrit fragments in the Private Collection, Virginia¹⁰⁹ and in the Berlin Turfan Collection, the corresponding Tibetan and Chinese text is indicated with a note number at the beginning and end of the parallel in addition to the aforementioned thick or wavy underlines.

Although much of the work of indicating correspondences between Gunaprabha's texts and the *Modeleqie* and other *Vinaya* texts preserved in Chinese was already completed by Nakagawa, by introducing the '*Dul bar byed pa* to the discussion, I think that I have been able to improve on Nakagawa's pioneering efforts in a number of places. All in all, I have been able to place all of Gunaprabha's 37 *sūtras* from the *Vinītaka*, most but not all with confidence. Under the relevant case histories, I have provided the Sanskrit text of Gunaprabha's *Vinayasūtra* (from Nakagawa 1991a and 1991b); in a few places—generally only when Gunaprabha cites the *grantha* in his *Autocommentary*—I have also included the text of the quotation in order to compare it with the *Vinītaka* (Gunaprabha's canonical *grantha*). In addition, since it may be easier to compare Tibetan with Tibetan and not Sanskrit, I have provided the Tibetan text of Gunaprabha's *Vinayasūtra* and *Autocommentary* as appropriate.¹¹⁰

I have generally not attempted to edit the Sanskrit, Tibetan, or Chinese texts. For the Sanskrit text of Gunaprabha's *Autocommentary*, I

¹⁰⁹ For two more *Vinītaka* fragments from the Private Collection, Virginia, see the identifications reported in Hartmann and Wille 2014, 151 (F26. 2A = sTog '*Dul ba* NA 18a3-19a4 [*Vinītaka pārājika* 3]; first transliteration: Dr. Klaus Wille; identification: Clarke) and Yao 2016, 292n13 (F26. 1A = sTog '*Dul ba* DA 414b3-415b3 [*Vinītaka pārājika* 2]; first transliteration: Dr. Klaus Wille; identification: Yao).

¹¹⁰ References to the *Vinayasūtra* and *Autocommentary* are to Peking, *bstan 'gyur,* '*Dul ba'i 'grel pa*, vols. 123 and 124, respectively.

99

rely on the text published by Nakagawa (1991b). In only a few cases have I emended the text. Thus, some of the brackets used to indicate emendations belong to Nakagawa; some to me. In certain cases, I have added one of the following words (*apahrāsakṛt; sthūlam; saṃprajānan;* and Tibetan equivalents) to Guṇaprabha's otherwise quite cryptic *sūtra*s, but only where Guṇaprabha himself tells us in his *Autocommentary* that such words are to be understood (and most have been indicated already in Nakagawa's Japanese translation).

*Uddāna*s or verse summaries are found only in the '*Dul bar byed pa*,¹¹¹ and are numbered with lowercase roman numerals.

Finally, I invite the reader to compare the columns in the concordance marked "MSV" and "1441." It should be apparent from the distribution of check marks (\checkmark) in these two columns that the Tibetan 'Dul bar byed pa and the Modelegie are almost identical in content and the order of presentation of said content (for the exact order, one must refer to the edition); where these two texts differ, the differences are often minor (as indicated by the addition of lowercase letters in column one). It should be equally evident that these two texts differ considerably from the Sarvāstivādin Shisonglü.

¹¹¹ The Pāli *Vinaya* includes one *uddāna* at the beginning of the *Vinītavatthu* of the first *pārājika*; see Oldenberg [1879–1883] 1969–1982, vol. 3: 33–34; Horner [1938–1966] 1996–1997, vol. 1: 51–52.

Appendix 1: Concordance of Sthavira Parallels to the 'Dul bar byed pa

Abbreviations in Table: MSV = *Mūlasarvāstivāda-vinaya* ('*Dul bar byed pa*); 1441 = T. 1441 (*Modelegie* 摩得勒 伽); 1435 = T. 1435 (*Shisonglū* + 誦律); 1428 = T. 1428 (*Sifenlū* 四分律); 1421 = T. 1421 (*Wufenlū* 五分律).

[]	VS	Skt. Fragments	Vinītakāni	MSV	1441	1435	1428	1421	Pāli
			Uddāna 1	~					V
1			Story of Sudinna	~	V	~	~	~	
			Pārājika also applies to Āraņyaka					~	
2a/b			Story of *Vajraputra/*Vrjiputra	~	~	~	~	~	V
3			Amendment to pārājika 1	~	V	~	~		
			Monk has sex dressed as layman						~
			Monk has sex undressed						~
			Monk has sex dressed as follower of						~
			other traditions						-
			Monk with hermaphrodite					~	
			Monk with woman with conjoint					~	
			passages					-	
			Monk with paṇḍaka					~	
			Monk with man					~	
			Monk with child					~	
			Monk causes death of girl through sex: <i>pārājika</i> for sex				~	~	
4			Āraņyaka & baby elephant	~	~				
5			Āraņyaka & elephant	~	V	V	~	~	
			Reference to all other animals				~	~	
6a			Abbreviated reference to story of mare/horse	~		~	~		
6b			Abbreviated reference to story of camel	~		~	~		
6c			Abbreviated reference to story of deer	~		~	~		
			Story of monk and deer						V
6d			Abbreviated reference to story of donkey	~		~	~		
6e			Abbreviated reference to story of ewe	~		~	~		
6f			Abbreviated reference to story of female dog	~		~	~		
6g			Abbreviated reference to story of sow	V		V	V		
		PCV F20.9 B1	Uddāna 2	~					
7	52, 72	PCV F20.9 B2	Five causes of insanity	~	V	~			
			Monk is insane when he has sex					~	
8		PCV F20.9 B3	Five causes of derangement	V	V	~			
			Abbreviated reference to monk who is deranged					~	
9		PCV F20.9 B4	Five causes of affliction by illness	~	V	~			
			Abbreviated reference to monk who is afflicted by illness					~	

[]	VS	Skt. Fragments	Vinītakāni	MSV	1441	1435	1428	1421	Pāli
10a		PCV F20.9 B5	Monk has sex thinking 1 of the 3 passages is not a passage	~	~	~			
10b			Thinking 1 of the 3 passages is a passage		~	~	~		
10c			Thinking 1 of the 3 passages is not a passage	~	~	~	~		
10d	74	PCV F20.9 B6	Unsure whether 1 of the 3 passages is a passage	~		~	~		
10e			Thinking what is not 1 of the 3 passages is not 1 of the 3 passages			~			
10f			Thinking what is not 1 of the 3 passages is 1 of the 3 passages	~	~	~	~		
10g	75		Unsure whether what is not 1 of the 3 passages is a passage	~		~	~		
10h			Definition of the 3 passages	V	V	V			
10i		– PCV F20. 9 B7	Point at which <i>pārājika</i> incurred for vaginal sex	~	~	~			
10j		- PCV F20.9 B7	Point at which <i>pārājika</i> incurred for anal sex	~	~	~			
10k		PCV F20.9 B8	Point at which <i>pārājika</i> incurred for oral sex	~	~	~			
			Thinking man to be a woman				V		
			Thinking woman to be a man				V		
			Thinking woman to be a woman				~		
			Thinking man to be a man				V		
			Upåsikå who deems sex the best offering for monks suggests standing instead of lying down					~	
			Seated, woman moves; monk doesn't— as above					~	
			Upåsikā who deems sex the best offering suggests ejaculation outside the 3 passages					v	
			Upāsikā (Supabbā) who deems sex the best offering suggests monk touch only her breasts, etc., while she mastur- bates him						~
			Upāsikā (Saddhā) who deems sex the best offering suggests monk touch only her breasts, etc., while she mastur- bates him						~
			Upāsikā suggests protected sex would not be an offence: <i>pārājika</i>				~		
			Upāsikā suggests ejaculation outside of body would not be an offence: pārājika				~		
			Prostitute suggests ejaculation outside of body would not be an offence: <i>pārājika</i>				~		

[]	VS	Skt. Fragments	Vinītakāni	MSV	1441	1435	1428	1421	Pāli
			Woman has sex with Āraņyaka monk sleeping outside; monk no pleasure: no offence					~	
			Woman has sex with monk sleeping outside; monk feels pleasure: offence					~	
			Monk puts organ in another monk's mouth: <i>pārājika</i> or <i>sthūlātyaya</i> depend- ing on whether they were just fooling around or not					~	
			One monk has erection; another monk takes it in his mouth; monk does not enjoy ¹¹² it; wonders if it is a <i>pārājika</i> : only 1 monk commits offence				~		
			Monk visits lay house; boy asleep; monk takes organ in mouth; wonders if it is a <i>pārājika</i>				~		
			Monks bathing with laymen					~	
			Mahallaka monk dreams he had sex with former wife					~	~
			Uddāna 3	~					
11a			Abbreviated reference to story of [female] monkey	~	~	~			
			Story of monk and monkey				~		V
11b		PCV F20.9 B9	Abbreviated reference to story of monk with long organ	~	~				
			Story of monk with long organ				~	~	~
11c			Abbreviated reference to story of lion		~				
11d			Abbreviated reference to story of badger		~				
11e			Abbreviated reference to story of peacock		>	~	~		
11f			Abbreviated reference to story of hen		>	~	V		
11g			Abbreviated reference to story of cow			~	~		
11h			Abbreviated reference to story of mule			~			
11i			Abbreviated reference to story of roebuck			~			
11j			Abbreviated reference to story of goose			~			
11k			Abbreviated reference to story of wild goose			~	~		
12			Abbreviated reference to story of monk with supple back	~					
			Story of monk with supple back				V	~	V

¹¹² Here and below, it is likely that the concepts of enjoyment and consent are conflated in our texts; see Clarke 2014, 114 and 213n235.

[]	VS	Skt. Fragments	Vinītakāni	MSV	1441	1435	1428	1421	Pāli
13a			Abbreviated reference to story of Nandika	~	~				
13b			Story of Nandika			~	~	~	
			Monk grabs another monk and has sex; grabbed monk feels pleasure; wonders if it is a <i>pārājika</i> : both monks <i>pārājika</i>				~		
			Monk grabs a <i>śrāmaņera</i> and has sex; <i>śrāmaņera</i> feels pleasure; wonders if he has committed an offence: both committed an offence				~		
			<i>Śrāmaņera</i> grabs a monk and has sex; monk feels pleasure: both committed an offence				~		
			<i>Śrāmaņera</i> grabs a <i>śrāmaņera</i> and has sex; grabbed <i>śrāmaņera</i> feels pleasure: both committed an offence				~		
			Monk rapes another monk; raped monk does not feel pleasure: no offence for raped monk; offence for rapist				~		
			Monk rapes a <i>śrāmaņera; śrāmaņera</i> does not feel pleasure: no offence for <i>śrāmaņera</i> ; offence for monk				~		
			Śrāmaņera rapes a monk; monk does not feel pleasure: no offence for monk; offence for śrāmaņera				~		
			Śrāmaņera rapes a śrāmaņera; raped śrāmaņera does not feel pleasure: no offence for raped śrāmaņera; offence for rapist				~		
			Monk becomes woman (sex-change)						V
			Nun becomes man (sex-change)						~
14			Monks bathing together	~	~		~		
15	68		Monk advises another monk to have sex	~	~	~			
16a			Upāli asks the Buddha about the four types of <i>sthūlātyaya</i>	~	~	~			
16b			Confession of a grave sthūlātyaya arising from a pārājika	~	~	~			
16c			Confession of a light <i>sthūlātyaya</i> arising from a <i>pārājika</i>	~	~	~			
16d			Confession of a grave sthūlātyaya arising from a sanghāvašesa	~	~	~			
16e			Confession of a light sthūlātyaya arising from a sanghāvaseşa	~	~	~			
			Uddāna 4	~					
17			Monk yawns	~	~		~		
18	69		Monk with constant erection	V	V				

[]	VS	Skt. Fragments	Vinītakāni	MSV	1441	1435	1428	1421	Pāli
19	57(?), 58, 59		Monk and mother incest	~	~		~		~
			Monk and daughter incest						~
			Monk and sister incest						V
			Monk and former wife						V
20	53		Monk and corpse on which he medi-	~	~		~		
20	- 33		tates; worms; stages of decomposition	~	~		~		
21			Corpse meditation; corpse wakes up	~	~				
			Corpse; enter organ, withdraw from						~
			sore						
			Corpse; enter sore, withdraw from organ						~
			Corpse; not yet decomposed						~
			Corpse; practically undecomposed						~
			Corpse; practically decomposed						~
			Corpse; decapitated head; touching						V
			Corpse; decapitated head; not touching						~
			Corpse; scattered bones						V
			Corpse; well-adorned woman				V		
22a/b	70, 71		Monk & housewife/upāsikā	V	~				
23			Monk & housewife		~				
24			Abbreviated reference to story of Saundarananda discussed in <i>Vibhanga</i>	~	~				
			Story of Sundarananda						V
			Story of Sundarananda 2?						V
			Story of Sundarananda 3?						V
			Story of Sundarananda 4?						V
25	60		Āraŋyaka monk injures naked brahmin girl: pārājika or sthūlātyaya depending on enjoyment		~				
			Monk with physical disability, not able to sense touch				~		~
			Uddāna 5	V					
26	61		Monk with erectile dysfunction	V	V		V		
27	62		Monk with sleeping woman: pārājika or sthūlātyaya depending on contact	~	~				
			Monk with sleeping woman; thinks no offence if she feels no pleasure				~		
28a			Abbreviated reference to story about monk with an intoxicated woman	~					
			Story about monk with an intoxicated woman; thinks no offence if she feels no pleasure				~		
28b			Abbreviated reference to story about monk with woman who is afflicted by illness [mentally ill]	1	~				

		/		. ()
104	The Dul bar	[,] byed þa (Vinītak	a) of the Uttaragra	<i>ntha</i> (Clarke)

[]	VS	Skt. Fragments	Vinītakāni	MSV	1441	1435	1428	1421	Pāli
			Story about monk with woman who is mentally ill; thinks no offence if she feels no pleasure				~		
28c			Abbreviated reference to story about monk with woman who is unwilling	~					
			Story about monk with woman who is angry; thinks no offence if she feels no pleasure				~		
			Story about monk with woman who is in agony; thinks no offence if she feels no pleasure				~		
			Story about monk with disabled woman; thinks no offence if she feels no pleasure				~		
29			Application of above stories (27-28) to cases involving men and <i>paṇḍaka</i> s	~	~				
			Monk rapes woman; thinks no offence if she feels no pleasure				~		
			Monk rapes <i>paṇḍaka</i> ; thinks no offence if <i>paṇḍaka</i> feels no pleasure				~		
			Monk rapes man; thinks no offence if he feels no pleasure				~		
			Woman rapes monk; monk feels no pleasure: no offence				~		
			Pandaka rapes monk; monk feels no pleasure: no offence				~		
			Man rapes monk; monk feels no pleasure: no offence				~		
			Uddāna 6	V					
30a	63		Sleeping monk with woman; enjoyed it; unaware but did stir: <i>sthūlātyaya</i>	~					
30b	05		Sleeping monk with woman; unaware but did stir: <i>sthūlātyaya</i>		~				
31			Sleeping monk with woman; did not enjoy it: no offence	~					
32			Sleeping monk with woman; unaware: no offence	~					
33		SHT (V) 1063 B1	Sleeping monk with woman; unaware; no enjoyment: no offence	~	~				
34			Sleeping monk with woman; unaware; no enjoyment; but did stir: <i>sthūlātyaya</i>		~				
35a		SHT (V) 1063 B2	Application of above stories to cases involving nuns	~	~				
35b		5111 (1) 1003 D2	Application of above stories to cases involving <i>śikṣamāṇā</i> s	~	~				
35c			Application of above stories to cases involving <i>śrāmaņerikā</i> s	~	~				

The 'Dul bar byed pe	a (Vinītaka) of the	Uttaragrantha	(Clarke)
----------------------	---------------------	---------------	----------

106

[]	VS	Skt. Fragments	Vinītakāni	MSV	1441	1435	1428	1421	Pāli
35d			Application of above stories to cases involving śrāmaņeras	~	~				
			Evil <i>bhikṣu</i> , evil <i>śrāmaṇera</i> , evil Āraṇyaka with monk; 3 passages; enjoyment; both commit <i>pārājika</i>				~		
36a		SHT (V) 1063 B3	Evil <i>śramaņa</i> s violate a woman in all three passages: <i>pārājika</i>	~					
36b			Evil śrāmaņera[s] violate a woman in all three passages: pārājika		~				
			Evil bhikşu, evil śrāmaņera, evil Āraņyaka with bhikşunī, śrāmaņera, śrāmaņerikā, śikşamāņā, 3 passages; enjoyment: both commit offences				v		
			Evil <i>bhikşu</i> , evil <i>śrāmaņera</i> , evil Āraņyaka with monk; 3 passages; no enjoyment: one monk <i>pārājika</i>				~		
			Evil bhikşu, evil śrāmaņera, evil Āraņyaka with bhikşuņī, śrāmaņera, śrāmaņerikā, šikşamāņā; 3 passages; no enjoyment: monks commit offences				~		
37a			Application of above story involving woman to cases involving men	~	~				
37b			Application of above story involving woman to cases involving <i>paṇḍaka</i> s	~					
			Evil <i>bhikşu</i> , evil <i>śrāmaņera</i> , evil Āraņyaka with sleeping monk; 3 passages; did not wake up; unaware: one monk commits <i>pārājika</i>				~		
			Evil bhikşu, evil śrāmaņera, evil Āraņyaka with sleeping bhikşunī, śrāmaņera, śrāmaņerikā, šikşamāņā; 3 passages; did not wake up; unaware: monks commit offences				~		
			Evil <i>bhikşu</i> , evil <i>śrāmaņera</i> , evil Āraņyaka with sleeping monk; 3 passages; did wake up; but no enjoyment: one monk commits <i>pārājika</i>				~		
			Evil <i>bhikşu</i> , evil <i>śrāmaņera</i> , evil Āraņyaka with sleeping <i>bhikşuņī</i> , <i>śrāmaņera</i> , <i>śrāmaņerikā</i> , <i>śikşamāņā</i> ; 3 passages; did wake up; but no enjoyment: monk commits <i>pārājika</i>				~		
			Evil <i>bhikşu</i> , evil <i>śrāmaņera</i> , evil Āraņyaka with sleeping monk; 3 passages; did wake up and felt enjoyment: both commit offences				~		

[]	VS	Skt. Fragments	Vinītakāni	MSV	1441	1435	1428	1421	Pāli
			Evil bhikşu, evil śrāmaņera, evil Āranyaka with sleeping bhikşuņī, śrāmaņera, śrāmaņerikā, šikşamāņā; 3 passages; did wake up and felt enjoy- ment: both commit offences				7		
			Uddāna 7	~					
38			Sleeping monk with woman; unaware: no offence	~	>				
39a			Application of above story involving woman (38) to cases involving men	~	>				
39b			Application of above story involving woman (38) to cases involving <i>paṇḍaka</i> s	~	>				
40	54, 55		Evil Āraņyaka monk with śikṣamāņā: duṣkṛta; śikṣamāṇā retakes śikṣāpadas	~	~				
41a			Evil Āraņyaka nun with <i>śrāmaņera</i> : <i>śrāmaņera</i> (or <i>śrāmaņerikā</i>) incurs <i>duşkŗta</i>	~					
41b			Evil Åranyaka monk with śrāmanera: śrāmaņera (or śrāmaņerikā) incurs duşkŗta		>				
42a	56		Evil Āraņyaka nun with newly ordained monk: <i>pārājika</i> or <i>sthūlātyaya</i> depending on enjoyment	~					
42b	50		Evil Āraņyaka monk with newly ordained monk: <i>pārājika</i> or <i>sthūlātyaya</i> depending on enjoyment		~				
43		SHT (V) 1063 B4	Abbreviated reference to <i>Vibhaiga</i> story of monk with sleeping monk: no offence for sleeping monk if unaware in start, middle, end	~	>				
			Uddāna 8	~					
44		SHT (V) 1063 B5- A2	Wooden statue of a woman	~	>		~	~	~
45a			Abbreviated reference to story of monk with figurine made of ivory	~					
45b	64, 65		Abbreviated reference to story of monk with figurine made of stone	~	~				
45c			Abbreviated reference to story of monk with figurine made of cloth	~					
45d			Abbreviated reference to story of monk with figurine made of resin		~				
			Story of monk with figurine made of plaster						~
45e			Abbreviated reference to story of monk with figurine made of gold		~				
45f			Abbreviated reference to story of monk with figurine made of silver		~				

