### 国際仏教学大学院大学研究紀要第 22 号 (平成 30 年)

Journal of the International College for Postgraduate Buddhist Studies Vol. XXII, 2018

# Facts or Fictions: Reconsidering Śāntideva's Names, Life, and Works

Akira Saito

## Facts or Fictions: Reconsidering Śāntideva's Names, Life, and Works

#### Akira Saito

#### I Bu-ston on Śāntideva's hagiography and related studies

Śāntideva (ca. 690–750)¹ was an Indian Buddhist monk, philosopher, and talented Sanskrit poet, who was influential in theorizing and establishing the conduct of a Mahāyāna practitioner. He is known as the author of two related works, *Bodhi*(*sattva*) *caryāvatāra*, "Entering the Bodhisattva's Way to Awakening", and Śikṣāsamuccaya, "A Compendium of Buddhist Teachings". Tibetan tradition, strictly that of dGe lugs pa, generally places him in the lineage of the \*Prāsaṅgika (Thal 'gyur ba) branch of the Mādhyamika school. His life, works, and activities at Nālandā are described in detail in several Tibetan hagiographies² as well as Vibhūticandra's commentary on the *Bodhicaryāvatāra*³.

Bu-ston's *Chos 'byung* or *History of Buddhism* (1322) speaks of the hagiography as follows: Śāntideva is known by his seven wonderful stories, viz., stories of his (1) tutelary deity, i.e., Mañjuśrī, (2) activity in Nālandā, (3) victory over the heretics in the east, (4) converting 500 adherents of the heretical teaching in the west of Magadha to Buddhism, (5) feeding

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Saito,1996b, 594. Cf. Pezzali 1982, 38–40: "ca. 685–763"; Kanakura 1965, 232–233: "ca. 691–743".

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> For Bu-ston's *Chos 'byung (History of Buddhism)*, see Lokesh Chandra 1971, Ya 13b3–15b3 and (tr.) Obermiller 1932, 161–166; for Tāranātha's *rGya gar chos 'byung (History of Buddhism in India)*, see Schiefner 1868, 125–129 and (tr.) Schiefner 1869, 163–168, Chattopadhyaya 1970, 215–219; for Sum pa mkhan po's *dPag bsam ljon bzang (History of the Rise, Progress and Downfall of Buddhism in India)*, see Chandra Das 1908, 103.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> See Pezzali 1968, 27–32, and also de Jong 1975, 168–177 who identified the text as the beginning part of Vibhūticandra's commentary.

2 Facts or Fictions: Reconsidering Śāntideva's Names, Life, and Works (Saito) thousands of beggars in that country, (6) providing help to a king in the east, and (7) victory over a heretic teacher called \*Śańkaradeva in the south<sup>4</sup>.

According to the first story<sup>5</sup>, Śāntideva was born in the southern country of \*Surāṣṭra<sup>6</sup> as a son of King \*Kalyāṇavarman (dGe ba'i go cha). He was called \*Śāntivarman (Zhi ba'i go cha) and, while still a youth, learned many different sciences. Having learned and obtained the method of conjuring up Mañjuśrī, he came to behold the deity's countenance. After his father's death, he was to be crowned king; however, in the evening just before enthronement, he beheld in a dream Mañjuśrī who, sitting on the throne, said, "My son, this seat belongs to me. I am your well-wishing friend (dGe ba'i bshes gnyen, \*kalyāṇamitra). It is by no means suitable for both I and you to sit on this single chair." Having understood the message in his dream, he fled to Nālandā and took orders with \*Jayadeva (rGyal ba'i lha). Thereafter, he became known by the name of Śāntideva (Zhi ba'i lha <\*Śāntivarman + \*Jayadeva).

In Nālandā, according to the second story above<sup>7</sup>, Śāntideva heard in his mind the doctrine from the honorable Mañjuśrī, meditated on it and composed treatises of profound meanings. However, in his external life, he was perceived by others as doing nothing else but eating, sleeping, and walking about. Hence, he was given an appellation composed of three notions<sup>8</sup>, "Bhu ( $< \sqrt{bhuj}$ , to eat)", "Su ( $< \sqrt{svap}$ , to sleep)", and "Ku (< kutim

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> See Lokesh Chandra 1971, Ya 13b3-15b3 and (tr.) Obermiller 1932, 161-166.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Lokesh Chandra 1971, Ya 13b3-7.