[]	VS	Skt. Fragments	Vinītakāni	MSV	1441	1435	1428	1421	Pāli
45g			Abbreviated reference to story of monk with figurine made of seven precious jewels		~				
45h			Abbreviated reference to story of monk with figurine made of resin-cloth		~				
45i			Abbreviated reference to story of monk with figurine made of clay		~				
			Story of monk with image of woman drawn in mud					~	
			Story of monk with wall painting				~		
46	59	SHT (V) 1063 A3-4	Nāga maiden	V	V		~	V	~
47		SHT (V) 1063 A5	Yakşa maiden	V	V		~		V
48a			Apsaras maiden	V	V		~	V	
48b			Gandharva maiden	V	V				
48c			Asura maiden	~	V		~	V	
49a	66		Preta maiden/Asura maiden	~			~		~
49b			Preta maiden? Devatā?	-	V		-		
50			Āraņyaka monk with non-human maiden	~	~	~			
			Animal realm				~		
			Changeling						
51a				~	~		- V		
			Abbreviated story of Piśāca maiden	~	V				
51b			Story of Piśāca maiden			~			
			Paṇḍaka				<u> </u>		~
			Uddāna 9	~					
52	88		Utpalavarņā leaves cell door open; raped while asleep: no offence for her, but should close the door		~		~		
			Utpalavarņā raped: no offence for her						V
			Nandā <i>bhikşunī</i> raped				~		
			Monk frees a dog out of compassion; thinking he has committed a <i>pārājika</i> , decides to have sex with former wife				~		
53a			Monk frees a sow out of compassion; when rebuked as a thief, decides he might as well have sex with someone				~		
53b			Monk frees a sow out of compassion; considering himself a thief, decides he might as well have sex (with the sow) [?]		~				
54			Monk frees a hen; same as above	~	~				
55			Vulture drops meat into monk's bowl; when rebuked as a thief, decides he might as well have sex		v		~		
			Monk with woman; stricken with conscience						~
			Monk with dog				V		

108	The 'Dul bar byed pa (Vinītaka) of the Uttaragrantha (Clarke)
100	The Dar of a virtuala, of the ofta agrantia (ofta he)

[]	VS	Skt. Fragments	Vinītakāni	MSV	1441	1435	1428	1421	Pāli
56	79		Monk urinates in front of female dog who grabs monk's penis	~	~			~	
			Monk lifts robe and urinates in front of dog; dog grabs monk's penis; no pleasure: no offence				~		
			Monk lifts robe and urinates in front of dog; dog grabs monk's penis; pleasure: <i>pārājika</i>				~		
			Should not keep animals where monks live					~	
57			Monk & vixen: sthūlātyaya	~	~				
58	80		Monk & Kinnarī	~	~				
59	81		Naked monk & fish: should not cross river naked	~	~				
			Monk lifts robe and crosses river; fish grabs monk's penis; no pleasure: no offence				~		
			Monk lifts robe and crosses river; fish grabs monk's penis; pleasure: <i>pārājika</i>				~		
60	67		Naked woman urinating in a hedge	~	~				
			Sex not in but between two lower passages				~		
			Places other than the three passages				~		
			Monk visits layman's house; young girl asleep; monk inserts big toe/thumb: saṅghāvaśeşa (girl dies in Pāli)				~		~
			Monk asleep with door open; lay- woman has sex and leaves garland				~		
			Monk thinks that having sex with woman who is bent over cleaning up a flood would not be a <i>pārājika</i> if he did not touch her: <i>pārājika</i>				~		
61	87		Female wood gatherer has her way with monk who falls asleep while meditating: no offence, but should not lie down alone in the open		~		v		~
			Uddāna 10	~					
62			Female grass gatherer; details as above	~	~				
			Female grass gatherer; full story				~		
			Female cowherd						~
			Female goatherd						~
			Female cowdung gatherer						~
			Arhat has erection due to illness				~		~
63a			Abbreviated <i>Vibhanga</i> reference to five causes of erections	~					
63b			Five causes of erections		V		V		V

[]	VS	Skt. Fragments	Vinītakāni	MSV	1441	1435	1428	1421	Pāli
64	73		Monk with genital disease heard that a doctor cured the same problem by inserting penis into a woman's mouth; monk follows example: <i>pārājika</i>	~	~				
			Woman set up at city gate to offer oral cure for penile disease; monk asks if he would incur an offence: <i>pārājika</i>				~		
65			Monk performing corpse meditation attempts to have sex with prostitute abandonded at the burial grounds with her feet bound by order of the king: <i>sthūlātyaya</i>		~		~		
			Uddāna 11	~					
66	76, 83		Monk knocked to ground by bull; falls on woman: no offence	~	~	~			
67	77, 84		Monk falls into well; woman who had already fallen into well clutches his neck: no offence	~	~	~			
68a	78 (lips),		Monk & woman squeeze through narrow entrance at same time; genitals touch: no offence	~	~				
68b	(lips), 85		Monk & woman squeeze through narrow entrance at same time; shoul- ders touch: no offence			~			
69	82		Monk crosses river on boat with woman; boat sinks; woman clutches monk's neck: no offence	~	~	~			
70	86		Man named *Kapila seeks ordination as a nun, then touches the nuns: no offence for nuns	~	~	~			
71a			Sthūlanandā discards fetus: sthūlātyaya	~	~				
71b			Unnamed nun discards fetus: unstipulated offence			~			
72a			Story of *Bhadra-kapilānī (abbreviated)	~	~				
72b			Story of *Bhadra-kapilānī			~			
73			*Sujātā the nun is captured by rogues, gagged, violated, and abandoned in jungle, then driven out of nunnery when she returns: no offence for one captured by force		~	~			
74			*Dhani the nun is captured by rogues, violated, and abandoned in jungle, then driven out of nunnery when she returns: no offence for one captured by force	~	~	~			

[]	VS	Skt. Fragments	Vinītakāni	MSV	1441	1435	1428	1421	Pāli
75			A nun who is captured by rogues, violated, and abandoned in jungle is then driven out of nunnery when she returns: no offence for one captured by force	~	~	~			
			Monk lying down; woman has sex; monk gets up hastily; no consent: no offence						2
			Monk lying down; woman has sex; monk knocks woman down; no con- sent: no offence						۲
			Monk lying down; woman has sex; no consent: no offence						~
			Licchavi youths force monk to have sex with nun						٨
			Licchavi youths force monk to have sex with śikṣamāṇā and śrāmaṇerikā						۲
			Licchavi youths force monk to have sex with prostitute and eunuch and female householder						2
			Licchavi youths force monks to have sex with monks						۲
			Woman has sex with Arhat suffering from stiffness; reveres him as a "bull of a man" since he remains erect after sex					~	۲

Appendix 2

'Dul bar byed pa sTog 'Dul ba DA 398b4-411b3

i: mdor na | bzang byin rdo rje 'du shes dang || ba[1] glang mo dang rgod ma dang || ba dang rnga mo ri dags mo || bong lug khyi phag mo rnams so ||

112

[1] Story of Sudinna

(1) sangs rgyas bcom ldan 'das grong khyer yangs pa can na spre'u'i rdzing 'gram gyi khang bu brtsegs pa na bzhugs so || ka lan ta ka'i bu bzang byin la bslab pa'i gnas bcas pas | las dang po pa la nyes pa med pa ni bdag gis bslab pa ma bcas pa'i tshe | lan mang du mi tshangs par spyod pa rgyo ba'i chos byas nas | bdag gis las dang po pa gang yin zhes the tsom du gyur nas | sems la dogs pa dang 'gyod pa rnams skyes te | des de lta bur gyur pa dge slong rnams la smras nas | dge slong rnams kyis | **[399a]** bcom ldan 'das la gsol pa dang | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | dge slong dag bslab pa'i gnas ma bcas pa na | ka lan ta ka'i bu bzang byin gyis shin tu 'das par gyur pa ni thams cad kyang las dang po pa yin te | las dang po pa la ni nyes pa med do ||

[2a] Story of *Vajraputra

(2) dge slong rdo rje'i bu zhes bya bas bslab pa ma phul | bslab pa nyams pa ma bshags par khyim par gyur te | des de na mi tshangs par spyod pa rgyo ba'i chos byas nas de 'di snyam du gyur to || re zhig dge slong rnams la dris la | de ste bdag rab tu 'byung zhing bsnyen par rdzogs par rung na ni rab tu 'byung ngo || de ste mi rung na 'di nyid na 'dug go snyam du bsams nas | des de ltar gyur pa nas | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa'i bar du rgyas par byas te | dge slong dag bslab pa ma phul | bslab pa nyams par ma bshags par khyim pa'i dngos por gyur te | mi tshangs par spyod pa rgyo ba'i chos la brten na | gang zag de slar yang rab tu 'byung zhing bsnyen par rdzogs par mi rung gis | de bzhin du bslab pa'i gnas bshad par bya'o ||

Modelegie T. 1441 (xxiii) 582b13-585b29

Shisonglü T. 1435 (xxiii) 424b16-427a11

毘尼摩得勤伽雑事

波羅夷法初戒

[1] Story of Sudinna

(1)佛住毘耶離猨猴池堂。為迦蘭 陀子須提那制戒。爾時須提那愁憂 子比丘作是念。佛結戒斷婬欲先作 疑悔。便作是念。佛言。除前犯戒 不知何者先作不犯。諸比丘向佛廣 白佛。佛言。是須提那迦蘭陀子比 說。佛語諸比丘。汝等當知。我未 制戒時。須提那犯罪。一切時不 犯。

(1)佛在毘耶離。爾時須提那迦蘭陀 無罪。我多作婬欲。不知我何處是 者無罪。我未制戒時。作眾多婬。 先何處非先。如是心生疑悔。是事 丘。未結戒前一切婬欲不犯。

[2b] Story of *Vrjiputra

See below: (5)

(2) 跋耆子比丘不捨戒。戒羸不出。 便變服作婬。作婬已作是語。我當 問諸比丘。我若更得出家者。我當 出家。不得出家者。便住向諸比 丘。廣說上事。諸比丘向佛廣說。 佛語諸比丘。若比丘捨戒出戒驘。 已變服作婬。此人更得出家受具足 戒。從今是戒應如是說。

'Dul bar byed pa

[3] Amendment to pārājika 1

(3) yang dge slong gang bslab pa ma phul | bslab pa nyams par ma bshags bzhin du mi tshangs par spyod pa rgyo ba'i chos byas na | dge slong de yang phas pham pa yin gyi | lhan cig ma gnas shig |

[4] Āraņyaka & baby elephant

(4) dge slong gcig pu zhig dgon pa na 'dug ste | de las mi ring ba na ba[l] glang mo zhig bu byung ste | ba[l] glang mo de las bu mo zhig byung ngo || de'i ma de ni gzas la song nas dge slong des rtsva blangs te | de la rtsva byin chu blud pa dang | des de [399b] 'dug pa la mo mtshan bye bar mthong ste | des de mthong nas chags par gyur te der log par zhugs pa dang | de ngo tsha ba'i chos su gyur nas | des bdag phas pham pa'i nyes pa ma byung grang snyam du bsams nas the tsom skyes te | des de Ita bur gyur pa dge slong rnams la smras pa nas rgyas par brjod de | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | dge slong dag der reg par ma gyur pas phas pham pa'i nyes pa ni med kyi | nyes pa sbom por 'gyur ro ||

[5] Āraņyaka & elephant

(5) nam ba[l] glang gi phrug gu de chen por gyur pa dang | des de'i mo mtshan mthong ste | des de mthong nas chags pa dang | des der gzhug snyam nas mo mtshan gyi khar btsugs pa dang | des de la phra ba zhig brgyab nas skrag par gyur te | bdag la phas pham pa'i ltung ba ma byung grang snyam bsams nas | des de lta bur gyur pa rgyas par smras pa dang | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | dge slong dag skrag pa la ni chags pa med pas phas pham pa'i nyes pa ni med kyi | nyes pa sbom por 'gyur ro ||

Abbreviated references to stories of [6a] mare, [6b] camel, [6c] deer, [6d] donkey, [6e] ewe, [6f] female dog, [6g] sow

(6) ji ltar ba[l] glang mo bzhin du rgod ma dang | rnga mo dang | ri dags mo dang | bong mo dang | lug ma mo dang | khyi mo dang | phag mo rnams kyang de bzhin no ||

Modelegie

Shisonglü

[3] Amendment to pārājika 1

(3) 若有比丘不捨戒。戒羸不出。作 婬法。是比丘得波羅夷。不共住。 See below: (6)

[4] Āraņyaka & baby elephant

(4)有一比丘在阿練若處住。去彼 不遠。母象生一女象子。母象出行 食。女象子來近比丘。比丘與草食 與水飲。象女蹲食女根開現。比丘 見已生貪著心。便共作婬。即生慚 愧疑悔。我犯波羅夷。向諸比丘廣 說。諸比丘向佛廣說。佛言。彼不 觸邊故不犯波羅夷。犯偷羅遮。

[5] Āraņyaka & elephant

(5) 彼女象漸漸長大根復開現。此 比丘復生貪著心。以手擗象女根欲 作婬。女象以脚踏比丘。彼即生慚 愧怖畏。心生疑悔我犯波羅夷。以 是事故。向諸比丘廣說。諸比丘向 佛廣說。佛語諸比丘。有怖畏慚愧 心。不犯波羅夷。犯偷羅遮。

See below: (18)

See below: (19)

'Dul bar byed pa

ii: mdor na |

smyon par gyur dang sems 'khrugs dang || nad kyis gzir dang mi rnams dang || ¹lam min lam du 'du shes dang || lam gsum rab tu¹ bsgrags pa'o ||

[7] Five causes of insanity

(7) btsun pa bcom ldan 'das kyis smyon pa la nongs pa ma mchis so zhes gsungs na | ji tsam gyis na smyon pa zhes bgyi | rnam pa lngas smyon par 'gyur te |
[400a] gnyen bshes zad pa dang | longs spyod zad pa dang | nor zad pa dang | khams ma mnyam pa dang | mi ma yin pas brlams pa dang | ²sngon gyi las kyi rnam par smin pa ste | rnam pa 'di lngas smyon par 'gyur ro² ||

de ste dge slong gi{s} dngos por shes na ni dngos po ji lta ba bzhin no || de ste dge slong gi dngos por mi shes na smyon pa la nyes med do ||

bhikṣubhāvāsaṃcetanaṃ prakṛtināśaḥ || **(VS 52; P ZU 15b6)** dge slong gi dngos por mi shes na rang bzhin las nyams pa yin no ||

grantho 'tra: sa ced bhikṣubhāvaṃ saṃjānāty āpadyate yathāvastu [|] no ced bhikṣubhāvaṃ saṃjā[nāty] nāpattir unmattakasyaivaṃ kṣiptacittasya vedanābhitunnasyeti | **(VSA 52 = [7]-[9]; P 'U [ḤU] 74b2-4)** 'dir gzhung ni | gal te dge slong gi dngos por yang dag par shes na ni gzhi ji lta ba bzhin du ltung bar 'gyur ro || gal te dge slong gi dngos po mi shes pa smyon pa la ni ltung bar mi 'gyur te | sems 'khrugs pa dang tshor bas nyen pa yang de bzhin no zhes gsungs pa

¹ PCV F20.9 B1 /// .. na .. • <u>amārge mārgasamjñī ca trayo mār[g]ā prae.y.</u> + + (Initial transliteration by Dr. Klaus Wille, whom also I thank for a number of corrections. [] indicate damaged *akṣaras*; () indicate reconstructions. Readings are tentative pending restoration work on folio.)

Modelegie

Shisonglü

117

[7] Five causes of insanity

(6)如佛所說。狂者不犯。云何為 狂。答有五因緣。名為狂。謂失 親。失財。四大不調。為非人所 惱。 ² 宿業報。是名五種狂也 ² 。	(2) 問佛說狂人不犯。齊何名狂。 佛言。有五相名狂人。親里死盡故 狂。財物失盡故狂。田業人民失盡 故狂。或四大錯亂故狂。 ² 或先世業 報故狂。比丘雖有是五狂相 ² 。
若彼作犯戒事。自知是比丘者隨事	<u>報政</u> 在。CL工 ^班 月 <u>定工</u> 任相。 若自知我是比丘作婬欲。得波羅

犯。不知者不犯。

<u>若自知我是比丘作婬欲</u>。得波羅 夷。<u>若不自知不犯</u>。

'Dul bar byed pa

yin no∥

118

na bhraṣṭo 'ham ity abhiprāyaḥ [apahrāsakṛt] || **(VS 72; P ZU 16a3-4)** bdag ni nyams pa'o snyam pa'i bsam pa can la yang [smad par bya ba] med do || **(exact source unclear)**

[8] Five causes of derangement

(8) btsun pa bcom ldan 'das kyis <u>sems 'khrugs pa</u> la nongs pa ma mchis so zhes gsungs na | ji tsam gyis na sems 'khrugs pa zhes bgyi | ³rnam pa lngas n[i] <u>sems</u> 'khrugs pa zhes bya ste | <u>mi ma yin pas de'i</u>³ sems dkrugs pa dang | mi ma yin pas de la brlams pa dang | mi ma yin pas de'i mdangs 'phrogs pa dang | khams ma mnyam pa dang | sngon gyi las kyi rnam par smin pa ste | rnam pa 'di lngas ni sems 'khrugs pa zhes bya ste rgyas par ro ||

[9] Five causes of affliction by illness

(9) btsun pa ⁴bcom ldan 'das kyis nad kyis gzir ba la⁴ nongs pa ma mchis so zhes gsungs na | ji tsam gyis na nad kyis gzir ba zhes bgyi | rnam pa lngas ni nad kyis gzir ba zhes bya ste | de la rlung gis bskyod pa dang | mkhris pa dang | bad kan dang | 'dus pa dang | dus gyur pa rnams te | rnam pa 'di lngas ni nad kyis gzir ba zhes bya'o ||

See above: (2)

³ PCV F20.9 B3 /// .. <u>h</u> kāra[<u>n</u>]. kṣiptacitto bha[v]a[t]i • amanuṣyā as[y](a) <u>.....</u>

⁴ PCV F20.9 B4 /// (bha)[ga]vatā <u>....</u> ti vedanābhitunnasye[t]i <u>m. tr[ai]r hi .. kair a ..</u>

Modelegie

Shisonglü

119

[8] Five causes of derangement

人奪精氣。四大不調。宿業報。是 人令心散亂。或非人食心精氣故心 名五因緣散亂心也。犯戒如前說。

(7)如佛所說。散亂心者。不犯。云 何散亂心耶。答³散亂心有五因緣。 謂見<u>非人³怖。散亂心。非人打。非</u> (3)問比尼中說散亂心不犯。云何名 散亂心。佛言。³有五種因緣。令心 散亂。為非人³所打故心散亂。或非 散亂。或四大錯故心散亂。或先世 業報故心散亂。比丘有是五種散亂 心。自覺是比丘。犯波羅夷。若不 自覺知不犯。

[9] Five causes of affliction by illness

(8) 如⁴佛所說。苦痛人⁴不犯。云何 (4) 問⁴佛言。病壞心人⁴不犯。云何 苦痛耶。答有五因緣。名為苦痛。 **調風發冷發熱發和合發時發。是名** 五因緣苦痛也。犯事如前說。

名病壞心人。有五種病壞心。或風 發故病壞心。或熱發故病壞心。或 冷發故病壞心。或三種俱發故病壞 心。或時節氣發故病壞心。比丘有 是五種病壞心。若自覺是比丘。得 波羅夷。若不自知不犯。

[2b] Story of *Vrjiputra

See above: (2)

(5) 有跋耆子比丘。是比丘不還戒 戒驘不出到自家作婬欲已。還生信 心故出家。作是念。我當問諸比 丘。我還得受具足戒。當出家作比 丘。若不得當止。是人問諸比丘。 比丘以是事白佛。佛言。若比丘不 還戒戒贏不出。自至家作婬欲。是

See above: (3)

[10a] Monk has sex thinking 1 of the 3 passages is not a passage (10) ⁵dge slong gis lam la lam ma yin par 'du shes nas <u>mi tshangs par spyod</u> <u>pa rgyo ba'i chos⁵</u> byas te | dge slong de la bdag la phas pham pa'i nyes pa ma byung grang snyam bsams te the tsom skyes nas | des de ltar gyur pa rgyas par smras pa dang | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa |

[10c] Thinking 1 of the 3 passages is not a passage (11) [400b] lam la lam ma yin par 'du shes na phas pham par 'gyur ro ||

[10d] Unsure whether 1 of the 3 passages is a passage (12) lam la the tsom par 'du shes na 'ang ⁶phas pham par 'gyur ro \parallel^6

na mārge 'nyatvasaṃ[jñānaṃ prativi]matir vā || **(VS 74; P ZU 16a4)** lam la gzhan nyid du 'du shes pa dang yid gnyis za ba la yang med do ||

⁵ PCV F20.9 B5 /// + + .i .. .[o] bh. <u>....</u> (bhi)kṣuṇā mārge [a] <u>..</u> dre • .ī ...e b[r]ahmacar[y]. [mai](thunadha)rmaṃ

⁶ PCV F20.9 B6 /// + + +[m] .. āpadyate pārā(j)i(kā)[m*] • [mārg]. . . . [mā]rgasa[mj]ñ[ī]y. t[e]

Modelegie

Shisonglü

人不得受具足戒。隨今日是戒應如 是說。

[3] Amendment to pārājika 1

See above: (3)

(6) 若比丘入比丘法。不反戒戒羸 不出。作婬欲乃至共畜生。得波羅 夷。

[10a] Monk has sex thinking 1 of the 3 passages is not a passage

說。諸比丘向佛廣說。佛言。

(9)又復⁵比丘。道非道想作婬⁵。即 生疑悔。我犯波羅夷。向諸比丘廣 (7)有一⁵比丘。作道想非道中作婬⁵ 欲。心生疑。我將無得波羅夷耶。 是事白佛。佛言。

[10b] Thinking 1 of the 3 passages is a passage

(8) 道中道想作婬欲。得波羅夷。 (10) 道作道想。犯波羅夷。

[10c] Thinking 1 of the 3 passages is not a passage

(11) 道作非道想。波羅夷。

(9) 道中非道想。亦得波羅夷。

[10d] Unsure whether 1 of the 3 passages is a passage

(10) 道中疑亦⁶得波羅夷⁶。

[10e] Thinking what is not 1 of the 3 passages is not 1 of the 3 passages (11) 非道中非道想。得偷蘭遮。

[10f] Thinking what is not 1 of the 3 passages is 1 of the 3 passages
(13) lam ma yin pa la ⁶lam du 'du shes na⁶ | nyes pa sbom por 'gyur ro ||

[10g] Unsure whether what is not 1 of the 3 passages is a passage(14) lam ma yin pa la the tsom par 'du shes na | nyes pa sbom por 'gyur ro ||

sthūlakṛtvam anayor amārge || **(VS 75; P ZU 16a4)** lam ma yin pa la ni de gnyis sbom po'i dbang du byas pa nyid do ||

[10h] Definition of the 3 passages

(15) lam gsum la | bshang ba'i lam dang | gci ba'i lam dang | kha'i lam mo ||

grantho 'tra: mārge amārgasaṃjñā āpadyate pārājikāṃ []] mārge vaimatika āpadyate pārājikām | amārge mārgasaṃjñā āpadyate sthūlātyayām []] amārge vaimatika āpadyate sthū[lā]tyayāṃ []] trayo mārgāḥ uccāramārgaḥ prasrāvamārgo mukhamārga iti []] **(VSA 75 = [10c]-[10h]; P 'U [ḤU] 76b8–77a2)**

'dir gzhung ni lam la lam ma yin pa nyid du 'du shes pa la ni pham par 'gyur ba'i ltung ba'o || lam la yid gnyis za ba la yang pham par 'gyur ba'i ltung ba'o || lam ma yin pa la lam du 'du shes pa la ni nyes pa sbom por 'gyur ro || lam ma yin pa la yid gnyis za ba la nyes pa sbom por 'gyur ro zhes gsungs pa yin no || 'di ni lam gsum yin te | bshang ba'i lam dang | kha'i lam dang | zag byed do zhes bya ba'o ||

[10i] Point at which pārājika incurred for vaginal sex

(16) dge slong gis $^7\underline{gci}$ ba'i lam du 7 dkres kha shun 'das na | phas pham par 'gyur ro ||

[10j] Point at which *pārājika* incurred for anal sex

(17) 7 dge slong gis b
shang ba'i lam du 7 dkres rkub kha 'das na | phas pham par 'gyur ro ||

Modelegie

Shisonglü

[10f] Thinking what is not 1 of the 3 passages is 1 of the 3 passages (12) 非道⁶道想⁶。偷羅遮。 (12) 非道⁶道想⁶得偷蘭遮。

[10g] Unsure whether what is not 1 of the 3 passages is a passage

(13) 非道中疑亦得偷蘭遮。

 [10h] Definition of the 3 passages

 (13) 三道謂大便道、小便道、□
 (14) 道者。小便道大便道□道。

 道。
 (order differs)

See below: (15)

See below: (16)

[10j] Point at which *pārājika* incurred for anal sex (14) 若⁷比丘大便道⁷過皮。波羅夷。 (15) 若令人⁷<u>大便道中</u>⁷。得波羅夷。

[10i] Point at which *pārājika* incurred for vaginal sex (15) ⁷小便道⁷過節。波羅夷。 (16) 入⁷小便道中⁷。得波羅夷。

[10k] Point at which pārājika incurred for oral sex

(18) dge slong gis ⁸kha'i lam du dkres so 'das na | phas pham par 'gyur ro⁸ $\| \|$

iii: mdor na |

spre'u mo seng ge khrung khrung mo || rma bya khyim bya 'ang de bzhin te || mtshan rings dang ni rgyab mnyen dang || nan di ka dang kha gnyis so ||

See above: (5)

Abbreviated references to stories of [11a] female monkey & [11b] monk with long organ

(19) nyes po sbom po bzhi ste | spre'u mo dang mtshan rings ni | ⁹ji ltar rnam par 'byed pa las byung ba bzhin te | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | phas pham par 'gyur ro⁹ ||

Also see above: (6)

 $^{^{8}}$ PCV F20.9 B8 /// + + + + + + (da)[nt](e)[hi] ma[ņ]i(m) ati[k]r[ā](ma)[y]aty āpadyate pārā[ji](k)[ām*] || @ ||

 $^{^9}$ PCV F20.9 B9 /// + + + + + [ņa] • yathā vibhaṃge [• bh](a)[g](a)[v]ā[n āha] • [ā]padyate pārā(j)i .ā ..

Shisonglü

125

[10k] Point at which *pārājika* incurred for oral sex (16)⁸□道過齒。波羅夷⁸。 (17)⁸入□道中。得波羅夷⁸。

[5] Āraņyaka & elephant

See above: (5)

Abbreviated references to stories of [11a] monkey, [11c] lion, [11d] badger, [11e] peacock, [11f] hen, & [11b] monk with long organ

(17) 猨猴、師子、獾、孔雀、雞、 自根長。⁹廣說如毘尼。皆悉犯波羅 夷⁹。 (18)比丘於象作婬欲。若觸肌得波 羅夷。若不觸偷蘭遮。若不觸出 精。僧伽婆尸沙。

Abbreviated references to stories of [11g] cow, [6a] horse, [6b] camel, [6d] donkey, [11h] mule, [6g] sow, [6e] ewe, [6f] female dog, [11a] monkey, [11i] roebuck, [6c] deer, [11j] goose, [11k] wild goose, [11e] peacock, [11f] hen,

etc.

(19)牛、馬、駱駝、驢、騾、猪、 羊、犬、猿猴、麞、鹿、鵝、鴈、 孔雀、雞等亦如是。若觸⁹波羅夷⁹。 若不觸偷蘭遮。若不觸出精。僧伽 婆尸沙。

[12] Abbreviated reference to story of monk with supple back

(20) rgyab mnyen kyang phas pham par 'gyur ro \parallel

[13a] Abbreviated reference to story of Nandika

(21) nan di ka la yang b
slab pa byin pa ji ltar 'dul ba bzhin no $\|$

[14] Monks bathing together

(22) dge slong zhig bla gab med par 'dug nas sgren mor khrus byed de | de'i nye g-yog ni mi bzhi zhig byed de | de'i lus la reg pas pho mtshan las su rung bar gyur te | 'dod chags kun tu gnas pa dang | dge slong gzhan zhig mdun na 'dug par gyur pa des de'i pho mtshan bdag gi khar bcug pa dang | des kyang lus btud de khu ba phyung nas dge slong de the tsom skyes nas | bdag la phas pham pa'i nyes pa ma byung grang **[401a]** snyam du bsams te | des de ltar gyur pa nas | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa'i bar du rgyas par bya ste | de la phas pham pa'i nyes pa ni med mod kyi | bla gab med pa la 'greng ngam 'dug kyang rung | gzhan las byed pa bdag gir ma byed cig |

[15] Monk advises another monk to have sex

(23) dge slong zhig 'dod chags kun tu gnas pas gzir ba dang | de la dge slong mdza' bo zhig yod de | de de'i drung du song nas des de la tshe dang ldan pa 'dod chags kyis kun tu khebs shing gzir to zhes smras na | de na re song la mi tshangs par spyod cig ces bsgo pa dang | de yang song nas mi tshangs par spyod pa byas so || de la bsgo bas bdag la phas pham pa'i nyes pa ma byung grang zhes the tsom skyes nas | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | phas pham pa'i nyes pa ni med kyi | nyes pa sbom por 'gyur ro ||

[sthūlaṃ] parājñāpane ca sevāyām || (VS 68; P ZU 16a2) bsten pa'i phyir gzhan la bsgo na [sbom po]'o ||

Modelegie

Shisonglü

[13a] Abbreviated reference to story of Nandika

(18) 難提比丘學戒。如毘尼中廣 說。

See below: (26) for [13b]

[14] Monks bathing together

(19) 若比丘在空中裸身浴。四比丘 為揩摩身。彼身相摩觸起染污心。 取比丘男根。著口中即還吐出。尋 牛疑悔。我犯波羅夷耶。向佛廣 說。佛言。不犯波羅夷。不得露地 浴。受揩摩身坐臥亦如是。

[15] Monk advises another monk to have sex

(20) 若比丘婬欲熾盛。往語所愛比 丘言。我婬欲熾盛。彼答作婬去。 識。我婬欲常發憂惱。不能自止。 彼即往作婬。彼比丘即生疑悔。我 得一女人共作婬欲可休。知識語 使比丘作婬。我得波羅夷耶。佛 言。不犯波羅夷。犯偷羅遮。

(20) 有一比丘。常婬欲發。語善知 言。便可作去。即隨知識語作婬 欲。知識比丘心生疑悔。我將不得 波羅夷耶。以是事白佛。佛言。不 犯波羅夷。得偷蘭遮罪。

[16a] Upāli asks the Buddha about the confession of 4 types of *sthūlātyaya* **(24)** sangs rgyas bcom ldan 'das la | tshe dang ldan pa u pa lis zhus pa | btsun pa nyes pa sbom po ji ltar mthol bar bgyi |

u pa li nyes pa sbom po ni 'di bzhi ste | phas pham pa las byung ba lci ba dang | phas pham pa las byung ba yang ba dang | dge 'dun gyi lhag ma las byung ba lci ba dang | dge 'dun gyi lhag ma las byung ba yang ba rnams te |

[16b] Confession of a grave sthūlātyaya arising from a pārājika

(25) de la u pa li gang phas pham pa las byung ba'i nyes pa sbom po lci ba de ni | mtshams kyi nang du dge 'dun thams cad kyi mdun du bshags par bya'o ||

[16c] Confession of a light sthūlātyaya arising from a pārājika

(26) gang phas pham pa las byung ba'i yang ba de ni|mtshams kyi phyi rol tu dge slong bzhi'i mdun du bshags par bya'o||

[16d] Confession of a grave sthūlātyaya arising from a saṅghāvaśeṣa
(27) [401b] gang dge 'dun gyi lhag ma las byung ba'i nyes pa sbom po lci ba ni | mtshams kyi phyi rol tu dge slong bzhi'i mdun du bshags par bya'o ||

[16e] Confession of a light sthūlātyaya arising from a saṅghāvaśeṣa
(28) dge 'dun gyi lhag ma las byung ba'i yang ba ni | mtshams kyi nang du dge slong gcig gi mdun du bshags par bya'o || ||

See above: (21) for [13a]

Shisonglü

[16a] Upāli asks the Buddha about the confession of 4 types of sthūlātyaya

(21) 尊者優波離問佛言。世尊。云 (21) 長老優波離問佛言。世尊。偷 何懺悔偷羅遮罪。 佛語優波離。有四偷羅遮。謂波羅 佛言。有四種偷蘭遮。有偷蘭遮罪 夷邊重偷羅遮。波羅夷邊輕偷羅 遮。僧伽婆尸沙邊重偷羅遮。僧伽 婆尸沙邊輕偷羅遮。

蘭遮。云何懺悔除滅。 從波羅夷生重。有偷蘭遮罪從波羅 夷生輕。有偷蘭遮從僧伽婆尸沙生 重。有偷蘭遮從僧伽婆尸沙牛輕。

[16b] Confession of a grave sthulatyaya arising from a parajika

(22) 波羅夷邊重者。界內一功大眾	(22) 優波離。從波羅夷生重偷蘭
中懺悔。	遮。應一切僧前悔過除滅。

[16c] Confession of a light sthūlātyaya arising from a pārājika

(23)輕者出界外四人懺悔。	(23)從波羅夷生輕偷蘭遮。應出界
	外四比丘眾悔過除滅。

[16d] Confession of a grave sthulātyaya arising from a sanghāvaśesa

(24) 僧伽婆尸沙邊重偷羅遮。出界 外四人懺悔。

(24) 從僧伽婆尸沙生重偷蘭遮。亦 出界外四比丘眾悔過除滅。

[16e] Confession of a light sthūlātyava arising from a sanahāvasesa

(25) 輕者	一人懺悔。
---------	-------

(25) 從僧伽婆尸沙生輕偷蘭遮。一 比丘悔過除滅。

[13b] Nandika story

See above: (18) for [13a]	(26)佛在舍衛國。有乞食比丘。名
	難提。中前著衣持鉢入城乞食。
	食竟持尼師壇。著左肩上。入安
	陀林。一樹下敷尼師壇大坐。有魔
	天神來。欲破是比丘三昧。化作
	端正女人。在比丘前立。比丘從
	三昧起。開眼見此女人。即時起
	貪著心。世俗禪定不堅固。發婬心

'Dul bar byed pa

Shisonglü

131

失禪定。欲摩女身。女人即却漸漸 遠去。是比丘即起隨逐。時林中有 死馬。到死馬邊女身不現。是比丘 婬欲燒身故。共死馬作婬。作婬已 欲熱小止。即時生悔言。我已墮非 是比丘非釋種子。諸比丘必棄我。 不復共我住。我不應以是不淨身 著袈裟。即揲袈裟著囊中置肩上。 詣佛所。爾時佛與百千萬大眾圍遶 恭敬說法。佛遙見是比丘來。作是 念。若我不軟語勞問。是人必破心 肝熱血從面孔出。是比丘到佛所。 佛言。善來難提。汝能還學比丘所 學耶。是比丘聞佛言善來難提。心 大歡喜。作是念。我當得共諸比丘 住。必不擯我。如是思惟已答佛 言。世尊。我能還學比丘所學。爾 時佛告諸比丘。汝等還與難提比丘 學法。若有如難提比丘者。亦與學 法。應一心和合僧。難提比丘偏袒 右肩脫革屣胡跪(qui 跪: emended) 合掌。作是言。大德僧憶念。我難 提比丘。不還戒戒不贏作婬欲。我 難提從僧乞還學法。僧憐愍難提 故。還與我學法。第二第三亦如是 乞。眾中一比丘應僧中唱說。大德 僧聽。難提比丘不還戒戒不贏作婬 欲。難提從僧乞還與學法。今僧憐 愍故。還與學法。若僧時到僧忍 聽。還與難提比丘學法。白如是。 如是用白四羯磨。還與難提比丘學 法竟。僧忍默然故。是事如是持。 與學沙彌行法者。與學沙彌。佛所

iv: mdor na |

132

glal dang las su rung bar gyur || ma dang dur khrod gnas pa dang || 'od bzangs dang ni bzang skyes dang || shin tu bzang ba smyugs pa dang || rab bzang bzang ba zhes bya ba'o ||

[17] Monk yawns

(29) dge slong gis ma bkab par glal ba dang | 'dod chags kyis kun tu gzir ba'i dge slong zhig de'i mdun na 'dug pas pho mtshan de'i khar bcug nas | des lus btud de khu ba phyung nas | dge slong de bdag la phas pham pa'i nyes pa ma byung grang zhes the tsom skyes pa dang | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa dang | phas pham pa'i nyes pa ni ma byung mod kyi | da phan chad dge slong gis ma bkab par glal bar ma byed cig | glal na nyes byas su 'gyur ro ||

[18] Monk with constant erection

(30) dge slong zhig pho mtshan bsgreng <u>bzhin las su rung bar</u> gyur nas | des bdag gis mo mtshan gyi nang du bcug kyang nyes par mi 'gyur ro snyam du bsams te | des bud med kyi mo mtshan du bcug nas | bdag la phas pham pa'i nyes pa ma byung grang zhes the tsom skyes pa dang | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | bcug ma thag tu <u>phas pham par</u> 'gyur ro ||

na prakṛtyā karmaṇyatvam apahrāsakṛt || **(VS 69; P ZU 16a2-3)** rang bzhin gyis las su rung ba nyid n[i] na smad par bya ba med do ||

Shisonglü

結一切戒盡應行。在諸比丘下坐。 應授與大比丘飲食湯藥。自應從沙 彌白衣受飲食。不得與大比丘同室 過二宿。自不得與白衣沙彌過二 宿。得與大比丘布薩自恣二羯磨。 與學沙彌。不得足數作布薩自恣羯 磨。

[17] Monk yawns

(26) 有比丘欠時不遮口。有一比丘 婬欲熾盛。以男根刺口中。彼尋吐 出。即生疑悔。我得波羅夷。乃至 佛言。不犯波羅夷。從今以去欠時 當遮口。不遮者。犯突吉羅。

[18] Monk with constant erection

(27)有比丘<u>男根常起</u>作是念。入女根不犯。便著女根中。即生疑悔。我犯波羅夷。乃至佛言。入即<u>犯波羅夷。</u>

[19] Monk and mother incest

(31) dge slong zhig 'dod chags kyis kun tu khebs shing gzir ba dang | de ma'i drung du song nas 'di skad ces | ma 'dod chags kun tu gnas pas gzir to **[402a]** zhes smras pa dang | ma na re bu khyod ni 'di nyid nas byung ba yin gyis | da 'ang 'di nyid du chug cig ces smras pa dang | des de nyid du gzhug snyam ste <u>rma khar btsugs nas</u> | de ngo tsha ba'i chos su gyur te | dge slong de bdag la phas pham pa'i chos su ma gyur grang zhes the tsom skyes pa dang | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | <u>ngo tsha ba la ni chags pa med pas</u> | phas pham pa'i nyes pa med mod kyi | de nyes pa sbom por 'gyur ro ||

[sthūlaṃ] saṃgrahāgatau ca || **(VS 57; here or [25]?; P ZU 15b7)** ma chud na yang [sbom po]'o ||

[sthūlaṃ] praveśanārthaṃ vraṇapīḍane || **(VS 58; P ZU 15b7)** chud par bya ba'i phyir rma nyed na yang [sbom po]'o ||

[sthūlaṃ] bhītilajjayoḥ saṃrāgāsaṃpatteḥ || (VS 59; P ZU 15b7); cf. [46] skrag pa dang ngo tsha bas kun tu 'dod chags ma skyes na [sbom po]'o ||

[20] Monk and corpse on which he meditates; worms; stages of decomposition

(32) dge slong zhig mi ro la brtag pa'i phyir dur khrod du song ba dang | des de na bud med rgyan gyis brgyan bzhin du bor ba'i ro zhig mthong ngo || des de mthong nas chags pa'i chos skyes te | des de'i nang du gzhug ces rma khar btsugs pa dang | de'i nang du yang srin bus gang zhing 'dug ste | dge slong de bdag la phas pham pa'i nyes pa ma byung grang zhes the tsom skyes pa dang | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | dge slong dag <u>nyams pa de la rnam pa gnyis</u> te | nang nyams pa dang phyi nyams pa ste | phas pham pa'i nyes pa ni med mod kyi | nyes pa sbom por 'gyur ro ||

dvayaṃ vigopitatvam antar vahiś ca || **(VS 53; P ZU 15b6)** nyams pa [nyid] ni gnyis te nang dang phyi rol lo ||

Modelegie

Shisonglü

135

[19] Monk and mother incest

(28)有一比丘於母所起染污心。語 母言。我欲得作婬。母語子言。汝 所出處。隨汝意作。便欲作婬欲。 至女根時。即生慚愧。彼生悔心。 我犯波羅夷。乃至佛言。慚愧時不 起婬心。不犯波羅夷。犯偷羅遮。

[20] Monk and corpse on which he meditates; worms; stages of decomposition

(29) 有比丘於曠野中觀死屍。彼見 女屍衣服嚴好。生染污心。手捉女 根欲入內裏生滿中虫。即生疑悔。 我犯波羅夷。乃至佛言。<u>有二種</u> 壞。謂內壞外壞。不犯波羅夷。犯 偷羅遮。

[21] Corpse meditation; corpse wakes up

(33) 'od bzang ma zhes bya ba'i dge bsnyen ma zhig nub mo dus byas nas | de brgyan bzhin du dur khrod du bor ba dang | dge slong zhig mi ro la brtag pa'i phyir dur khrod du song ba des de mthong nas de la chags pa'i chos skyes te | des de'i nang du gzhug ces rma khar btsugs pa dang | de 'ang langs te 'dug nas dge slong de 'jigs par gyur te | bdag la phas pham pa'i nyes pa ma byung grang zhes the tsom skyes pa dang | bcom ldan 'das **[402b]** kyis bka' stsal pa | dge slong 'jigs pa la ni chags pa med pas phas pham pa'i nyes pa ni med mod kyi | nyes pa sbom por 'gyur ro ||

[22a] Monk & housewife (upāsikā?)