<sup>6</sup> Yul 'khor bzang po. Cf. Tāranātha's History of Buddhism in India, Schiefner 1868, 125.16-17: Zhi ba lha ni/ sau-raṣṭra rgyal po'i sras su sku 'khrungs, "Śāntideva was born a son of King Saurāṣṭra."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Lokesh Chandra 1971, Ya 13b7-14b1.

<sup>8</sup> phyi'i spyod lam za nyal 'gro ba ma gtogs pa gzhan gyis ma rig pas bhu su ku 'du shes gsum pa zhes grags shing (Lokesh Chandra 1971, Ya 13b7-14a1). For the meanings of "bhu" "su" "ku", cf. Obermiller 1932, 162, n.1128: "bhuj, sup (i.e. svap)

Facts or Fictions: Reconsidering Śāntideva's Names, Life, and Works (Saito) 3 gataḥ, having come to a hut/toilet<sup>9</sup>). Although the business of monks is to study the three wheels of Buddhist doctrine, he was not possessed of any of them. He was thus considered unworthy to enjoy the alms donated by the faithful and was therefore to be cast out. Thinking that if they recite the scriptures by turn he will then leave by himself, the other monks asked him to recite the scriptures. However, he answered that he was unable to do so and appealed to his preceptor. After receiving his preceptor's order to recite, he amazingly pressed down and mounted the lofty seat that the monks had erected to try him. He then asked whether he was to read that which has or that which has not been known before. They requested him to

Now, since the Śikṣāsamuccaya is too large and the Sūtrasamuccaya, "A Compendium of Buddhist Scriptures", too abridged, Śāntideva recited the Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra, which had, in condensed form, an extensive subject-matter. After he recited the thirty-fifth verse of the Wisdom chapter, which runs, "When there appears neither existence nor non-existence before his mind ...", his body rose up into the air, higher and

recite what has not been known before.

and?". For "ku", see Pezzali 1982, 30, 33 and also the following note 9. For bhu su ku 'du shes gsum pa, see Dungkar 2002, 1796: za nyal bshang ba ma gtogs glegs bam klog la sogs gzhan yang ma mthong bas 'du shes gsum pa zhes grags/, "He is known by [a nickname] composed of three notions (or names \*trayasamjñaka) because we do not see him do anything like reading books, etc., except eating, sleeping, and excreting." I owe this information to Tshul khrims skal bzang.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Cf. Pezzali 1968, 30: bhuñjāno 'pi prabhāsvaram supto 'pi kuṭim gato 'pi tad eveti bhūsuku-samādhisamāpannatvāt bhūsukunāmākhyātam/. "Même mangeant, même endormi, même quand il était allé à l'édicule, c'était resplendissant, ainsi, parce qu'il avait atteint la position psychique bhūsuku (bhūsukusamādhi) il était appelé du nom de Bhūsuku." Tibetan tr. runs: za rung nyal rung 'chags rung rgyun tu 'od gsal bsgom pas bhu su ku zhes ting nge 'dzin la gnas pa'i phyir bhu su ku zhes ming yongs su grags so// (cited by de Jong 1975, 170) with the following tr.: "..., il méditait sur la lumière sans interruption en mangeant, en dormant et en marchant. Persistant ainsi dans le samādhi appelé bhusuku, il fut connu sous le nom de Bhusuku. (Ibid., 176)"

4 Facts or Fictions: Reconsidering Śāntideva's Names, Life, and Works (Saito) higher. Finally, his body became invisible, but the voice continued to sound. After the recitation was completed, he vanished.

Thereafter, those who were possessed of good memory rehearsed the work as they had heard it. However, as there appeared different versions, i.e., of 700, 1,000, and more than 1,000 verses, there arose doubt. Furthermore, they did not understand what Śāntideva meant by saying (in the *Bodhi* (sattva) caryāvatāra 5.105–106), "The Śikṣāsamuccaya should be looked at again and again," and "Alternatively, one should first look at the condensed Sūtrasamuccaya." As someone heard that he was residing in the south, near the pagoda of \*Śrīguṇavat, two monks were sent to invite him. Having met him, they asked about these points. Śāntideva told them that the Śikṣāsamuccaya and the Sūtrasamuccaya were to be found on the beam of his school-house, written in the small characters of the Paṇḍitas. As for the Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra, it was to be the version totalling 1,000 verses. He also gave instructions on how to explain and practise those works.

In this connection, Tāranātha's *History of Indian Buddhism* (1608) also transmits a similar story. The Kashmiri people have [the text] which contains more than 1,000 śloka's and its reverential verse was made by [the author] himself. Eastern people have that which contains only 700 śloka's whose reverential verse was taken from that of the *Mūlamadhyamaka-*[kārikā] 10. Chapter of "Confession [of Sin]" and Chapter of "[Perfection of] Wisdom" are therein omitted 11. People of the Madhyadeśa have that which

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> In fact, the well-known reverential verse containing eight negations, anirodham anutpādam, etc. of Nāgārjuna's Mūlamadhyamakakārikā is borrowed and placed at the beginning of BSA-1. See Saito 2010, 20–21.

<sup>11</sup> de yang bshags le dang/ sher le chad pa yin/, "Chapter of 'Confession [of Sin]' and 'Chapter of [Perfection of] Wisdom' are therein omitted." (Schiefner 1868, 127.15–16). Compared with the contents of BSA-1, two points should be noted. First, concerning "Chapter of Confession of Sin" (*Pāpadeśanā*), i.e., Chapter 2 in the current recension (BCA and BSA-3), the word "omitted" (chad pa) does not seem to literally mean that the content of that chapter is omitted, but that the title of the chapter in

Facts or Fictions: Reconsidering Śāntideva's Names, Life, and Works (Saito) 5 contains 1,000 ślokas on a calculation of the verses which lack, however, [the author's] words of reverence or those of resolution for writing....Concerning the *Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra*, [Śāntideva] answered that the *Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra* of 1,000 ślokas is the right one.<sup>12</sup>

#### II Issues yet to be discussed

According to the two stories above, first, Śāntideva is the name given when he took orders in Nālandā, and he had two other names: \*Śāntivarman as a youth, and Bhu-su-ku as a nickname given by other monks in Nālandā. Second, he is said to have written three works, i.e., *Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra*, *Śikṣāsamuccaya*, and *Sūtrasamuccaya*. Third, concerning the *Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra*, three different versions were transmitted by those monks possessed of good memory. Of those three versions, the second story above relates that Śāntideva regarded the *Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra* of 1,000 verses as the authentic text, which accords with the above-cited Tāranātha's story.

Although slightly different accounts appear in other Tibetan hagiographies and Vibhūticandra's commentary on the *Bodhicaryāvatāra*, Buston's stories as summarized above are the most detailed. However, in the mid-1980s, the earliest short version of the *Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra* composed of a total of 702.5 verses was discovered in the Tibetan manuscripts from Dūn-huáng<sup>13</sup>, which has obliged us to reconsider at least

question is "omitted" since that chapter was originally, i.e., in BSA-1, combined with Chapter 3 as a single chapter with the title of the latter chapter "Comprehending the Thought of Awakening" (*Bodhicittaparigraha*). Second, regarding "Chapter of Perfection of Wisdom", it is most unlikely that the important chapter was in fact lacking in the text of 700 verses which corresponds most probably to BSA-1 composed of 702.5 stanzas in total.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Schiefner 1868, 127–128; tr. Schiefner 1869, 165–166, Chattopadhyaya, 1970, 218.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Stein 628, Ka1-23, and 24 (= Pelliot 794); Stein 629, Ka2, 4, 5, 14, 16-28, 32-34, 37-40 (24 leaves out of 40); St.630-I ka, kha, ga, nga, ca, cha (i.e., 1-6), comprising a

6 Facts or Fictions: Reconsidering Śāntideva's Names, Life, and Works (Saito) the above three points regarding Śāntideva's names and works.