(34) khyim bdag bzang skyes zhes bya ba'i chung ma de'i grong du nye bar 'gro ba dge slong zhig yod pa der song nas | de la 'di skad du khyim bdag gi chung ma 'dod chags kyis khebs shing gzir to zhes smras pa dang | mos smras pa | '<u>og</u> mar smyugs la steng mar khu ba thong zhig | steng mar smyugs la 'og mar khu ba thong zhig dang | de la kho mos mi tshangs par spyod par mi shes so zhes smras pa dang | des kyang 'di snyam du bsams te | 'di ni bzang ngo || 'di ni legs so || de lta bur ni rung ngo snyam du bsams nas | '<u>og</u> mar smyugs te steng mar khu ba btang ba dang | dge slong de the tsom skyes nas | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | bcug ma thag tu phas pham par 'gyur ro ||

nāgrapṛṣṭhayor yata ārambha[s tato 'nyato] niṣṭhāne || **(VS 70; P ZU 16a3)** mdun ma dang phyi ma gnyis gang du brtsal pa de las gzhan du gtugs pa la med do ||

bhadantāgrataḥ parikarmakṛtvā pṛṣṭhato mocana[m] vayam atra abrahmacaryaṃ [na] saṇjānīmaḥ tenāgrataḥ parikarmakṛtvā pṛṣṭhato mocitam ity atra granthaḥ || (VSA 70; P 'U [ḤU] 76b1–2)

'dir gzhung ni | btsun pa mdun na mor bsnyug pa'i las byas shing rgyab na mor ldug pa de la ni kho mo mi tshangs par spyad kyang yin par mi 'dzin te zhes zer la | des mdun na mor bsnyugs pa'i las byas shing | rgyab na mor ldug go zhes gsungs pa yin no ||

na śiṣṭair api mārgair upakramiṣye [apahrāsakṛt] || **(VS 71; P ZU 16a3)** lam lhag ma rnams su brtsal bar bya'o snyam pa la yang [smad par bya ba] med do ||

Modelegie

Shisonglü

[21] Corpse meditation; corpse wakes up

(30) 有優婆夷名善光。日欲沒時命 終。彼親族即莊嚴已。棄曠野中有 比丘在彼觀死屍。見已生染污心。 捉女根欲入屍。即起坐。比丘生怖 畏疑悔心。我犯波羅夷。乃至佛 言。畏時無貪。不犯波羅夷。犯偷 羅遮。

[22b] Monk & upāsikā

(31) 有優婆夷名善生。有一比丘出 入其家。語彼優婆夷言。我婬欲所 纏。彼答言。下作方便上出。上作 方便下出。我輩於中不受樂耶。比 丘即呵責罵詈。汝歷鹿妄語。作是 語已。便共行事。乃至佛言。入即 犯波羅夷。

'Dul bar byed pa

(exact source unclear)

[24] Abbreviated reference to story of Saundarananda discussed in Vibhaṅga

(35) shin tu b
zang mo'i gleng gzhi ni ji ltar rnam par 'byed pa las 'byung ba b
zhin no $\|$

[25] Āraņyaka monk injures naked brahmin girl: pārājika or sthūlātyaya depending on enjoyment

(36) rab tu bzang bzang zhes bya ba'i dge slong zhig gcig bu dgon pa la gnas te | de nas rgyang mi ring ba zhig na bram ze'i zhing zhig yod de | bram ze de zhing la rtag tu 'ong bas mthong ste | de mthong nas dad pa skyes so || des de zan la mgron du bos nas des kyang de la khas blangs so || des nang par sngar zas rnams sbyar te | bu mo chung ngu sgren mor spyod pa zhig 'bod du btang ba dang | des de'i mo mtshan mthong ngo || des mthong nas chags pa skyes te byas pa dang | de'i mo mtshan ral nas de the tsom skyes te | bcom ldan 'das **[403a]** kyis bka' stsal pa | de ste mi tshangs par spyod pas <u>dga' ba</u> tshor na ni phas pham par 'gyur ro || de ste ma tshor na ni nyes pa sbom por 'gyur ro || ||

[sthūlaṃ] sphoṭād aṅgajātasya rasāsaṃ[v]ittau || **(VS 60; P ZU 15b7-8)** yan lag gi rnam pa rdol ba'i phyir ro ma myong na yang [sbom po]'o ||

v: mdor na |

las su mi rung gnyid log la || gnon pa dang ni ra ro dang || nad kyis gzir dang mi 'dod bzhin || skyes pa dang ni ma ning ngo ||

-105-

Modelegie

Shisonglü

[23] Monk & housewife

(32)有一居士婦。比丘出入其家。 語彼婦言。我婬欲所纏。婦答言。 作方便如前說。乃至佛言。入即波 羅夷。

[24] Abbreviated reference to story of Saundarananda discussed in Vibhaṅga

(33) 孫陀羅難陀比丘因緣如毘尼中 廣說。

[25] Āraņyaka monk injures naked brahmin girl: pārājika or sthūlātyaya depending on enjoyment

(34) 彼獨住阿練若處住。去婆羅門 田不遠。彼婆羅門數至田看見。此 比丘生歡喜心。彼即請食。比丘受 請。婆羅門辦諸飲食已。遣裸形小 女。往至比丘所。喚比丘。比丘見 彼女根生染污心。便共作婬。<u>女根</u> 破裂。即生疑悔。乃至佛言。若受 樂犯波羅夷。若不受樂。偷羅遮。

[26] Monk with erectile dysfunction

(37) dge slong zhig rang bzhin gyis pho mtshan las su mi rung ste | gang las su rung bzhin du bcug na phas pham pa'i nyes par 'gyur gyi | <u>las su mi rung bzhin</u> <u>du bcug na</u> nyes par mi 'gyur ro snyam nas | des ma bsgreng bzhin du bcug pa dang the tsom skyes nas | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | phas pham pa'i nyes pa med mod kyi | nyes pa sbom por 'gyur ro ||

[sthūlam] akarmaņyapraveśane || (VS 61; P ZU 15b8) las su mi rung ba bcug na [sbom po]'o ||

[27] Monk with sleeping woman: pārājika or sthūlātyaya depending on contact

(38) dge slong gis bud med gnyid log pa la byas pa dang | dge slong de the tsom skyes nas | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | de ste <u>lag pas ni lag par | rkang</u> <u>pas ni rkang par | brlas ni brlar | 'grong gis ni 'grong</u> la 'byar na phas pham par 'gyur ro || ma 'byar na ni nyes pa sbom por 'gyur ro ||

[sthūlaṃ] hastena hastaṃ pādena pādaṃ sandhinā sandhi[ṃ] vastinā vastim ity aghaṭṭane || **(VS 62; P ZU 15b8)**

lag pas lag par dang | rkang pas rkang par dang | tshigs kyis tshigs su dang | 'doms kyis 'doms su lta bur mi rung na [sbom po]'o ||

[28a] Abbreviated references to stories about [monks with women who are] intoxicated, [28b] afflicted by illness [mentally ill], & [28c] unwilling
(39) ji ltar gnyid log pa de bzhin du | ra ro ba dang | nad kyis gzir ba dang | mi 'dod bzhin pa'o ||

[29] Abbreviated references to application of above stories ([27] to [28]) to cases involving men & paņḍakas

(40) ji ltar bud med la rnam pa bzhir brjod pa skyes pa dang ma ning la yang de bzhin no $\|$

Modelegie

Shisonglü

[26] Monk with erectile dysfunction

(35)有比丘男根常不起。便作是 念。起者作婬。犯波羅夷。<u>不起者</u> 作不犯。彼即作婬。乃至佛言。不 犯波羅夷。<u>犯偷羅遮</u>。

[27] Monk with sleeping woman: *pārājika* or *sthūlātyaya* depending on contact

(36)有比丘眠女人來就作婬。便生疑悔。乃至佛言。若手捉手若脚踏 脚。若髀觸髀、波羅夷。不觸、偷 羅遮。

[28b] Abbreviated references to stories about [monks with women who are] crazy & stupid [mentally ill]

(37)如眠狂癡亦如是。

[29] Abbreviated references to application of above stories ([27] to [28]) to cases involving men & pandakas

(38) 女人四句。於男非男亦如是。

∥ bam po nyer gnyis pa ∥

vi: mdor na |

rnam pa bzhi dang lnga pa dang || lam rnam kun dang gnyid log ma || lan cig gsum pa byas pa dang || bud med skyes **[403b]** pa ma ning ngo ||

[30a] Sleeping monk with woman; enjoyed it; unaware but did stir: sthūlātyaya

(41) dge slong nyal ba la bud med kyis byas te 'gyod pa skyes pa dang | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | dge slong khyod kyis ci dga' bar tshor ram | gsol pa | dga' bar tshor ro || bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | shes sam | smras pa | 'tshal ba ni ma mchis te | bdag g-yos pa tsam du gyur to || bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | dge slong gnyid kyis log pa <u>g-yos pa tsam du gyur pa la</u> phas pham pa'i nyes pa med de | nyes pa sbom por 'gyur ro ||

[sthūlam] iñjitatvamātrake saṃyuktasya || (VS 63; P ZU 15b8) sprad pa'i g-yo ba nyid tsam la [sbom po]'o ||

[31] Sleeping monk with woman; did not enjoy it: no offence

(42) dge slong zhig nyal ba na bud med kyis byas te de 'gyod pa skyes pa dang | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | dge slong khyod kyis ci dga' bar tshor ram | gsol pa | dga' bar ma tshor ro || bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | dga' bar ma tshor na nyes pa med do ||

[32] Sleeping monk with woman; unaware: no offence

(43) dge slong nyal zhing 'dug pa la bud med kyis byas te | de 'gyod pa skyes pa dang | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | dge slong ci khyod kyis shes sam | gsol pa | ma 'tshal to || bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | shes pa med na nyes pa med do ||

Shisonglü

[30b] Sleeping monk with woman; unaware but did stir: sthūlātyaya

(39) 有比丘眠中女人就作婬。彼比 丘生疑悔。乃至佛言。語比丘。汝 知不。答言不知。<u>我覺動</u>。覺動不 犯波羅夷。<u>犯偷羅遮</u>。

[33] Sleeping monk with woman; unaware; no enjoyment: no offence (44) dge slong nyal zhing 'dug pa la bud med kyis byas te 'gyod pa skyes pa dang | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | ci dge slong khyod kyis ¹⁰shes pa 'am¹⁰ | dga' bar tshor ba yod dam | gsol pa | 'tshal ba 'ang ma mchis | dga' bar tshor ba 'ang ma mchis so || bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | shes pa med pa dang dga' [404a] bar tshor ba med pa la nyes pa med do ||

Abbreviated reference to application of above stories to cases involving [35a] nuns, [35b] *śikṣamāņās*, [35c] *śrāmaņerikās*, & [35d] *śrāmaņeras* (45) dge slong la ji lta bar ¹¹dge slong ma dang | dge slob ma¹¹ dang | dge tshul ma dang | dge tshul pha la yang de bzhin no ||

[36a] Evil śramaņas violate a woman in all 3 passages: pārājika (46) sdig can gyi dge sbyong gsum pos bud med ¹²bzung ste¹² | lam kun tu byas kyang nyes par mi 'gyur ro zhes smras nas | de dag gis de'i lam kun tu byas pa dang | de dag the tsom skyes nas | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | bcug ma thag tu phas pham par 'gyur ro ||

Abbreviated reference to application of above story involving woman to cases involving [37a] men & [37b] paṇḍakas

(47) bud med la ji lta bar skyes pa dang ma ning thams cad la 'ang de bzhin no

 10 SHT (V) 1063 B1 /// + [s]. .y. atha saṃj[ā] + + + + /// (with slight modification of conventions throughout).

¹¹ SHT (V) 1063 B2 /// .u-(bhi)kşuņī-śikşamā[ņā] .. + + + ///

 12 SHT (V) 1063 B3 /// + .. upakrama [k]o t a[nu] + ///

Modelegie

Shisonglü

145

[33] Sleeping monk with woman; unaware; no enjoyment: no offence

(40)比丘眠中女人就作婬。即生疑悔。乃至佛言。比丘汝¹⁰知¹⁰不受樂不。答言不受樂。不受樂不犯。

[34] Sleeping monk with woman; unaware; no enjoyment; but did stir: sthūlātyaya

(41) 有比丘眠中女人就作婬。即生疑悔。乃至佛言。汝知不受樂不。 答言不知。不受樂而覺動。佛言。 犯偷羅遮。

Abbreviated reference to application of above stories to cases involving [35a] nuns, [35b] *šikṣamāņās*, [35d] *śrāmaņeras*, & [35c] *śrāmaņerikās* (42) 如比丘¹¹比丘尼式叉摩那¹¹沙彌 沙彌尼亦如是。

[36b] Evil śrāmaņera[s] violate a woman in all 3 passages: pārājika (43) 有惡沙彌語女人言。入一切道 中不犯。彼即用一切道作已。即生 疑悔。乃至佛言。入即波羅夷。

[37a] Abbreviated reference to application of above story involving woman to cases involving men

(44) 如女人男子亦如是。

vii: mdor na |

bud med skyes pa ma ning dang || sun phyung dga' ba ma tshor dang || dgon pa gsum dang rab byung lnga'o ||

[38] Sleeping monk with woman; unaware: no offence

(48) dge slong zhig nyal ba la bud med kyis byas te | dge slong de 'gyod pa skyes nas | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | dge slong ci khyod kyis shes sam | gsol pa | ma 'tshal to || mi shes pa la nyes pa med do ||

Abbreviated reference to application of above story involving woman to cases involving [39a] men & [39b] paṇḍakas

(49) bud med la ji ltar skyes pa dang ma ning yang de bzhin no \parallel

[40] Evil Āraņyaka monk with śikṣamāṇā: duṣkṛta; śikṣamāṇā retakes śikṣāpadas

(50) dgon pa'i dge slong sdig can gyis dge slob ma brid nas | khyod ni bsnyen par ma rdzogs pas mi tshangs par spyad na | bdag cag gnyis ka la nyes par mi 'gyur ro zhes smras pa dang | des khas blangs so || des khas blangs nas 'gyod pa skyes pa dang | des de ma dad bzhin du byas nas | dge slob ma de bdag ni dge slob ma ma yin par ma gyur grang snyam du 'gyod pa skyes pa dang | bcom Idan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | bslab pa nyams kyis | slar yang byin cig | nyes byas su 'gyur ro ||

kupitatvaṃ śikṣāyāḥ sevā[ṃ] prati parasyābhyupagatau || (VS 54; P ZU 15b6) b[s]ten pa'i phyir gzhan la khas blangs pa na bslab pa 'khrugs pa nyid do ||

deyatvam atra punar asyā
ḥ $\|$ (VS 55; P ZU 15b6–7) de la de yang s
byin par bya ba nyid do $\|$

grantho 'tra: pāpāraņyakena śikṣamāṇā upalāpitā tvaṃ anupasaṃpannā abrahmacarya[ṃ] kariṣyāmaḥ anāpattir bhaviṣyati | tayā tasyādhivāsitaṃ tasyādhivāsayitvā <[kukr?]ti sā jātaḥ []]> tena sā akāmikā upakrāntā []] tasyāḥ

Modelegie

Shisonglü

[38] Sleeping monk with woman; unaware: no offence (45) 有比丘眠中女人就作婬。彼生

疑悔。乃至佛言。汝知不。答言不 知。不知不犯。

Abbreviated reference to application of above story involving woman to cases involving [39a] men & [39b] paṇḍakas

(46) 如女人男子非男亦如是。

[40] Evil Āraņyaka monk with śikşamāņā: duşkrta; śikşamāņā retakes śikşāpadas

(47) 惡比丘語式叉摩那言。汝未受 具足戒。共我作婬。不犯。彼即 許。許已生悔。比丘強捉作婬。彼 生疑悔。我非式叉摩那耶。乃至佛 言。失式叉摩那。更應與受。犯突 吉羅。

kaukṛtyajātaṃ | mā haivāham aśikṣamāṇā | bhagavān āha | kopyā śikṣā punar dātavyā []] āpadyate duṣkṛtām iti | (VSA 54; P 'U [ḤU] 74b7–75a1)

'dir gzhung ni | dgon pa pa sdig can gyis dge slob ma la khyod bsnyen par ma rdzogs kyis mi tshangs par spyod kyang ltung bar mi 'gyur ro zhes co 'dri ste des de bsten pa dang bsten pa de la 'gyod pa skyes so || des de mi 'dod bzhin du brtsal ba dang | de bdag dge slob mar ma rung par ma gyur tam snyam du 'gyod pa skyes so || bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | bslab pa 'khrugs pas yang dpog par bya ste | nyes byas kyis ltung bar 'gyur ro | zhes gsungs pa yin no ||

[41a] Evil Āraņyaka nun with śrāmaņera: śrāmaņera (or śrāmaņerikā) incurs dușkṛta

(51) dgon [404b] pa'i sdig can mas dge tshul pha brid nas | khyod ni bsnyen par ma rdzogs pas mi tshangs par spyad kyang | bdag cag gnyis ka la nyes par mi 'gyur ro zhes smras pa nas rgyas par te | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | dge tshul pha la nyes su 'gyur te | dge tshul ma la yang de bzhin no ||

[42a] Evil Āraņyaka nun with newly ordained monk: pārājika or sthūlātyaya depending on enjoyment

(52) dgon pa'i sdig can mas lor ma lon pa la | khyod bsnyen par rdzogs nas ring por ma lon gyi | mi tshangs par spyad kyang bdag cag la nyes par mi 'gyur ro zhes smras nas | des kyang de la khas blangs te | des khas blangs nas slar 'gyod pa skyes pa dang | des de la ma dad bzhin du byas nas | dge slong <u>de</u> 'di snyam du bdag la phas pham pa'i nyes pa ma byung grang snyam ste 'gyod pa skyes pa dang | <u>bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa</u> | dga' bar ma tshor ba la ni <u>phas pham</u> pa'i nyes pa med de | nyes pa sbom por 'gyur ro ||

sthūlam bhikṣoḥ asyām || **(VS 56; P ZU 15b7)** de ni dge slong gi sbom po'o ||

atrāpi granthaḥ: pāpāraṇyena avārṣikaḥ upalāpitaḥ tvaṃ aciropasaṃpannaḥ abrahmacarya[ṃ] kariṣyāma iti anāpattiḥ tena yāvan mā haivāhaṃ pārājikām āpattim āpannaḥ []] bhagavān āha | anāpattipārājikā[m] āpadya sthūlāt{a}yayām iti | (VSA 56; P 'U [ḤU] 75a4-6)

Shisonglü

[41b] Evil Āraņyaka monk with śrāmaņera: śrāmaņera (or śrāmaņerikā) incurs dușkṛta

(48) 惡阿練若比丘語沙彌言。汝未 受具足戒。共我作婬。無罪。廣說 如前。沙彌犯突吉羅。沙彌尼亦如 是。

[42b] Evil Āraņyaka monk with newly ordained monk: pārājika or sthūlātyaya depending on enjoyment

(49) <u>惡阿練若比丘語新受戒</u>比丘。 汝始受戒共我作婬。無罪。彼尋聽 許。許已生悔。彼強捉作婬。即生 疑悔。我犯波羅夷。乃至佛言。不 受樂不犯波羅夷。犯偷羅遮。

'dir yang gzhung ni | dgon pa pa sdig can gyis lor ma lon pa la khyod bsnyen par rdzogs nas ring por ma lon gyis mi tshangs par spyad kyang des ltung bar mi 'gyur ro zhes co dris te | des de bsten pa dang bsten pa de la 'gyod pa skyes so || des de mi 'dod bzhin du brtsal pa dang | de bdag pham par ma gyur tam snyam du 'gyod pa skyes so || bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | pham pa'i ltung bar mi 'gyur te | nyes pa sbom por 'gyur ro zhes bya ba'o ||