#### III Śāntideva's names and works

#### III-1 Names

The name of the author of the early version of the *Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra* (BSA-1) was not Śāntideva, but \*Akṣayamati (Blo gros m (y) i zad pa). <sup>14</sup> The appellation "\*Akṣayamati" found in the colophons of the Tibetan manuscripts from Dūn-huáng was also attested in an anonymous commentary on the early version of the BSA-1 which, most probably, was incorporated by Bu-ston himself when he dedicated the Tibetan bsTan 'gyur "Translation of Treatises" to Zha-lu monastery in 1334<sup>15</sup>. This appellation "\*Akṣayamati" was also referred to by Atiśa Dīpaṃkaraśrījñāna in his commentary on the *Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra* and by Bu-ston in the catalogue section of his *History of Buddhism* Although whether both \*Akṣayamati and Śāntideva refer to the same person or not has yet to be fully examined sit is seems safe for us to strictly call the author of the early version "\*Akṣayamati" and the later enlarged version composed of a total of 913 stanzas in Sanskrit and Tibetan "Śāntideva".

whole text of the last chapter titled "Transfer of Merits" (Yongs su bsngo ba [=pariṇāmanā]). See also Saito 1986, 1993, 2000 and other related works by Ishida, Kajihara, Saito, and Wakahara.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> The colophon of St. 629 (Ka 40b4-5) reads: "The *Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra*, written by ācārya \*Akṣayamati, has been completed." (*Byang chub sems dpa'i spyod pa la 'jug pa//* slobs dpon Blo-gros-myi-zad-pas mdzad pa rdzogs s-ho// //)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Byang chub sems dpa'i spyod pa la 'jug pa'i rnam par bshad pa'i dka' 'grel (\*Bodhisattva-caryāvatāra-vyākhyāna-pañjikā), author and translator unknown, P No.5274, D No.3873. Also P No.5279, D No.3877 corresponds to the last two chapters of this text. See Saito 1997, 79–80.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> P No.5872, Nyo 426b2-5, Mochizuki 1999, 50; tr. Saito 1993, (21).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Lokesh Chandra 1971, Ya 59a2-4, Nishioka 1982, 53.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Saito 1993, (20)-(22), and 2002.

In this regard, it is interesting to note that Atiśa's biography titled "rNam thar rgyas pa" speaks of the ācārya \*Akṣayamati's names and merits as follows: "Furthermore, he is known by his six names, having the merits of seven wonderful stories, etc." The latter reference to \*Akṣayamati's seven wonderful stories agrees with the above-mentioned Bu-ston's explanation. Concerning the six names of \*Akṣayamati, four names have so far been attested, viz., \*Śāntivarman (Zhi ba'i go cha) as a child, Śāntideva (Zhi ba'i) lha) when he took orders, Bhu-su-ku, a nickname given by the monks at Nālandā, and \*Akṣayamati (Blo gros m(y)i zad pa), which he was called by those amazed monks when he recited the *Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra* before them.

Bu-ston and Tāranātha were silent on the very question of why the author of the BSA-1 had traditionally been called \*Akṣayamati. However, the only reference to the reason for this appellation, according to my present knowledge, is the catalogue section of the sDe dge edition (bsTan 'gyur dKar chag), where Śāntideva was called Blo gros mi zad pa (\*Aksayamati) by the audience at his recitation of the BSA-1<sup>20</sup>:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> gzhan yang mtshan drug tu grags/ ngo mtshar can gyi gtam bdun la sogs pa'i yon tan dang ldan no// (Eimer 1979, 21).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> D Shrī 79a3-5: *Byang chub sems dpa'i spyod pa la 'jug pa*'i bstan bcos chen po gsungs te/ gang tshe dngos dang dngos med dag// ces bya ba la sogs pa'i tshe bden pa bzhi'i chos nyid mngon sum gzigs shing/ 'phags pa 'Jam dpal yang mdun gyi nam mkha' la bzhugs pa skye bo mang pos mngon sum du mthong nas dad par gyur te/ skyes bu dam pa 'di ni Blo gros mi zad pa'o zhes mgrin gcig tu sgrogs so// de nas bsngo ba'i le'u gsungs pa'i tshe 'Jam dpal dang bcas nam mkha'i dbyings su 'phags te mthar mi snang bar gyur kyang/...Almost the same reference to the name "Akṣayamati" was made by Sa bzang mati Paṇchen 'Jam dbyangs blo gros, a pupil of Dol po pa Shes rab rgyal mtshan (1290–1361), in his commentary on the BSA-3 as follows: ..../ 'phags pa 'Jam dpal yang mdun gyi nam mkha' la bzhugs pa skye bo mang pos mthong nas shin tu dad par gyur te skyes bu dam pa 'di ni Blo gros mi zad pa'o zhes kyang grags so//...(Tashi Dorje 1975, 38a1-2). I owe this latest information to Perry Schmidt-Leukel.

8 Facts or Fictions: Reconsidering Śāntideva's Names, Life, and Works (Saito)

"He recited the great treatise *Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra*. When he [recited the verse:] 'When there appears neither existence nor non-existence [before his mind]' (BSA-1, 8.26a = BCA, 9.35a), the nature of fourfold truth was seen as the object of perception. Also, while directly seeing Ārya Mañjuśrī in the heaven, many people gave their faith to him and exclaimed with one voice that this excellent teacher is \*Akṣayamati" (Blo gros mi zad pa)! Then after reciting Chapter [10 titled] 'Transfer of Merits', he rose up to the region of heaven where Mañjuśrī was staying and finally he became invisible; however..."

Although this information mostly coincides with that of Bu-ston's *History of Buddhism*, the underlined part, which contains an important description about the name "\*Akṣayamati", is new to the latter text. Concerning the six names of \*Akṣayamati or Śāntideva, they might refer to "\*Śāntivarman", "Śāntideva", "Bhu", "Su", "Ku", and "\*Akṣayamati", when we are legitimately allowed to separate his nickname "Bhu-su-ku" into three names ('du shes gsum), i.e., "Bhu" (eating one), "Su" (sleeping one), and "Ku" (excreting one).

#### III-2 Works

The idea that Śāntideva composed three works, viz. Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra, Śikṣāsamuccaya, and Sūtrasamuccaya, a notion that now appears to be untenable, relies heavily on the following well-known verses of Bodhi (sattva) caryāvatāra 5.104–106: "The principles of training are seen in the sūtras. Therefore one should recite the sūtras and one should study the fundamental sins in the  $\bar{A}k\bar{a}sagarbhas\bar{u}tra$ ." (104) "The Śikṣāsamuccaya should definitely be looked at again and again, since correct conduct is therein explained in detail." (105) "Alternatively, one should first briefly look at the  $S\bar{u}trasamuccaya$  with great care, which was composed by the noble Nāgārjuna and is secondary." (106)<sup>21</sup> The belief that Śāntideva wrote

Facts or Fictions: Reconsidering Śāntideva's Names, Life, and Works (Saito) 9 these three works can be traced back to Prajňākaramati's understanding of verse 106. According to the latter, the verse reads: "Alternatively, one should first briefly look at the *Sūtrasamuccaya* and then with great care the second pair, Śikṣāsamuccaya, and Sūtrasamuccaya, composed by the noble Nāgārjuna."<sup>22</sup>

However, this interpretation is questionable since we have so far seen no trace of the existence of a  $\acute{Sik}$   $\lq$ asamuccaya written by Nāgārjuna, nor a  $\lq$ Sūtrasamuccaya by  $\lq$ Sāntideva, in Sanskrit literature or in Tibetan and Chinese translations<sup>23</sup>. Further, comparison of the early and later versions of the  $\lq$ Bodhi  $\lq$ sattva) caryāvatāra has revealed a significant fact, namely that stanza 105, which stresses the importance of the repeated study of  $\lq$ Siksāsamuccaya, is in fact a later interpolation inserted between the current verses 104 and 106<sup>24</sup>. Verse 105 quoted above was inserted by, in all probability, some unknown reviser who highly esteemed the  $\lq$ Sikṣāsamuccaya<sup>25</sup>. Without this inserted stanza, the early version runs: "The principles of training are seen in the sūtras. Therefore, one should recite the sūtras and one should at the beginning look at the  $\lq$ Akāśagarbhasūtra." "After that,