[43] Abbreviated reference to *Vibhanga* story of monk with sleeping monk: no offence for sleeping monk if unaware in start, middle, end

(53) dge slong zhig gis dge slong zhig nyal ba la byas pa dang | dge slong des thog ma dang | 13 bar dang | tha ma rnams ma shes na 13 dge slong gang gis byas pa de ma rung bar byos shig | rgyas par ni rnam par 'byed pa las ji skad 'byung ba bzhin no || ||

viii: mdor na |

bzhi pa gzugs brnyan klu mo dang || gnod sbyin lha mo dri za mo || lha min yi dags mi za mo || sha za mo yang de bzhin no ||

[44] Wooden statue of a woman

(54) ¹⁴<u>dge slong zhig gis</u>¹⁴ <u>shing gi gzugs brnyan byas pa</u> gzugs legs pa blta na sdug pa mdzes pa zhig mthong ste | de mthong ba dang 'dod ba'i chos skyes nas | des de nyid du gzhug snyam ste rma khar btsugs pa dang | des kyang ¹⁵<u>phye</u> nas¹⁵ dge slong de 'gyod pa **[405a]** skyes pa dang | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | de ste <u>yan lag thams cad du</u> ¹⁶reg par byas na phas pham par 'gyur ro¹⁶ || 'on te mo mtshan sprad pa tsam gyis ni nyes pa sbom por 'gyur ro ||

 $^{^{13}}$ SHT (V) 1063 B4 /// madhyaparyavasāna na [sa]
mjānā ///

 $^{^{14}}$ SHT (V) 1063 B5 /// + [śā]yitavyau || anyataro [bhi] + + ///

¹⁵ SHT (V) 1063 A1 /// + .. śe avakāśam dattam tasya + + + ///

¹⁶ SHT (V) 1063 A2 /// .. sparśan dadāti āpa[d]ya[te] pārā .. //

Shisonglü

[43] Abbreviated reference to Vibhanga story of monk with sleeping monk: no offence for sleeping monk if unaware in start, middle, end
 (50) 有比丘眠熟。比丘來共作婬。

若初¹³<u>中後不知</u>¹³不犯。作婬者滅 擯。廣說如毘尼中。

[44] Wooden statue of a woman

(51)¹⁴有比丘¹⁴見木女像端正可愛。 生貪著心。即捉彼女根欲作婬。女 根即¹⁵開¹⁵。尋生怖畏疑悔。乃至佛 言。¹⁶若舉身受樂。犯波羅夷¹⁶。若 女根不開。犯偷羅遮。

Abbreviated reference to stories of monk with figurine made of [45a] ivory, [45b] stone, [45c] cloth

(55) ji ltar shing las byas pa de bzhin du | ba so las byas pa dang | rdo las byas pa dang | gos las byas pa rnams kyang de bzhin no ||

[sthūlaṃ] dārudantaśailavastramayadhītikopakrāntāv indriyamātrasya ced avanāmaḥ || (VS 64; P ZU 16a1)

shing dang ba so dang
rdo ba dang gos las bu mo'i gzugs byas pa la brtsal ba na gal te d
bang po tsam dod na [sbom po]'o $\|$

sarvāṅgeṣu sparśadāne maulam || (VS 65; P ZU 16a1) yan lag thams cad du reg pa ster na dngos gzhi'o ||

[46] Nāga maiden

(56) ¹⁷klu'i bu mo zhig dge slong gis drung du 'ongs nas¹⁷ | btsun pa mi tshangs par spyad kyis tshur spyon zhes smras pa dang | des khas blangs nas des der gzhug ces rma khar btsugs pa dang | de yang lus ring mor gyur nas | dge slong de ¹⁸jigs par gyur nas 'gyod pa skyes pa¹⁸ dang | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | dge slong 'jigs pa la chags pa med pas na phas pham pa'i nyes pa med de | nyes pa sbom por 'gyur ro ||

[sthūlaṃ] bhītilajjayoḥ saṃrāgāsaṃpatteḥ || (VS 59; P ZU 15b7); cf. [19] above skrag pa dang ngo tsha bas kun tu 'dod chags ma skyes na [sbom po]'o ||

[47] Yakşa maiden

(57) de bzhin du ¹⁹gnod sbyin gyi bu mo'i¹⁹ bar du rgyas par te | de yang mi snang bar gyur nas | dge slong de 'gyod pa skyes pa dang | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | phas pham pa'i nyes pa med de | nyes pa sbom por 'gyur ro ||

¹⁹ SHT (V) 1063 A5 /// + m* || yakṣaka(nyā) + + + + ///

¹⁷ SHT (V) 1063 A3 /// (nā)[ga]kanyā bhikşu[m upasa]mkra[m](y)[ai] + + ///

¹⁸ SHT (V) 1063 A4 /// .o + + [yaṃ j]ānaṃ trāsaṃ [j]ā .. + + + ///

Shisonglü

153

Abbreviated reference to stories of monk with figurine made of [45d] resin, [45e] gold, [45f] silver, [45g] seven precious jewels, [45b] stone, [45h] resin-cloth, down to [45i] clay

(52) 膠漆如木<u>女</u>、金、銀、七寶、 石<u>女</u>、膠漆布<u>女</u>。乃至泥土女亦如 是。

[46] Nāga maiden

(53)¹⁷龍女至比丘所¹⁷。語比丘言。 共我作婬來。比丘即許。欲作婬。 見形長大¹⁸<u>生恐怖心</u>¹⁸。尋生疑悔。 乃至佛言。<u>若恐怖心</u>。不犯波羅夷 犯偷羅遮。

[47] Yakşa maiden

(54)¹⁹夜叉女¹⁹亦應如是廣說。彼即 忽然不見。乃至佛言。不現。犯偷 羅遮。

[48a] Apsaras & [48b] Gandharva & [48c] Asura maidens

(58) lha'i bu mo dang | dri za'i bu mo dang | lha ma yin gyi bu rnams kyang de bzhin du rgyas par te | ji ltar klu'i bu mo bzhin du lus cher gyur nas | dge slong de 'gyod pa skyes pa dang | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | dge slong 'jigs pa la ni 'dod chags med pas phas pham pa'i nyes pa med de | nyes pa sbom por 'gyur ro ||

[49a] Preta maiden

(59) de bzhin du yi dags kyi bu mo de'i <u>mo mtshan</u> cher gyur pa dang | des <u>der</u> <u>rkang pa bcug nas</u> | **[405b]** dge slong de 'gyod pa skyes pa dang | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | phas pham pa'i nyes pa med de | nyes pa sbom por 'gyur ro ||

[sthūlaṃ] pādasya sevārtham udyatenāṅgajāte prakṣepe || **(VS 66; P ZU 16a1-2)** bsten pa'i don du rtsol bas yan lag gi rnam par rkang pa 'jug na [sbom po]'o ||

[50] Āraņyaka monk with non-human maiden

(60) dge slong gcig bu dgon pa la gnas pa dang | der mi za mo zhig 'ongs te | btsun pa mi tshangs par spyad kyis tshur spyon zhes smras na | dge slong de tshul khrims dang ldan pas spro ba ma bskyed pa dang | des smras pa | btsun pa spro ba skyed cig | khyod ma rung bar byas sa re | des de la ci dga' bar byos shig | spro ba mi bskyed do zhes smras pa dang | mos dge slong de nyal ba la phyar bas dkris te | rgyal po btsun mo dang lhan cig tu gzims pa'i mchan du bcug pa dang | rgyal po des dge slong de mthong nas khyod 'dir ci la 'ongs | des smras pa | bdag gcig pu dgon pa na gnas pa dang | der mi za mo zhig mchis nas | bdag la btsun pa mi tshangs par spyad kyis tshur spyon zhes mchis nas | bdag gis spro ba ma bskyed pa dang | des btsun pa spro ba skyed cig | khyod ma rung bar byas sa re zhes mchi nas | de la bdag gis ci dga' bar byos shig | spro ba ni mi bskyed do zhes de skad smras pa dang | bdag nyal ba la des phyar bas dkris te 'dir bzhag go | rgyal pos btsun pa gang du 'di Ita bur 'jigs par 'gyur ba de Ita bu'i dgon par ci'i phyir gnas zhes smras nas | dge slong bskrad pa dang | dge slong de 'gyod pa skyes nas | bcom Idan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | phas pham pa'i nyes

Modelegie

Shisonglü

[48a] Apsaras & [48b] Gandharva maidens

(55)天女乾闥婆女亦如是。

[48c] Asura maiden

(56) 阿修羅女來至比丘所。語比丘 言。共我作婬來。比丘即許。彼女 根廣大。比丘以脚內女根中。乃至 佛言。不犯波羅夷。<u>犯偷羅遮</u>。

[49b] Preta maiden? Devatā?

(57)天女亦如是。

[50] Āraņyaka monk with non-human [maiden]

(58) 有比丘獨在阿練若處。有非人 來。至比丘所。語比丘言。共我作 婬來。彼比丘精進淨行答言。我不 作婬耶。彼人言。若不作者當與汝 作大罪。比丘故不肯作比丘眠已。 彼非人合衣擲著王夫人背後。王見 已語比丘言。汝何以來此。比丘 答言。我獨在阿練若處如前說。 王言。汝何以獨在阿練若處住止即 出。是比丘去。乃至佛言。不犯。 如是阿練若處不應住。

(27) 憍薩羅國有一比丘。深山林中 獨住。有非人女來。語比丘言。共 作婬欲來。比丘言。莫作是語。我 是斷婬欲人。女言。汝若不來。我 當破汝利與汝衰惱。比丘言。隨汝 作。我不共汝作婬欲。作是語已中 夜比丘臥眠。鬼女合納衣。持比丘 著王宮內夫人邊臥眠。王覺見已問 言。汝何人耶。比丘言。我是沙 門。是何沙門。答曰。我是釋子沙 門。王言。汝何以來此。比丘以是 事具向王說。王言。汝何用在深山 林中住。為惡鬼所燒。汝去。我知 佛法故。不與汝事是比丘有。大事 得脫向。諸比丘具說諸比丘。以是

pa med de | phyin chad gang du 'di ltar 'jigs par 'gyur ba de lta bu'i dgon par ma gnas shig |

[51a] Abbreviated story of Piśāca maiden

(61) de [406a] bzhin du sha za mos kyang byas te | des kyang nyal ba la phyar bas dkris nas chang 'tshong ba'i spyil bur bcug go | chang 'tshong ba des spyil bur bltas pa dang dge slong mthong nas | rgyas par ni ji ltar mi za mos byas pa bzhin no || ||

ix: mdor na | utpala kha dog dga' mo dang || phrug gu gnyis dang sha snag dang || khyi mo wa mo bya rog mo || mi ma yin dang chu rgal dang || nya dang sram dang shing thun mo'o ||

Shisonglü

157

事白佛。佛言從今日如是無人深。 山林中可畏處。不應住。

[51a] Abbreviated story of Piśāca maiden

(59) 毘舍闍女因緣亦如是。

[51b] Story of Piśāca maiden

(28) 憍薩羅國有一比丘。阿蘭若處 住。有毘舍遮鬼女人來。語比丘 言。作婬欲來。比丘言。莫作是 語。我是斷婬欲人。鬼女言。汝若 不作。我當破汝利與汝衰惱。比丘 言。隨汝作。我終不與汝作婬欲。 比丘夜臥。鬼女以納衣裹。持著酒 舍酒瓫中。酒家人明日見比丘在酒 **瓫**中。問言。汝是何人。答言。我 是沙門。是何沙門。答言。釋子沙 門。問言。汝何故在是中。比丘具 說是事。酒舍人言。汝去。比丘以 從是大事得脫故。向諸比丘說。諸 比丘以是事白佛。佛言。從今日比 丘深山林中空處可異無人處。不應 住。

[52] Utpalavarņā leaves cell door open; raped while asleep: no offence for her, but should close the door

(62) bcom ldan 'das mnyan du yod pa na bzhugs so || dge slong ma utpala'i kha dog ma snga dro sham thabs bgos te | mnyan du yod par bsod snyoms la zhugs pa nas | rgyas par rkang pa bkrus te nang du yang dag 'jog la 'jug pa'i phyir gnas khang du zhugs pa dang | sgo phye ste 'phres nas | tsha ba'i dus la bab pas gnyid kyis log cing nyal ba dang | g-yon can srang phran nas rgyu zhing 'dong ba rnams kyis mthong ste | de dag gis nyal ba la byas so || de dag gis byas nas dong ba dang | de yang sad nas dge slong ma de 'gyod pa skyes pa dang | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | nyes pa med de | phyin chad dge slong mas sgo ma bcad par ma 'phres shig | 'phres na nyes byas su 'gyur ro || de bzhin du snyoms par zhugs pa la byas na yang nyes pa med de | phyin chad dge slong ma sgo ma bcad par snyoms par ma 'jug cig | snyom par zhugs na nyes byas su 'gyur ro ||

nāpāvṛtadvāre bhikṣuṇī samāpadyeta ca || **(VS 88; P ZU 16a8)** dge slong mas gnas khang sgo ma bcad par snyoms par 'jug par yang mi bya'o ||

[53a] Monk frees a sow out of compassion; when rebuked as a thief, decides he might as well have sex with someone

(63) dge slong zhig mnyan du yod par bsod snyoms la zhugs pa dang | de khyim bdag gang gi khyim du zhugs pa khyim bdag de'i phag **[406b]** gi phrug gu zhig phur pa la btags pas | de phur pa de la 'khor zhing 'dug pa dang | dge slong des snying rje skyes nas de phur pa las bkrol te btang ba dang | khyim bdag des dge slong de mthong nas | des brgyugs te dge slong de'i gong pa nas bzung ste | khyod kyis kho bo'i phag gi phrug gu btang bas na khyod ni rku ba'o || khyod ni glen pa'o || khyod ni dge sbyong sdig can no zhes smras pa dang | de 'di snyam du bdag gis phag gi phrug gu btang bas na bdag ni rku ba | bdag ni glen pa | bdag ni dge sbyong sdig can du gyur gyis | bdag song la mi tshangs par spyad do snyam du bsams nas | de song ste mi tshangs par spyad pa byas pa dang | des 'di snyam du dge slong dag la dris la | de ste bdag rab tu byung nas bsnyen par rdzogs par 'chags na ni bdag rab tu 'byung ngo || mi 'chags na ni 'di nyid du gnas so snyam du bsams nas | des de ltar gyur pa dge slong rnams la smras pa

Shisonglü

159

[52] Utpalavarṇā leaves cell door open; raped while asleep: no offence for her, but should close the door

(60)佛住舍衛國。爾時花色比丘尼 晨朝著衣持鉢入城乞食。食已洗足 入房坐禪。不閉戶熱時眠熟。惡人 見其眠熟。即就作婬已去。彼覺已 即生疑悔。乃至佛言。不犯。眠時 應閉戶。若不閉戶眠。犯突吉羅。

[53b] Monk frees a sow out of compassion; considering himself a thief, decides he might as well have sex (with the sow) [?]

(61) 有比丘入舍衛城乞食。入長者 家。彼家中繫一母猪。母猪展轉挽 繩欲去。比丘見已悲愍心故。即便 解放。居士見之。比丘自念言。我 偷我是惡沙門。便解他猪放。我住 (read: 往? cf. [55])共此母猪作婬去。 即共作婬作已。便作是念。我當問 諸比丘。若得出家者。當更出家。 不得者便住。以是事向諸比丘廣 說。諸比丘向佛廣說。佛言。初不 犯後犯。

dang | dge slong rnams kyis | bcom ldan 'das la gsol nas | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | dge slong dag snga ma la nyes pa med kyi | phyi ma la ni nyes par gyur to ||

[54] Monk frees a hen; same as above

(64) de ltar bya gag gi phrug gu yang de bzhin no ||

[55] Vulture drops meat into monk's bowl; when rebuked as a thief, decides he might as well have sex

(65) khyim bdag cig gis sha snag gu zhig khyer te song ba bya 'ol pas phrogs te khyer nas | sha snag gu de 'ol ba'i lag nas shor te | dge slong bsod snyoms la spyod pa de'i lhung bzed du lhung ngo || khyim bdag des sha snag gu de dge slong de'i lhung bzed na 'dug pa mthong ba dang | des dge slong de'i gong pa nas bzung ste | kho bo'i sha snag gu de **[407a]** 'ol bas khyer ba la khyod kyi lhung bzed nas zin pas na khyod ni rku ba'o || khyod ni glen pa'o || khyod ni dge sbyong sdig can no zhes smras pa dang | de 'di snyam du 'di'i sha snag gu de bdag gi lhung bzed nas zin pas na bdag ni rku ba'o || bdag ni glen pa'o || bdag ni dge sbyong sdig can du gyur gyis | bdag song la mi tshangs par spyad par bya'o snyam du bsams so || rgyas par ni ji ltar phag gi phrug gu bzhin no ||

[56] Monk urinates in front of female dog who grabs monk's penis (66) dge slong zhig gis khyi mo'i mdun du gci ba byas pa dang | des de'i pho mtshan khar bcug nas des khu ba byung ste | lus kyang btud nas dge slong de 'gyod pa skyes pa dang | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | phas pham pa'i nyes pa med de | phyin chad dge slong gis khyi mo'i mdun du gci ba ma byed cig | yang na de skrod cig | yang na gud du song zhig |

na śunyāḥ purastāt prasrā[vaṃ ku]rvīta || **(VS 79; P ZU 16a5)** khyi'i mdun du gci bar mi bya'o ||

Modelegie

Shisonglü

[54] Monk frees a hen; same as above

(62) 雞亦如是。

薩婆多部毘尼摩得勒伽卷第三 薩婆多部毘尼摩得勒伽卷第四 宋元嘉年僧伽跋摩譯

[55] Vulture drops meat into monk's bowl; when rebuked as a thief, decides he might as well have sex

(63) 有居士擔肉行為烏所奪。比丘 乞食。彼肉墮比丘鉢中。居士見鉢 中有肉。語比丘言。汝是惡比丘惡 沙門。我肉烏所奪。今在汝鉢中。 比丘自念。我是惡比丘惡沙門。我 當往(cf. [53b])作婬去。彼即作婬作 已生悔。乃至佛言。前不犯後犯。

[56] Monk urinates in front of female dog who grabs monk's penis

(64) 有比丘母狗前小便。彼母狗即 來含比丘男根。比丘尋急拔出。即 生疑悔。乃至佛言。不犯波羅夷。 不得母狗前小便。若欲小便。應驅 令去。若不驅者。當更餘處去。

[57] Monk & vixen: sthūlātyaya

(67) dge slong zhig 'chag pa na | wa mo zhig sgra 'byin cing phyag dar khrod kyi gos 'dral lo || de nas de 'di snyam du bdag gi phyag dar khrod kyi gos 'dral ba de su yin pa song ste blta'o snyam du bsams nas | de phyag dar khrod kyi gos kyis dkris te 'dug pa dang | wa mo de yang 'ongs nas dge slong de'i steng du zhon pa dang | des phyag dar khrod kyi gos kyis wa de dkris te bzung nas | de 'di snyam du wa 'di pho 'am mo yin pa blta'o zhes bsams nas | des de'i mo mtshan mthong ngo || des mthong nas 'dod pa'i chos skyes te | des de nyid kyi nang du gzhug go snyam du bsam nas rma khar btsugs pa dang | mos slar log ste sos **[407b]** btab nas dge slong de skrag par gyur pa dang | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | dge slong skrag pa la phas pam pa'i nyes pa med de | nyes pa sbom por 'gyur ro ||

[58] Monk & Kinnarī

(68) dge slong zhig gcig bu nags stug po na gnas pa dang | de de nas mi 'am ci mos khrid nas | des de brag phug tu bcug ste | des ci nas kyang 'du shes gyur pa de ltar byas so || des de 'du shes bsgyur te spyod yul gyi phyir song ba dang | dge slong de 'du shes thob nas | de gnas de nas langs te bros so || dge slong de 'gyod pa skyes pa dang | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | nyes pa med de | phyin chad dge slong gis gang du 'di lta bur 'jigs par 'gyur ba'i dgon par ma gnas shig |

na yatra p[r]āṇātyayāpātas tatrāraṇye prativaset || **(VS 80; P ZU 16a5-6)** gang du srog gi bar chad 'byung ba'i dgon pa der gnas par mi bya'o ||