<sup>21</sup> śikṣāḥ sūtreṣu dṛṣyante tasmāt sūtraṇi vācayet/ ākāśagarbhasūtre ca mūlāpattīr nirūpayet//(104) śikṣāsamuccayo 'vaśyam draṣṭavyas tu punah punah/ vistareṇa sadācāro yasmāt tatra pradarśitaḥ//(105) samkṣepenātha vā tāvat paśyet sūtrasamuccayam/ āryanāgārjunābaddham dvitīyam ca prayatnataḥ//(106).

<sup>(</sup>Minayev 1890, La Vallée Poussin 1901–1914, 164). See also Saito 2004, 137–138. <sup>22</sup> yadi vā (,) <u>āryanāgārjunābaddham dvitīyam ca prayatnatah</u>//(106cd) <u>āryanāgārjunapādair nibaddham dvitīyam śikṣāsamuccayam sūtrasamuccayam ca paśyet prayatnatah ādaratah</u>/ (BCAP 164.11–14)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> For a brief introduction to the three works, *Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra*, Śikṣāsa-muccaya, and Sūtrasamuccaya, concerning their authors, translators, commentaries on them, quotations from and references to them, see Saito 2004, 144–145.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> See Ishida 1988 and Saito 2004.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> See Saito 2004, 140-143.

10 Facts or Fictions: Reconsidering Śāntideva's Names, Life, and Works (Saito)

one should also carefully look at the *Sūtrasamuccaya* composed by the noble Nāgārjuna since it needs looking at with great care."<sup>26</sup> Not only is the later insertion of verse 105 lacking in the early version, but the underlined parts are also different from the later and current recension of the *Bodhi*(sattva) caryāvatāra. Though problematic, Prajñākaramati's interpretation that Śāntideva composed the three works has thereafter been transmitted through Vibhūticandra to the "later diffusion" (phyi dar) of Tibetan Buddhism<sup>27</sup>. Therefore, in accordance with our present knowledge, we may safely attribute both *Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra* and Śikṣāsamuccaya to Śāntideva, whether or not being identical with \*Akṣayamati, and *Sūtrasamuccaya* to Nāgārjuna<sup>28</sup>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> For the heavy influence of Prajñākaramati on Vibhūticandra's commentary, see Ejima 1966. In this connection, it is interesting to note that the title of Bodhicaryāvatāra or Byang chub kyi spyod pa la 'jug pa, "Entering the Way to Awakening", is adopted only by both commentaries. On the other hand, all the other commentaries including the BSA-1 and BSA-3 have the title of Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra or Byang chub sems dpa'i spyod pa la 'jug pa, "Entering the Bodhisattva's Way to Awakening". Incidentally, all the Sanskrit manuscripts, counted 39 in total by Tsukamoto et al. 1990, 255–259 have Bodhicaryāvatāra.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> St. 628. Ka 10a3-4:

mdo sde rnams la bslab pa snang// de bas mdo sde klag par bya// nam mkha'i snying po'i mdo sde ni// thog ma nyid du blta bar bya// (BSA-1, 4.90; cf. BCA 5.104)

<sup>&#</sup>x27;phags pa na ga rdzu na yis// mdo rnams kun las btus pa yang// rab du 'bad de <u>blta dgos pas</u>// <u>de'i 'og du</u> blta bar bya// (BSA-1, 4.91; cf. BCA 5.106)

<sup>(\*</sup>śikṣāḥ sūtreṣu dṛṣyante tasmāt sūtrāṇi vācayet/ ākāśagarbhasūtram ca prathamato nirūpayet// saṃvyavalokanīyaṃ ca paśyet sūtrasamuccayam/ āryanāgārjunā(baddhaṃ) tataḥ paścāt prayatnataḥ//)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> See Saito 2004 and 2010.