[59] Naked monk & fish: should not cross river naked

(69) dge slong zhig sgren mor klung rgal ba las | de'i pho mtshan nyas bzung ba dang | des kyang lus btud de khu ba phyung nas | dge slong de 'gyod pa skyes pa dang | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | nyes pa med de | phyin chad <u>'di lta bur</u> 'jigs par 'gyur ba'i klung gang yin pa la sgren mor ma rgal cig |

na yatrāṅgajātādānabhayaṃ tāṃ nagno nadīṃ taret || **(VS 81; P ZU 16a6)** gang na yan lag gi rnam pa 'dzin pa'i 'jigs pa yod pa'i chu klung der sgren mor rgal bar

Modelegie

Shisonglü

163

[57] Monk & vixen: sthūlātyaya

(65) 有比丘經行野干女來親近比

丘。比丘知是母野干。意起染污

心。即以衣裹取母野干。以口嚙

之。即生恐怖疑悔心。乃至佛言。

不犯波羅夷。犯偷羅遮。

[58] Monk & Kinnarī

(66) 有比丘獨住阿練若處。緊那羅 女來捉比丘。擲著深山中已便去。 比丘心悶失。相還得穌已離是處 去。彼生疑悔。乃至佛言。<u>如是恐</u> 怖處比丘不應住。

[59] Naked monk & fish: should not cross river naked

(67) 比丘裸形渡水。魚含男根。即 便拔出。尋生疑悔。乃至佛言。<u>比</u> 丘不得裸形渡水。

mi bya'o∥

[60] Naked woman urinating in a hedge

(70) bud med cig sgren mor shing thags kyi nang na khu le lta bus chu chu shing 'dug pa la | dge slong zhig gis shing thags kyi gseb nas de'i mo mtshan mthong ngo || des mthong nas chags pa dang | de'i mo mtshan la de'i pho mtshan gyis reg nas | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | phas pham pa'i nyes pa ni med de | nyes pa sbom por 'gyur ro ||

[sthūlaṃ] vahi[ḥ]sparśane sevyasya tanmātraparatayāṅgajātena || (VS 67; P ZU 16a2)

bsten par bya ba la yan lag gi rnam pas de tsam la gzhol bas phyi rol du reg na [sbom po]'o \parallel

grantho 'tra: str[ī]nagnikā kiţakadvāreņa tūrņi vāhayati tasya bhikṣuṇā kiţakāntareṇāṅgajātaṃ dṛṣṭaṃ []] sa dṛṣṭvā saṃraktaḥ tena tasyāṅgajātenāṅgajātaṃ [samyuktam | tasya] kaukṛtyaṃ jātaṃ yāvad bhagavān āhāpadyante sthūlātyayām iti | (VSA 67; P 'U [HU] 76a5–6)

'dir gzhung ni bud med sgren mo yol ba'i phrag na snang chu ldugs pa de'i yan lag gi rnam pa dge slong gis yol ba'i rgyab nas mthong ngo || des mthong nas kun nas chags pas de'i yan lag gi rnam pa dang yan lag gi rnam pa sprad do || de 'gyod pa skyes nas | ji srid bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | nyes pa sbom por 'gyur ro zhes bya ba'i bar du gsungs pa yin no ||

[61] Female wood gatherer has her way with monk who falls asleep while meditating: no offence, but should not lie down alone in the open

(71) bcom ldan 'das mnyan du **[408a]** yod pa'i dze ta'i tshal mgon med zas sbyin gyi kun dga' ra ba na bzhugs so || dge slong dag gis bya ba byas nas 'chag cing nyin par spyod pa'i gnas su song ste | des der stan bting nas skyil mo krung bcas te 'dug pa dang | tsha ba'i dus la bab pas des der 'phres te nyal ba dang gnyid kyis log go || de nyal ba na sham thabs bsnyil nas pho mtshan las su rung bar gyur to || bud med shing thun zhig shing tshol zhing gnas der 'ongs pa dang | des dge slong de mi sdug par nyal ba mthong ngo || des mthong nas shin tu

Modelegie

Shisonglü

[60] Naked woman urinating in a hedge

(68) 有女人裸形障内小便。比丘視 見女根起染污心。即以男根刺障 內。與女根相近。即生疑悔。乃至 佛言。不犯波羅夷。犯偷羅遮。

[61] Female wood gatherer has her way with monk who falls asleep while meditating: no offence, but should not lie down alone in the open

(69)佛住舍衛國。有一比丘食已房 前經行。彼經行已。敷尼師檀。一 處結加趺坐坐禪。天時大熱睡眠。 眠中涅槃僧脫去。男根起。有女人 取薪。展轉至比丘所。見比丘如是 眠。見已生染污心。即就作婬。作 婬已去。比丘覺已彼母人語比丘

chags te | des dge slong de la nyal po byas so || nyal po byas nas de song ba dang | dge slong de yang sad nas | des 'phags pa bdag gi khyim 'di zhes bgyi ba na mchis kyis | de ste yang bzhed na der spyon cig ces smras pa dang | dge slong de 'gyod pa skyes pa nas | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | dge slong ci khyod kyis shes sam | gsol pa | ma 'tshal to | mi shes na nyes pa med de | bla gab med par gcig pu 'phres te ma 'dug cig | 'dug na nyes byas su 'gyur ro || ||

naikākṣābhyavakāśe pārśvaṃ dadyāt || **(VS 87; P ZU 16a7)** gcig pu bla gab med par glos mi dbab po ||

x: mdor na |

sa ke ma yi rtsa rnga ma || tsam pa ya yi rgyu lnga dang || rgyal po'i khab na sman dpyad dang || bha ru kad tsa'i smad 'tshong ma'o ||

[62] Female grass gatherer; details as above

(72) b
com ldan 'das kad ta'i shing pa la sha'i nags na bzhugs s
o \parallel de nas dge slong gzhan zhig la \mid rtsva r
ngam zhig gis rgyas par ni ji ltar shing thun ma bzhin n
o \parallel

[63a] Abbreviated *Vibhaṅga* reference to five causes of erections (73) grong khyer tsam par nad g-yan pas btab pa dang | rgyu lnga dang rkyen lngas pho mtshan las su rung bar gyur te | rnam par [408b] 'byed pa las ji skad 'byung ba bzhin no ||

[64] Monk with genital disease heard that a doctor cured the same problem by inserting penis into a woman's mouth; monk follows example: $p\bar{a}r\bar{a}jika$

(74) bcom ldan 'das rgyal po'i khab na bzhugs so || dge slong zhig pho mtshan nad kyis gzir ba dang | 'tsho byed kyi pho mtshan yang nad kyis gzir bar gyur ba na | des bud med kyis khar bcug pa dang | de nad de las thar ro zhes des thos

Shisonglü

言。阿闍梨當知。我家在某處。若 更欲得者。來至我家。比丘即生疑 悔。乃至佛言。汝比丘受樂不。答 言不受樂。自今以去<u>不得獨在空處</u> 睡眠。眠者突吉羅。

[62] Female grass gatherer; details as above

(70)佛住婆耆陀國波羅給林樹。爾時有一比丘。在阿練若處住如前說。女人取草因緣如前說。

[63b] Five causes of erections

(71)有五因緣男根起。一調婬。二 調風。三調大便。四調小便。五調 虫螫。凡夫及未離欲具五離欲具 四。

[64] Monk with genital disease heard that a doctor cured the same problem by inserting penis into a woman's mouth; monk follows example: pārājika

(72)佛住王舍城。有一比丘。患婬病。彼聞耆婆所說使母人口含男根。便得差。即作是念。佛言。聽

-76-

167

nas des 'di snyam du | bcom ldan 'das kyis nad pa'i sman dpyad du gnang gis | bud med kyi khar gzhug go snyam du bsams te | des bud med kyi khar bcug nas <u>nad de las thar pa</u> dang | dge slong de 'gyod pa skyes nas | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | bcug ma thag tu phas pham par 'gyur ro ||

na rogāpagatyarthatā [apahrāsakṛt] || **(VS 73; P ZU 16a4) (exact source unclear)** na[d] dang bral bar bya ba'i don nyid la yang [smad par bya ba] med do ||

[65] Monk performing corpse meditation attempts to have sex with prostitute abandonded at the burial grounds with her feet bound by order of the king: *sthūlātyaya*

(75) yul bha ru kad tsa'i smad 'tshong ma zhig gi khyim du rkun po gcig cig gnas te | de de nas byung zhing mi dag la gnod pa byed pa dang | de dag gis rgyal po la gsol nas | rgyal pos smad 'tshong ma bos nas | ci khyod kyi khyim na rkun po gnas sam zhes dris pa dang | lha su yang ma mchis so || de ste btsal te rnyed na ni khyod kyis bcabs te sbas pas chad pas gcad do || mi de dag gis rkun po de bzung ste khrid nas | rgyal po la gsol ba dang | rgyal pos bka' stsal pa | khyod song la smad 'tshong ma 'di rkang pa'i mkhrig ma nas 'breng pas thogs la ltag par sbrel te dur khrod du bor cig | su gang zhig gis 'di btang na de chad pa 'di nyid kyis gcad do || de ste gson na ni khyim rnams sbyin no || de dag gis de'i rkang pa'i mkhrig ma nas 'breng pas btags nas [409a] ltag par sbrel te dur khrod du bor ba dang | dge slong zhig dur khrod na mi ro la rtog cing 'dug pa des mthong ste | 'dod pa'i chos skyes nas des 'di ltar de nyid du gzhug snyam ste rma khar btsugs pa dang | de 'ang langs te 'dug nas btsun pa sngon du chu zhig stsol cig ces smras pa dang | des de la chu blud nas des smras pa | btsun pa kho mo'i lus dang mngal mi gtsang ba 'di cir dgos | des de na gnas kyis bar du bzung ba dang | de'i gnyen bshes rnams 'ong ba dge slong des rgyang ma nas mthong ste | ngo tsha bas phyogs gcig tu song ba dang | des gnyen bshes de dag la smras pa | kho mo 'di ltar cung zad 'tsho ba de dag thams cad dge slong 'di'i mthu yin gyis | de pos shig ces des smras pa dang | de dag gis bos nas des smras pa | btsun pa kho mo cung zad 'tsho ba de thams cad ni khyod kyi drin te | 'di dag ni kho mo'i gnyen bshes lags na | 'di dag gis gsos te sos pa dang | de ste kho mo la bgyi ba mchis na khyim | 'di na mchis kyis der spyon cig ces smras pa

Shisonglü

169

病服藥。比丘即使女人口含男根。 病即得差。尋生疑悔。乃至佛言。 入則波羅夷。

[65] Monk performing corpse meditation attempts to have sex with prostitute abandonded at the burial grounds with her feet bound by order of the king: *sthūlātyaya*

(73) 婆樓國婬女家有一賊。常惱亂 人眾。王民語王某處婬女家藏賊。 王即喚婬女問汝家實有賊無賊耶。 答言無賊。王言。若汝家得賊者。 與汝大罪。司者於婬女家。即捉得 賊。王即瞋婬女。王語使者。捉是 婬女。拔脚跟筋。拔已棄著曠野 中。使人如王教作。乃至著曠野 中。比丘往至彼處。見是女人。即 起染污心。欲共作婬。彼即起坐語 比丘言。與我水飲。比丘即取水 與。女人飲水已。作是言。此是不 淨身。何足為貪。過此夜已。女親 屬等來看此女。比丘見諸人來起立 一面。彼女向諸親等說。我不死 者。由是比丘力故。諸人即語是比 丘言。有所須者來取。比丘尋生疑 悔。乃至佛言。不犯波羅夷。犯偷 羅遮。

dang | dge slong de 'gyod pa skyes nas | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' st
sal pa | phas pham pa'i nyes pa med de | nyes pa sbom por 'gyur ro || ||

xi: mdor na |

ba glang nang dang khron pa dang || reg dang gru yang nub pa dang || skyes pa dag dang ser skya dang || bud med bu dor ser skya dang || bzang skyes nor **[409b]** can pho brang skyong ||

[66] Monk knocked to ground by bull; falls on woman: no offence (76) dge slong pho brang 'khor skyong ba ba glang gi nang du song ba dang | ba glang mi bsrun pas brdungs nas | bud med kyi steng du 'gyel ba dang | dge slong de 'gyod pa skyes nas | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | nyes pa med de | shes par byos la ba glang gi nang du ma song zhig |

anāpattir abhidrutasya stry[u]pari pāte || **(VS 76; P ZU 16a5)** brdos pa bud med kyi steng du 'gyel ba la ni ltung ba med do ||

[saṃprajānan] gavāñ ca madhye gacchet || **(VS 83; P ZU 16a6-7)** [shes bzhin du] ba lang gi nang du yang 'gro bar bya'o ||

[67] Monk falls into well; woman who had already fallen into well clutches his neck: no offence

(77) dge slong zhig khron pa zhig pa zhig tu bltas pa dang | der lhung nas der sngar yang bud med cig lhung bas | de'i <u>mgul nas 'jus so</u> || khyim bdag dag gis thag pa blangs te dge slong de phyung ba dang | de'i mgul nas bud med cig gis 'jus par mthong nas | de dag gis bud med 'di ga las 'ongs zhes [smras] pa dang | dge slong gis 'di ni sngar lhung bas kho bo'i mgul nas 'jus so zhes smras nas | dge slong de 'gyod pa skyes pa dang | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | <u>nyes pa</u> med de | bag yod par byos la khron par ltos shig |

Shisonglü

[66] Monk knocked to ground by bull; falls on woman: no offence

(74) 有比丘行牛群中。有大惡牛	- 0
來觸比丘。倒女人上尋生疑悔。	乃
至佛言。不犯。行時當自防護。	

(29) 有比丘。在惡牛群中行。惡牛 逐欲觸比丘。走倒女人上。女人抱 牛疑。我將無得波羅夷耶。以是事 白佛。佛言。不犯。從今日應安徐 行牛群中。

[67] Monk falls into well; woman who had already fallen into well clutches his neck: no offence

此母人何處來。比丘答言。先落井 言。不犯。當好作意已看井。

(75)有比丘墮井。女人先落井中。
(30)有一比丘。看井墮井中。井中
女人抱比丘頸。井上人以繩牽比丘
出。見女人抱比丘頸。諸人問言。
(30)有一比丘。看井墮井中。井中
先有女人。比丘墮上。女人抱捉比
丘。比丘推却。有居士入僧坊。井 上看見是比丘。即時牽出。出時與 中抱我頸出。即牛疑悔。乃至佛 女人俱出。居士問言。比丘與女人 是中作何等。比丘言。是女人先 **墮我後墮。是比丘生疑。我將無得** 波羅夷耶。以是事白佛。佛言。無 罪。從今日應一心看井。莫令墮。

kaṇṭḥe cā[kāma]m ārtayā ca lambane || **(VS 77; P ZU 16a5)** nyams thag pas mgul nas mi 'dod bzhin du 'khyud pa la yang ngo ||

[saṃprajānann] udapānam ca prekṣet || **(VS 84; P ZU 16a7)** [shes bzhin du] khron pa yang brtag par bya'o ||

[68a] Monk & woman squeeze through narrow entrance at same time; genitals touch: no offence

(78) dge slong zhig bsod snyoms spyod pa las sgo khang dog pa zhig nas byung ba dang | bud med cig kyang nang du 'jug pa de'i mo mtshan gyis de'i pho mtshan la reg pa dang | dge slong de 'gyod pa skyes nas | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | nyes pa med de | bag yod par byos la grong du bsod snyoms spyod cig |

sparśane caușțhenaușțhasya || **(VS 78; P ZU 16a5)** mchur mchus reg pa la yang ngo ||

[saṃprajānan] piṇḍāya ca grāmaṃ caret || **(VS 85; P ZU 16a7)** [shes bzhin du] bsod snyoms la yang grong du rgyu bar bya'o ||

[69] Monk crosses river on boat with woman; boat sinks; woman clutches monk's neck: no offence

(79) dge slong zhig <u>gru</u> las klung rgal ba na gru de nub pa dang | bud med cig kyang de na yod de | des de'i mgul nas 'jus so || dge slong rgal ba dang | dge slong de 'gyod pa skyes nas | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | <u>nyes pa med de |</u> bag yod par byos la klung rgol cig |

saṃprajānann enāṃ nāvā taret || **(VS 82; P ZU 16a6)** der shes bzhin du gru brgal bar bya'o ||

Shisonglü

173

[68a] Monk & woman squeeze through narrow entrance at same time; genitals touch: no offence (76) 比丘行乞食。入小巷中。比丘 入女人出根處相觸。即生疑悔。乃 至佛言。<u>不犯。先應作意。入聚落</u> <u>乞食</u>。 [68b] Monk & woman squeeze through narrow entrance at same time; shoulders touch: no offence (31) 有一乞食比丘。中前著衣持鉢 入舍衛城乞食。到小門中欲入。有 女人欲出。二人局。相觸。是比 丘。生疑。我將無得波羅夷耶。以 是事白佛。佛言。若無心<u>無罪</u>。從 今日應徐徐行乞食。

[69] Monk crosses river on boat with woman; boat sinks; woman clutches monk['s neck]: no offence

(77)有比丘共女人乘船渡水。船便翻沒。女人抱比丘頸。渡水至岸。 尋生疑悔。乃至佛言。<u>不犯。先當</u>思量。然後當渡。

(32)有比丘。女人共乘船渡水。船 沒水中女人抱捉比丘。比丘推却。 比丘後生疑。我將無得波羅夷耶。 以是事白佛。佛言。不犯。從今日 當徐徐乘船。

[70] Man named *Kapila seeks ordination as a nun, then touches the nuns: no offence for nuns

(80) skyes pa ser skya zhes bya ba zhig dge slong ma'i drung du song ste 'di skad du | 'phags ma bdag rab tu phyung zhig ces smras pa dang | de da ggis ma brtags par rab tu phyung ste | des dge slong ma la reg pa dang | de dag 'gyod pa skyes nas | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | nyes pa med de | <u>shin tu brtags</u> la rab tu dbyung bar byos shig |

supratyavekșitam krtvā pravrājayet || **(VS 86; P ZU 16a7)** legs par so sor brtag pa byas nas rab tu dbyung bar bya'o ||

[71a] Sthūlanandā discards fetus: sthūlātyaya

(81) sbom mo dga' ldan mo yang rgyas par gzhan gyi bu bor ba bzhin no || bcom ldan [410a] 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | dge slong mas bu bor bar ma byed cig | bor na nyes pa sbom por 'gyur ro ||

Shisonglü

[70] Man unnamed/named *Kapila seeks ordination as a nun, then touches the nuns: no offence for nuns

(78) 有一男子作女人威儀。詰比丘 尼所。阿梨耶度我出家。諸比丘尼 不觀察籌量。便與出家。此男子夜 時摩觸諸比丘尼。諸比丘尼即生疑 悔。乃至佛言。<u>不犯。當好觀察思</u> 量。然後度人。

[71a] Sthūlanandā discards fetus: sthūlātyaya

(79) 偷羅難陀。棄胎因緣。此中應 廣說。乃至佛言。比丘尼不得棄胎 棄胎者。犯偷羅遮。 (33) 有一男子。名迦毘羅緊度。狀 似女人。喜女人事到比丘尼所。語 比丘尼言。度我出家。諸比丘尼不 思惟便度。是人摩捫比丘尼。比丘 尼驅出。復摩捫式叉摩尼。式叉摩 尼驅出。復摩捫沙彌尼。沙彌尼驅 出。比丘尼自念。我將無得波羅夷 耶。以是事白佛。佛言。<u>無罪。從</u> 今日當好思惟然後應度。

[71b] Unnamed nun discards fetus: unstipulated offence

(34) 有一估客遠行。其婦與他人作 婬欲。有娠轉大。怖畏故自墮胎。 墮胎已看是死兒大愁憂。無有同意 人可使棄此死兒者。是家中有一比 丘尼。常入出其家。是比丘尼中前 著衣持鉢來入其舍。比丘尼問言。 汝何故愁憂。答言。我夫遠行。我 於後與他作婬欲有娠。聞夫欲來我 怖畏故自墮胎。我今無同意人與我 棄此死兒者。是故愁憂。語比丘尼 言。善女。汝能為。我棄此死兒 不。答言。我能持去。誰能知者。 即盛著瓫中以物覆頭。遠棄著無人 行處。是中有諸博掩人。見是比丘 尼持瓮來。各相謂言。往看。比丘 尼棄何物。即共往看見死兒。見已 自相語言。釋子比丘無斷婬欲。共 比丘尼行婬欲。有娠生兒棄之。一 人語二人。二人語三人。如是展轉

[72a] Story of *Bhadra-kapilānī (abbreviated)

(82) ser skya bzang mo'i gleng gzhi rgyas par byas pa dang | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | bzang mo ci khyod kyis dga' ba tshor ram | btsun pa bdag gis dga' bar lta ga la tshor gyi | ji ltar thong lcags bsregs pa bzhin no || bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | bud med kyi mo mtshan gyi phyogs ni las rnam par smin pa las skyes te | nan gyis byas pa la nyes pa med do ||

[72a] Story of *Bhadra-[kapilānī] (abbreviated)

(80) 拔陀羅比丘尼。此中應廣說。 乃至佛言。汝拔陀羅受樂不。答 言。世尊不受樂。如熾然利劍。乃 至佛言。汝宿業果報。得是身根少 分強捉者不犯。

Shisonglü

177

惡名流布。遍舍衛城。有比丘。少 欲知足行頭陀。聞是事心大愁憂。 以是事白佛。佛以是因緣故和合 僧。佛知故問是比丘尼。汝實爾 不。答言。實爾世尊。佛種種因緣 呵是比丘尼言。云何名比丘尼。棄 他死胎。從今日諸比丘尼。不應棄 死胎。若棄得罪。

[72b] Story of *Bhadra-kapilā[nī]

(35) 俱薩羅王波斯匿。聞跋陀迦毘 羅出家。即請來入宮中。夏四月共 止一處。後時王欲到園中。語守門 人言。汝好守門。莫令是比丘尼 出。守門人言。爾。王出後時守門 人作是念。是比丘尼樂住不走。時 守門人有餘因緣。比丘尼著夫人被 服從門出逕到衹洹。爾時佛與百千 眾恭敬圍遶說法。佛遙見來近已。 佛言。善來跋陀迦毘羅。當佛作是 語時。即失夫人被服。頭髮自落。 袈裟著身。作比丘尼。作比丘尼已 到佛所。頭面禮佛於一面立。佛為 說四如意足神通道。即時比丘尼得 神通力。是時王聞跋陀迦毘羅女走 去。便將兵眾圍繞比丘尼坊。是比 丘尼便飛虛空中。王仰看見已生悔 心。我云何污是阿羅漢比丘尼。心 悶躄地。時諸群臣以冷水灑。還得 醒悟。向比丘尼悔過。諸比丘尼驅 出。汝是行婬欲人。出去。是比 丘尼言。我無受欲心。諸比丘尼 言。汝夏四月共王在宫殿中。云

178

'Dul bar byed pa

[73] *Sujātā the nun is captured by rogues, gagged, violated, and abandoned in jungle, then driven out of nunnery when she returns: no offence for one captured by force

(83) dge slong ma bzang mo skyes zhes bya ba de g-yon can rnams kyi bzung nas kha bkab ste | nags stug por khrid nas sun phyung ste slar btang ba las | dge slong ma dag gis gnas nas bskrad pa dang | des smras pa | 'phags ma bdag gis ni dga' bar ma tshor ro || khyod g-yon can gyis bzung ste nags stug por khrid nas sun phyung ste slar btang ba yin na | **[410b]** ci'i phyir dga' bar ma tshor | de ltar gur pa dge slong ma rnams kyis | dge slong rnams la smras pa dang | dge slong dag gis | bcom ldan 'das la gsol nas | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | ci khyod kyis dga' bar tshor ram | btsun pa bdag 'gres | ldogs | sug pa g-yabs na dga' bar lta ga la tshor zhes gsol ba dang | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | dge slong dag bud med kyi mo mtshan gyi phyogs ni las rnam par smin pa las skyes te | 'gro ba dang | ldog ba dang | lag pa g-yob pa la ni nan gyis bzung ba zhes bya ste | nan gyis bzung ba la ni nyes pa med do ||

[74] *Dhanī the nun is captured by rogues, violated, and abandoned in jungle, then driven out of nunnery when she returns: no offence for one captured by force

(84) dge slong ma nor can mo zhes bya ba zhig mnyan du yod par bsod snyoms spyod pa na | g-yon can rnams kyis bzung ste nags stug por khrid nas sun phyung ste btang ba dang | de dge slong ma dag gis gnas nas bskrad nas | 'phags

Shisonglü

179

何不受。是比丘尼不知云何。以是 事白佛。佛知而故問是比丘尼。汝 實受細滑不。答言。世尊。我云何 當受。我覺是細滑。如熱鐵入身。 佛言。汝若無受細滑心無罪。爾時 佛語諸比丘尼。汝等勿復說是跋陀 迦毘羅事。女人業報因緣故得是女 根。他人強行婬。若比丘尼他人強 捉行婬。無受欲心無罪。

[73] *Sujātā the nun is captured by rogues, gagged, violated, and abandoned in jungle, then driven out of nunnery when she returns: no offence for one captured by force

(81) 修闍多比丘尼為弊惡人所捉。 掩覆其口。將入曠野中。污已捨 去。此比丘尼還所住處。諸比丘尼 驅出不容。彼答言。我不受樂。諸 人問言。云何不受樂弊惡人將汝至 曠野中污汝。已便去。以是因緣。 諸比丘尼向諸比丘說。諸比丘向佛 廣說。佛問。汝受樂不。答言不受 樂。展轉身掉手掉臂不能得脫。佛 言。諸比丘當知。此是宿業報。報 得女身。身根少分展轉者力捉。掉 臂者力捉。力捉者不犯。 (36)有比丘尼。名善生。端正可愛 能動人心。迦毘羅緊度。先不語直 來摩觸是比丘尼。比丘尼驅出。驅 出已心生疑悔。我將無得波羅夷 耶。以是事白佛。佛言。無受欲心 無罪。

[74] *Dhanī the nun is captured by rogues, violated, and abandoned in jungle, then driven out of nunnery when she returns: no offence for one captured by force

(82) 檀尼比丘尼入舍衛城乞食如前	(37) 7
說。乃至佛言。汝受樂不。答言不	能動
受樂。我以啼哭大喚。復言。莫捉	國乞食

(37)有比丘尼。名陀尼。端正可愛 能動人心。中前著衣持鉢欲入舍衛 國乞食。道中有諸博掩人。將入深

ma bdag gis dga' bar ma tshor ro zhes smras pa dang | khyod g-yon can rnams kyis bcings te nags stug por khrid nas sun phyung ste btang ba yin na | ci'i phyir dga' bar ma tshor | de ltar gyur pa dge slong ma dag gis | dge slong dag la smras pa dang | dge slong dag gis kyang | bcom ldan 'das la gsol nas | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | ci khyod kyis dga' bar tshor ram | btsun pa bdag gis dus nas bos 'grogs te | bdag la ma 'dzin cig ces smras na | dga' bar lta gal tshor | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | bud med kyi **[411a]** mo mtshan gyi phyogs ni las rnam par smin pa las skyes te | du bzhin pa ni nan gyis bzung ba zhes bya'o || bos 'grogs nas bdag la ma 'dzin cig ces smra ba ni nan gyis bzung ba zhes bya

[75] A nun (Pho brang skyong) who is captured by rogues, violated, and abandoned in jungle is then driven out of nunnery when she returns: no offence for one captured by force

(85) dge slong ma pho brang skyong zhes bya ba zhig mnyan du yod par bsod snyoms spyod pa na | g-yon can rnams kyis bzung ste nags stug por khrid nas sun phyung ste btang ba la | de dge slong ma dag gis kyang gnas nas bskrad pa dang | des smras pa | bdag gis dga' bar ni ma tshor ro || 'o na kun dga' bo'i drung du song zhig ces smras nas | de de'i drung du song ba dang | gnas brtan gyis kyang mthong nas des gus pa'i tshig tu ma smras pa dang | gnas brtan gyis kyang bskrad nas | de 'di snyam du bdag 'di 'dra bar 'tsho zhing 'dug pa bas | song la bum pa bye mas bkang ba mgul tu btags te | klung a dzi ra ba tir mchong ngo snyam du bsams nas | des bum pa bye mas bkang ba mgul du btags te | klung a dzi ra ba tir mchongs pa dang | tha gu ngan pa zhig pas chad de bying zhing nub pa g-yon can rnams kyis mthong nas | de dag gis phyung ste bzhag nas | nam 'du shes slar rnyed pa dang | de la sun 'byin to || dge slong ma dag kyang tshol zhing gnas der lhags pa dang | de dag gis de la sun 'byin par mthong nas | des smras pa | 'di sngon ni dge slong ma vin na | da dung vang dge slong ma yin nam zhes smras nas | de ltar gyur pa dge slong rnams [411b] la smras pa dang | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | ci khyod kyis dga' bar tshor ram | btsun pa 'gres | ldogs | sug pa g-yabs | bdag la ma 'dzin cig ces smras na

我。乃至佛言。力捉者不犯。

Shisonglü

林中。強共行婬。諸比丘尼驅令出 坊。作是言。汝是行婬人不應住 此。是比丘尼言。我無心受細滑。 諸比丘尼言。諸博掩人將汝到深林 中行婬。云何不受。是比丘尼不知 云何。以是事白佛。佛知故問。汝 實受細滑不。答言。世尊我云何 受。我以手推脚蹋轉身。不能得 脫。佛言。若無心不受無罪。佛語 諸比丘尼言。汝等勿復說是比丘尼 事。是比丘尼手推脚蹋轉身不受。 為他強捉無罪。

[75] A nun (Luozha 羅咤; Shouyuan 守園) who is captured by rogues, violated, and abandoned in jungle is then driven out of nunnery when she returns: no offence for one captured by force

(83) 羅咤比丘尼入舍衛城乞食廣說 如前。諸比丘語是比丘尼。汝受樂 不。答言不受樂。汝往問阿梨難陀 去。尊者難陀廣問是事。此尼敬彼 故。不說。難陀呵責此比丘尼。是 比丘尼自念。何用如是受生。我當 以瓶繫頸沒水取死。即便作繩繫 瓶連頸沒深水中。繩不堅斷出沒 水中。弊惡人見入水挽出。倒懸去 水。還得穌息。即共作婬。諸比丘 尼求覓到彼。見彼作婬。諸比丘尼 語此尼言。汝本不受樂。今復不受 樂耶。乃至佛言。汝受樂不。答言 不受樂。我展轉如前說。乃至力捉 者不犯。

(38)有比丘尼。名守園。中前著衣 持鉢行乞食。有諸博掩人。牽入深 林中。強為婬欲。諸比丘尼驅令出 坊。是比丘尼言。諸善女。我無心 受細滑。諸比丘尼言。諸博掩人牽 汝入深林中作婬欲。云何不受。是 時阿難在比丘尼坊中。諸比丘尼語 言。阿難在此。阿難問。是比丘 尼。敬畏阿難故不能答。阿難嫌其 不答。是比丘尼心念。諸比丘尼驅 我出坊。長老阿難復嫌我。我用活 為。今當至阿耆羅婆河自投而死。 是比丘尼盛滿瓶沙。自繫其頸沈於 水中。沙瓶繩斷身或浮沒。爾時諸 博掩人遊戲岸邊。見已相語。汝看 是比丘尼。為水所漂浮。往取來。 即共出之。扶著岸邊。水出得穌。

| dga' ba lta ga la tshor | bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa | dge slong dag bud med kyi mo mtshan gyi phyogs ni las rnam par smin pa las skyes te | 'gre ba ni nan gyis bzung ba zhes bya ba nas | bdag la ma 'dzin cig ces smra ba ni nan gyis bzung ba zhes bya ba'i bar du rgyas par te | nan gyis bzung ba la ni nyes pa med do || ||

[Pārājika 1 ends]

Shisonglü

183

將入深林共作婬欲。還來入坊。諸 比丘尼復驅出言。汝先言無心受細 滑。今博掩人將汝入深林中作婬已 放來。是比丘尼不知云何。以是事 白佛。佛知故問比丘尼言。汝有心 受細滑不。答言。世尊。我云何 受。我啼哭大喚。語言莫作。不能 得脫。佛言。汝若無心受細滑無 罪。佛語諸比丘尼言。汝等勿復說 是比丘尼事。女人以先世業因緣 故。得是女根。不得自在。雖啼哭 亦強捉。雖言莫作亦強作。雖大喚 亦強作。若比丘尼。為他強捉。無 受欲心無罪。

一竟。

初波羅夷竟。

Abbreviations

BD	The Book of the Discipline (Horner [1938-1966] 1996-1997)
Chi.	Chinese
KP	Kieffer-Pülz
MSV	Mūlasarvāstivāda-vinaya
Р	Peking
Pā	Pārājika
PCV	Private Collection, Virginia
Sa	Sanghāvaśeṣa
SHT	Berlin Turfan Collection
Skt.	Sanskrit
sTog	The Tog Palace Manuscript of the Tibetan Kanjur
Т.	Taishō shinshū daizōkyō 大正新脩大藏經(Takakusu and
	Watanabe 1924-1935)
Tib.	Tibetan
Vin	<i>The Vinaya Pitakam</i> (Oldenberg [1879–1883] 1969–1982)
VS	Vinayasūtra
VSA	Vinayasūtra Autocommentary
VSPVSG	Vinayasūtra's Pravrajyāvastu Study Group
VSSMsB	Vinayasūtravrttyabhidhānasvavyākhyāna. Guņaprabha's auto-
	commentary to his Vinayasūtra. Sanskrit manuscript preserved
	in dBu med script, published by VSPVSG at Taishō University.

Works Cited

Primary Sources (Premodern Japanese works only)

Anon. Risshō kōroku 律摂講錄. 3 vols. Held at Ryūkoku University.

Gakunyo 學如 (1716-1773). Setsuissaiu-bu risshō 説一切有部律攝 (1764). Annotated edition of Yijing's 義 淨 (635-713) translation of the Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinayasaṃgraha. 5 vols. Held at Ryūkoku Universi-

- Gyōnen 凝然 (1240-1321). Un'ushō 雲雨鈔 (1276) in Dainihon bukkyō zensho 大日本佛教全書, vol. 105, 45-50. Tokyo: Meicho fukyūkai 名著 普及会, 1979.
- Ryūkai 龍海 (1756-1820). Daranishū shogaku ubu ritsugi 陀羅尼宗所學有部 律義 (1793). Microfilm available from Kokubungaku Kenkyū Shiryōkan 国文学研究資料館.

Secondary Sources

- Bapat, P. V., and V. V. Gokhale. 1982. Vinaya-sūtra and Auto-Commentary on the Same by Gunaprabha: Chapter I—Pravrajyā-vastu, compared with the Tibetan version and edited. Tibetan Sanskrit Works Series, 22, Patna: Kashi Prasad Jayaswal Research Institute.
- Bareau, André. [1955] 2013. The Buddhist Schools of the Small Vehicle. Translated from the French (Les sectes bouddhiques du petit véhicule, Paris) by Sara Boin-Webb; edited by Andrew Skilton. Honolulu: Hawai'i U. P.
- Cabezón, José Ignacio. 1993. "Homosexuality and Buddhism." In *Homosexuality and World Religions*, edited by Arlene Swidler, 81–101. Valley Forge, PA: Trinity Press International.
- Cabezón, José Ignacio. forthcoming. *Sexuality in South Asian Buddhism*. Boston: Wisdom Publications (unseen).
- Chung, Jin-il. 2002. "Sanskrit-Fragmente des sogenannten Daśādhyāyavinaya aus Zentralasien: eine vorläufige Auflistung." In Sanskrit-Texte aus dem buddhistischen Kanon: Neuentdeckungen und Neueditionen IV, edited by Jin-il Chung, Claus Vogel, and Klaus Wille, 77–104. Sanskrit-Wörterbuch der buddhistischen Texte aus den Turfan-Funden. Suppl. 9. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht.
- Clarke, Shayne. 2001. "The Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya Muktaka 根本說一切 有部目得迦." Bukkyō kenkyū 仏教研究 [Buddhist Studies] 30: 81-107.

- Clarke, Shayne. 2002. "The Mūlasarvāstivādin Vinaya: A Brief Reconnaissance Report." In Sakurabe Hajime hakushi kiju kinen ronshū: shoki bukkyō kara abidaruma e 櫻部建博士喜寿記念論集・初期仏教からア ビダルマへ [Early Buddhism and Abhidharma Thought: In Honor of Doctor Hajime Sakurabe on His Seventy-seventh Birthday], ed. Sakurabe Hajime Hakushi Kiju Kinen Ronshū Kankōkai 櫻部建博士喜 寿記念論集刊行会, 45-63. Kyoto: Heirakuji shoten 平樂寺書店.
- Clarke, Shayne. 2004. "Vinaya Mātrkā—Mother of the Monastic Codes, or Just Another Set of Lists? A Response to Frauwallner's Handling of the Mahāsāmghika Vinaya." Indo-Iranian Journal 47 (2), 77–120.
- Clarke, Shayne. 2006. "Miscellaneous Musings on Mūlasarvāstivāda Monks: The Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya Revival in Tokugawa Japan." Japanese Journal of Religious Studies 33 (1), 1–49.
- Clarke, Shayne. 2009a. "Monks Who Have Sex: *Pārājika* Penance in Indian Buddhist Monasticisms." *Journal of Indian Philosophy* 37 (1), 1-43.
- Clarke, Shayne. 2009b. "When and Where is a Monk No Longer a Monk? On Communion and Communities in Indian Buddhist Monastic Law Codes." *Indo-Iranian Journal* 52 (2/3), 115–141.
- Clarke, Shayne. 2014. Family Matters in Indian Buddhist Monasticisms. Honolulu: Hawai'i U. P.
- Clarke, Shayne. 2015. "Vinayas." In *Brill's Encyclopedia of Buddhism*, edited by Jonathan A. Silk, vol. 1, 60–87. Leiden: Brill.
- Demiéville, P. 1951. "A Propos du Concile de Vaiśālī." *T'oung Pao* 40, 239-296.
- Enomoto Fumio 榎本文雄. 1998. "'Konponsetsuissaiu-bu' to 'setsuissaiu-bu' 「根本説一切有部」と「説一切有部」." *Indogaku bukkyōgaku kenkyū* 印度學佛教學研究 [Journal of Indian and Buddhist Studies] 47 (1), 111-119.
- Enomoto, Fumio. 2000. "'Mūlasarvāstivādin' and 'Sarvāstivādin'." In Vividharatnakaraņḍaka: Festgabe für Adelheid Mette, edited by

Christine Chojnacki, Jens-Uwe Hartmann, and Volker M. Tschannerl, 239–250. Indica et Tibetica 37. Swisttal-Odendorf: Indica et Tibetica.

- Faure, Bernard. 1998. *The Red Thread: Buddhist Approaches to Sexuality*. Princeton, N. J.: Princeton U. P.
- Formigatti, Camillo Alessio. 2009. "The Story of Sundarī and Nanda in the Mūlasarvāstivādavinaya." In Pāsādikadānam: Festschrift für Bhikkhu Pāsādika, edited by Martin Straube, Roland Steiner, Jayandra Soni, Michael Hahn, and Mitsuyo Demoto, 129–155. Indica et Tibetica 52. Marburg: Indica et Tibetica.
- Frauwallner, Erich. 1956. *The Earliest Vinaya and the Beginnings of Buddhist Literature*. Rome: Istituto Italiano per il Medio ed Estremo Oriente.
- Funayama Tōru 船山徹. 2013. Butten wa dō kan'yaku sareta no ka 仏典はど う漢訳されたのか [Making Sutras into 'Classics' (*jingdian*): How Buddhist Scriptures Were Translated into Chinese]. Tokyo: Iwanami shoten 岩波書店.
- Hakamaya Noriaki 袴谷憲昭. 2011. "10 shu upasampad(ā) to kaitai no mondai 10 種 upasampad(ā) と戒体の問題." *Komazawa daigaku bukkyōgakubu kenkyū kiyō* 駒澤大學佛教學部研究紀要 [Journal of the Faculty of Buddhism, Komazawa University], 69, 1-45.
- Hartmann, Jens-Uwe, and Klaus Wille. 2014. "The Manuscript of the Dīrghāgama and the Private Collection in Virginia." In From Birch Bark to Digital Data: Recent Advances in Buddhist Manuscript Research (Papers Presented at the Conference Indic Buddhist Manuscripts: The State of the Field, Stanford, June 15-19 2009), edited by Paul Harrison, and Jens-Uwe Hartmann, 137–155. Österreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften, Philosophisch-Historische Klasse, Denkschriften 460; Beiträge zur Kultur-und Geistesgeschichte Asiens 80. Wien: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften.

- Hinüber, Oskar von. 1996. *A Handbook of Pāli Literature*. Berlin & New York: Walter de Gruyter.
- Hirakawa Akira 平川彰. [1960] 1999-2000. *Ritsuzō no kenkyū* 律蔵の研究. Hirakawa Akira chosakushū 平川彰著作集, 9-10. 1 vol. republished as 2 vols. Tokyo: Shunjūsha 春秋社.
- Hirakawa, Akira. 1982. Monastic Discipline for the Buddhist Nuns: An English Translation of the Chinese Text of the Mahāsāmghika-Bhikşuņī-Vinaya. Tibetan Sanskrit Works Series 21. Patna: Kashi Prasad Jayaswal Research Institute.
- Horner, Isaline Blew, trans. [1938-1966] 1996-1997. The Book of the Discipline. Sacred Books of the Buddhists. 6 vols. London: The Pali Text Society.
- Huxley, Andrew. 1999. "Buddhist Case Law on Theft: The *Vinitavatthu* on the Second *Pārājika*." *Journal of Buddhist Ethics* 6, 313-330.
- Iwamoto Yutaka 岩本裕. 1988. "Sarvāstivādin (setsuissaiu-bu) to Mūlasarvāstivādin (konponsetsuissaiu-bu): Śroņakoțikarņa no densetsu o tēma ni shite Sarvāstivādin (説一切有部) と Mūlasarvāstivādin (根 本説一切有部)—Śroņakoțikarņa の伝説をテーマにして." In *Iwamoto Yutaka chosakushū* 岩本裕著作集, vol. 1, 126-136. Kyoto: Dōhōsha 同 朋舍.
- Kamata Shigeo 鎌田茂雄, and Kawamura Kōshō 河村孝照 et al. eds. 1998. Daizōkyō zenkaisetsu daijiten 大藏経全解説大事典. Yūzankaku shuppan 雄山閣出版.
- Kieffer-Pülz, Petra. 2001. "Pārājika 1 and Sanghādisesa 1: Hitherto Untranslated Passages from the Vinayapitaka of the Theravādins." Traditional South Asian Medicine 6, 62–84. Now reprinted in vol. 1 of Horner's translation of the Book of the Discipline (2014), pp. 349–373.
- Kieffer-Pülz, Petra. 2012. "The Law of Theft: Regulations in the Theravada Vinaya and the Law Commentaries." *Journal of the Pali Text Society* 31, 1–56.

- Kieffer-Pülz, Petra. 2014. "What the Vinayas Can Tell Us about Law." In Buddhism and Law: An Introduction, edited by Rebecca French and Mark A. Nathan, 46–62. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Kishino Ryōji 岸野亮示. 2006. "Futatsu no "Uttaraguranta" ('Upāri mondō' no kōsatsu) 2 つの『ウッタラグランタ』(「ウパーリ問答」の考察)." *Indogaku bukkyōgaku kenkyū* 印度學佛教學研究 [Journal of Indian and Buddhist Studies] 55 (1), 128-131.
- Kishino Ryōji 岸野亮示. 2008. "Satsubatabu bini matoroka' wa 'Jūjuritsu' no chūshakusho ka? 『薩婆多部毘尼摩得勒伽』は『十誦律』の注釈書か?" *Indogaku bukkyōgaku kenkyū* 印度學佛教學研究 [Journal of Indian and Buddhist Studies] 56 (2), 183-186.
- Kishino, Ryōji. 2013. "A Study of the *Nidāna*: An Underrated *Canonical* Text of the *Mūlasarvāstivāda-vinaya*." PhD dissertation, UCLA.
- Kishino, Ryōji. 2016. "A Further Study of the *Muktaka* of the *Mūlasarvāstivāda-vinaya*: A Table of Contents and Parallels." *Bukkyō daigaku bukkyōgakkai kiyō* 佛教大学仏教学会紀要 [The Bulletin of the Association of Buddhist Studies, Bukkyo University] 21, 227-283.
- Lamotte, Étienne. [1944] 1981. Le traité de la grande vertu de sagesse de Nāgārjuna (Mahāprajnāpāramitāsāstra). Vol. 1. Publications de l'Institut Orientaliste de Louvain 25. Louvain-la-neuve: Université de Louvain, Institut Orientaliste.
- Lamotte, Étienne. [1958]. 1988. *History of Indian Buddhism: From the Origins to the Śaka Era*. Translated by Sara Webb-Boin. Publications de l'Institut Orientaliste de Louvain 36. Louvain-Paris: Peeters Press.
- Langenberg, Amy Paris. 2015. "Sex and Sexuality in Buddhism: A Tetralemma." *Religion Compass* 9, 277–286.
- Matsumoto Bunzaburō 松本文三郎. 1922. "Hachijūbu no ritsu ni tsuite 八十 部の律に就いて." *Bukkyō kenkyū* 佛教研究 [Buddhist Studies] 3 (1), 31-47.
- Nakagawa, Masanori. 1987a. "Vinayasūtravrtti of Guņaprabha-Pārājikam

(1)." *Nanto bukkyō* 南都佛教 [Journal of the Nanto Society for Buddhist Studies] 57, 50-69.

- Nakagawa Masanori 中川正法. 1987b. "Vinayasūtra ni okeru harai-hō inkai (II) Vinayasūtra における波羅夷法婬戒 (II)." *Indogaku bukkyōgaku kenkyū* 印度學佛教學研究 [Journal of Indian and Buddhist Studies] 36 (1), 80-83.
- Nakagawa Masanori 中川正法. 1991a. ""Ritsukyō" dai-ichi harai no kōsei to ronten 『律経』第一波羅夷の構成と論点." In *Bukkyō bunkagaku ronshū: Maeda Egaku hakushi shōju kinen* 仏教文化学論集・前田恵 学博士頌寿記念, edited by Maeda Egaku Hakushi Shōju Kinenkai 前 田恵学博士頌寿記念会, 333-347. Tokyo: Sankibō busshorin 山喜房仏 書林.
- Nakagawa, Masanori. 1991b. "Vinayasūtravrtti of Guņaprabha—Pārājikam (2)." In *Ihara Shōren hakushi koki kinen ronbunshū* 伊原照蓮博士古稀 記念論文集, edited by Ihara Shōren Hakushi Koki Kinenkai 伊原照蓮 博士古稀記念会, 251-274. Fukuoka: Ihara Shōren Hakushi Koki Kinenkai 伊原照蓮博士古稀記念会.
- Nakagawa Masanori 中川正法. 1991c. ""Ritsukyō" ni miru sokunyo gakusho 『律経』にみる触女学処." *Nippon bukkyō gakkai nenpō*日本仏教学会 年報 [Journal of the Nippon Buddhist Research Association] 56, 43-54.
- Nakagawa, Masanori. 1996. "The text of the Adattādāna-pārājikam in the Vinayasūtravṛtti." *Chikushi Jogakuen tankidaigaku kiyō* 筑紫女学園 短期大学紀要 [Journal of Chikushi Jogakuen Junior College] 31, 19-25.
- Nakagawa, Masanori. 1998. "On Pārājikam in the Vinayasūtravṛtti." *Chikushi Jogakuen tankidaigaku kiyō* 筑紫女学園短期大学紀要 [Journal of Chikushi Jogakuen Junior College] 33, 169-177.
- Nakagawa, Masanori. 2000a. "The text of the Adattādāna-pārājikam in the Vinayasūtravrtti (2)." In *Indo no bunka to ronri: Tosaki Hiromasa*

hakushi koki kinen ronbunshū インドの文化と論理・戸崎宏正博士古稀記念論文集, edited by Akamatsu Akihiko 赤松明彦, 173-179. Fukuoka: Kyūshū daigaku shuppankai 九州大学出版会.

- Nakagawa, Masanori. 2000b. "On the Adattādāna-pārājikam in the Vinayasūtravrtti: Transcription text on the sūtras no. 120~123." *Indogaku bukkyōgaku kenkyū* 印度學佛教學研究 [Journal of Indian and Buddhist Studies] 48 (2), 18-20.
- Nakagawa Masanori 中川正法. 2002. "Vinayasūtra ni okeru harai-hō tōkai (IV) Vinayasūtra における波羅夷法盗戒 (IV)." In *Sakurabe Hajime hakushi kiju kinen ronshū: shoki bukkyō kara abidaruma e* 櫻部建博士 喜寿記念論集・初期仏教からアビダルマへ [Early Buddhism and Abhidharma Thought: In Honor of Doctor Hajime Sakurabe on His Seventy-seventh Birthday], edited by Sakurabe Hajime Hakushi Kiju Kinen Ronshū Kankōkai 櫻部建博士喜寿記念論集刊行会, 233-240. Kyoto: Heirakuji shoten 平樂寺書店.
- Nakamura, Hajime. 1980. *Indian Buddhism: A Survey with Bibliographical Notes*. Hirakata, Japan: KUFS Publication. Reprint: Motilal Banarsidass.
- Nanjio, Bunyiu. 1883. A Catalogue of the Chinese Translation of the Buddhist Tripitaka: The Sacred Canon of the Buddhists in China and Japan. Oxford: The Clarendon Press. Reprint, San Francisco: Chinese Materials Center, Inc., 1975.
- Nishimoto Ryūzan 西本龍山. 1955. Shibun-ritsu biku-kaihon kōsan 四分律比 丘戒本講讚. Kyoto: Ango jimusho 安居事務所.
- Oldenberg, Hermann, ed. [1879–1883] 1969–1982. The Vinaya Piṭakam: One of the Principal Buddhist Holy Scriptures in the Pāli Language. 5 vols. London: The Pali Text Society.
- Ono Genmyō小野玄妙. 1930-1932. Bussho kaisetsu daijiten 佛書解説大辭典. 11 vols., with supplements (vols. 12-13) edited by Maruyama Takao 丸山孝雄 (1974-1977), an additional volume 別巻 (vol. 14) entitled

Bukkyō kyōten sōron 佛教經典總論 by Ono Genmyō (1936), and an author-title index Choshabetsu shomei mokuroku 著者別書名目錄 (1988). First 13 vols. now republished in a one vol. format. Tokyo: Daitō shuppan 大東出版.

- Pagel, Ulrich. 2014. Buddhist Monks in Tax Disputes: Monastic Attitudes towards Revenue Collection in Ancient India. Napoli: Università degli studi di Napoli "L'Orientale": Centro di Studi sul Buddhismo.
- Pandita. 2012. "Intellectual Property in Early Buddhism: A Legal and Cultural Perspective." *Journal of Buddhist Ethics* 19, 596–625.
- Perera, L. P. N. 1993. Sexuality in Ancient India: A Study based on the Pali Vinayapitaka. [Kelaniya?]: The Postgraduate Institute of Pali and Buddhist Studies, University of Kelaniya, Sri Lanka.
- Pruden, Leo M. 1995. "The Essentials of the Vinaya Tradition by Gyōnen. Translated from the Japanese (Taishō, Volume 74, Number 2348)." In *BDK English Tripițaka* 97, 1–164. Berkeley: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research.
- Roth, Gustav, ed. [1970] 2005. Bhikşunī-Vinaya: Including Bhikşunī-Prakīrņaka and a Summary of the Bhikşu-Prakīrṇaka of the Ārya-Mahāsāmghika-Lokottaravādin. Tibetan Sanskrit Works Series 12. Second edition, containing edition of missing folio [71b] and various addenda. Patna: Kashi Prasad Jayaswal Research Institute.
- Sander, Lore, and Ernst Waldschmidt, eds. 1985. Sanskrithandschriften aus den Turfanfunden. Verzeichnis der orientalischen Handschriften in Deutschland 10, bk. 5. Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag.
- Sankrityayana, Rahul. 1981. *Vinayasūtra of Bhadanta Guṇaprabha*. Singhi Jain Śāstra Śikṣāpītha Singhi Jain Series 74. Bombay: Bharatiya Vidya Bhavan.
- Sasaki Kyōgo 佐々木教悟. 1976. "*Risshō* no kyōjo ni tsuite 律摂の経序につ いて." In *Okuda Jiō sensei kiju kinen: Bukkyō shisō ronshū* 奥田慈應先 生喜寿記念・仏教思想論集, edited by Okuda Jiō Sensei Kiju Kinen

Ronbunshū Kankōkai 奧田慈應先生喜寿記念論文集刊行会, 987-1000. Kyoto: Heirakuji Shoten 平楽寺書店.

- Sasaki Kyōgo 佐々木教悟. 1977. "Konpon satsubata-bu risshō ni tsuite 根本 薩婆多部律摂について." Indogaku bukkyōgaku kenkyū 印度學佛教學 研究 [Journal of Indian and Buddhist Studies] 25 (2), 587-594.
- Sasaki Shizuka 佐々木閑. 1992. "'Makasōgi-ritsu' bakko-hō: Igihō naiyō ichiran 『摩訶僧祇律』 跋渠法 · 威儀法内容一覧." Hanazono daigaku kenkyū kiyō 花園大学研究紀要 [The Annual Report of Hanazono College] 24, 1-26.
- Sasaki, Shizuka. 1994. "Buddhist Sects in the Asoka Period (4): The Structure of the Mahāsāṃghika Vinaya." *Bukkyō kenkyū* 佛教研究 [Buddhist Studies] 23, 55-100.
- Sasaki Shizuka 佐々木閑. 2000. Indo bukkyō hen'i ron: naze bukkyō wa tayōka shita no ka インド仏教変移論・なぜ仏教は多様化したのか. Tokyo: Daizō shuppan 大蔵出版.
- Satō Mitsuo 佐藤密雄, trans. 1936. "Sappata-bu bini matoroka 薩婆多部毘尼 摩得勒伽." In Ritsu-bu 律部, vol. 16, 69-316, of Kokuyaku issaikyō 國譯 一切經. Tokyo: Daitō shuppansha 大東出版社.
- Schopen, Gregory. [1994] 2004. "Ritual Rights and Bones of Contention: More on Monastic Funerals and Relics in the Mūlasarvāstivādavinaya." In Buddhist Monks and Business Matters: Still More Papers on Monastic Buddhism in India, 285–328. Honolulu: Hawai'i U. P.
- Schopen, Gregory. [1999] 2005. "The Bones of a Buddha and the Business of a Monk: Conservative Monastic Values in an Early Mahāyāna Polemical Tract." In *Figments and Fragments of Mahāyāna Buddhism in India: More Collected Papers*, 63–107. Honolulu: Hawai'i U. P.
- Shaku Keihō 釋啓峰. 1939. "'Konponsetsuissaiu-bu risshō' josetsu 『根本説一 切有部律攝』序説." Mikkyō kenkyū 密教研究 [Esoteric Studies] 69, 18-36.

Shaku Keihō 釋啓峰. 1940. "Ubu risshō gaisetsu 有部律攝概説." Mikkyō

kenkyū 密教研究 72 [Esoteric Studies], 48-69.

- Shimoda Masahiro 下田正弘. 1993. Zōbun wayaku "Daijō nehangyō" (I) 蔵 文和訳『大乘涅槃経』 (I). Tokyo: Sankibō Press.
- Silk, Jonathan A. 2008. Managing Monks: Administrators and Administrative Roles in Indian Buddhist Monasticism. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Takakusu, Junjirō. 1896. A Record of The Buddhist Religion as Practised in India and the Malay Archipelago (A. D. 671–695) by I-Tsing. Oxford: The Clarendon Press.
- Takakusu Junjirō 高楠順次郎, and Watanabe Kaikyoku 渡邊海旭, eds. 1924-1935. *Taishō shinshū daizōkyō* 大正新脩大藏經. 100 vols. Tokyo: Taishō issaikyō kankōkai 大正一切經刊行會.
- Tamayama Ryūen 玉山隆莚. 1940. *Ubu risshō kōjutsu narabi ni shamikaikyō* 有部律攝講述并沙彌戒經. Kōyasan: Shin bessho Entsūji 眞別處 圓通寺.
- Teramoto Enga 寺本婉雅. 1928. *Tāranātha Indo bukkyōshi タ*ーラナーダ 印度佛教史. Tokyo: Heigo shuppansha 丙午出版社.
- Tokuda Myōhon 徳田明本. 1974. *Risshū bunken mokuroku* 律宗文献目録. Kyoto: Hyakkaen 百華苑.
- Tokuoka Ryōei 徳岡亮英. 1960. "Indo bukkyō ni okeru buha no seiritsu ni tsuite: Furauwarunā no kincho o yonde 印度仏教における部派の成立 について・フラウワルナーの近著を読んで." *Ōtani gakuhō* 大谷學報 [Journal of Buddhist Studies and Humanities, Ōtani University] 40 (3), 43-69.
- Tokuoka, Ryōei. 1968. A Catalogue of the Lha-Sa Edition of the Bkaḥ-Hgyur of Tibetan Tripitaka: With Sanskrit Restoration in Detail. Patna: Nava Nalanda Mahavihara.
- Tsukamoto Keishō 塚本啓祥. [1966] 1980. Shoki bukkyō kyōdanshi no kenkyū: buha no keisei ni kansuru bunkateki kōsatsu 初期佛教教團史 の研究・部派の形成に關する文化的考察. Revised and enlarged edi-

tion 改訂增補. Tokyo: Sankibō busshorin 山喜房佛書林.

- Ueda Tenzui 上田天瑞. 1932. "Ubu-ritsu ni tsuite 有部律について." *Mikkyō kenkyū* 密教研究 [Esoteric Studies] 46, 1-24.
- Ueda Tenzui 上田天瑞, trans. 1933-1934. "*Jūju ritsu* 十誦律." *Ritsu-bu* 律部, 5-7 of *Kokuyaku issaikyō* 國譯一切經. Tokyo: Daitō shuppansha 大東 出版社.
- Ueda Tenzui 上田天瑞. 1939. "Myōzui wajō to ubu-ritsu 妙瑞和尚と有部律." Mikkyō kenkyū 密教研究 [Esoteric Studies] 69, 1-17.
- Ueda Tenzui 上田天瑞. 1976. Kairitsu no shisō to rekishi 戒律の思想と歴史. Wakayama, Kōyachō 高野町: Mikkyō bunka kenkyūjo 密教文化研究 所.
- Vinayasūtra's Pravrajyāvastu Study Group. no date. "The Digital Data of Preliminary Transliteration of the Vinayasūtra." http://www.tais.ac. jp/wp/wp-content/uploads/2015/07/vinayasutra_trlt.pdf.
- Vinayasūtra's Pravrajyāvastu Study Group ["Ritsukyō" 'Shukkeji' Kenkyūkai 『律 経』「出家事」研究会]. 2007. ""Ritsukyō" 'Shukkeji' no kenkyū (4) 『律経』「出家事」の研究 (4) [A Study of the *Pravrajyā*vastu (section) of the *Vinayasūtra* and its *Vṛtti*]." *Taishō daigaku sōgō* bukkyō kenkyūsho nenpō 大正大学綜合佛教研究所年報 29, 26-65.
- Vinayasūtra's Pravrajyāvastu Study Group ["Ritsukyō" 'Shukkeji' Kenkyūkai 『律経』「出家事」研究会]. 2012. ""Ritsukyō" 'Shukkeji' no kenkyū (8) 『律経』「出家事」の研究 (8) [A Study of the *Pravrajyā*vastu (section) of the *Vinayasūtra* and its *Vṛtti*]." *Taishō daigaku sōgō* bukkyō kenkyūsho nenpō 大正大学綜合佛教研究所年報 32, 29-44.
- Vogel, Claus. 1985. "Bu-ston on the Schism of the Buddhist Church and on the Doctrinal Tendencies of Buddhist Scripture." In Zur Schulzugehörigkeit von Werken der Hīnayāna-Literatur, edited by Heinz Bechert, 1: 104–110. Abhandlungen der Akademie der Wissenschaften in Göttingen, Philologisch-Historische Klasse; Folge 3, Nr. 149. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht.

- Wille, Klaus. 2004. Sanskrithandschriften aus den Turfanfunden. Verzeichnis der orientalischen Handschriften in Deutschland 10, bk. 9. Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag.
- Wynne, Alexander. 2008. "On the Sarvāstivādins and Mūlasarvāstivādins." The Indian International Journal of Buddhist Studies 9, 243–266.
- Yang Benjia 杨本加. 2012. "Genben sapoduo-bu lüshe" yanjiu 《根本萨婆多部 律摄》 研究. Beijing: Minzu chubanshe 民族出版社.
- Yao Fumi 八尾史. 2007. "Konponsetsuissaiu-bu' to iu meishō ni tsuite「根本 説一切有部」という名称について." *Indogaku bukkyōgaku kenkyū* 印 度學佛教學研究 [Journal of Indian and Buddhist Studies] 55 (2), 132– 135.
- Yao, Fumi. 2016. "A Preliminary Report on the Newly Found Sanskrit Manuscript Fragments of the *Bhaiṣajyavastu* of the Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya*." *Indo ronrigaku kenkyū* インド論理学研究 [Indian Logic] 8, 289-303.
- Yuyama, Akira. 1979. *Vinaya-Texte*. Systematische Übersicht über die buddhistische Sanskrit-Literatur 1. Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner Verlag GmbH.
- Zwilling, Leonard. 1992. "Homosexuality as Seen in Indian Buddhist Texts." In *Buddhism, Sexuality, and Gender*, edited by José Ignacio Cabezón, 203–214. Albany: SUNY Press.

Associate Professor, McMaster University Research Fellow of 2012, International Institute for Buddhist Studies