#### III-3 On the Bodhi(sattva) caryāvatāra and the Śiksāsamuccaya

Similarly, it is also questionable that, among the three versions of the *Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra* of 700, 1,000 and more than 1,000 stanzas, Śāntideva himself regarded the *Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra* of 1,000 verses as authentic. In addition to the above inquiry into the question of the *Bodhi* (*sattva*) - *caryāvatāra* 5.104–106, recent comparative studies of the early and later versions indicate that this account appears to have been created in order to authorize the later and current version of the *Bodhi* (*sattva*) *caryāvatāra* having 913 verses in total<sup>29</sup>.

The *Bodhi*(*sattva*) *caryāvatāra* is full of aphoristic verses to be recited and remembered by a Mahāyāna practitioner<sup>30</sup>. Composed of nine chapters, or 10 in the longer version, the text mainly deals with the topics of the thought of awakening (*bodhicitta*), six perfections (*ṣaṭ-pāramitā*), and transfer of merits (*parināmanā*).

Composed of 19 chapters and structured by 27 basic verses, the Śikṣāsamuccaya cites approximately 130 Mahāyāna sūtras. The primary theme of the 27 verses is the so-called "vital points" or "key points" (marma-sthāna)<sup>31</sup> for a Mahāyāna practitioner. The seven "vital points" consisting of body, possessions, merit, sacrifice, protection, purification, and increase are expressed in the fourth stanza of the Śikṣāsamuccaya-kārikā as follows: "The sacrifice, for the sake of all living beings, of one's body, one's possessions, and one's merit acquired in all three times, and the protection, purification and increase of those [three things, i.e., one's body, possessions, and merit]."<sup>32</sup> This motif clearly echoes the Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra 2.75 in

<sup>29</sup> See Saito 1993, (14)-(18).

<sup>30</sup> See Kajihara 1991.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Bendall 1897–1902, xxxix and 17.10. See also Harrison 2007, 234–235 and 2009, 90.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> ātmabhāvena bhogānāṃ tryadhvavṛtteḥ śubhasya ca/

utsargaḥ sarvasattvebhyas tadrakṣāśuddhivardhanam// (Bendall 1897–1907, 17.13–14)

12 Facts or Fictions: Reconsidering Śāntideva's Names, Life, and Works (Saito) the early version and 3.10 in the later one which runs: "I sacrifice without regret my bodies, my possessions, my merit acquired in all three times, to accomplish good for all living beings," 33

#### IV Conclusion

The above survey leads us to the following chronology about the three works related to Śāntideva:

- ca. 5c.: The Sūtrasamuccaya (ascribed to Nāgārjuna) was compiled.
- ca. 8c.: The *Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra* (BSA-1), composed of 9 chapters, 702.5 verses in total, was written by \*Akṣayamati.
- ca. 8c.: The Śikṣāsamuccaya was written by "Śāntideva" in accordance with the motif of the above \*Akṣayamati's *Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra* 2.75.
- ca. early 9c.: The Śikṣāsamuccaya was translated by Ye shes sde et al. lDan dkar ma, Lalou No.655.
- ca. early 9c.: The above *Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra* was translated by dPal brtsegs *et al.*, Lalou No.659.
- ca. 8-10c.: Influenced by the Śikṣāsamuccaya, the enlarged Bodhi (sattva) caryāvatāra (BSA-2) was composed by "Śāntideva" after omitting, supplementing and changing the contents of the early \*Akṣayamati's

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> lus dang de bzhin longs spyod dang// dus sum dge ba thams chad kyang// sems can kun gyi don 'grub phyir// phangs pa myed par gtang bar bya// (BSA-1, 2.75, St.628, Ka 5a3)

ātmabhāvāms tathā bhogān sarvam tryadhvagatam śubham/ nirapekṣas tyajāmy eṣa sarvasattvārthasiddhaye// (BCA 3.10, Minayev 1890, 163.22-23)

<sup>\*</sup>This paper was read at the Australian Association of Buddhist Studies (AABS), Lecture Series, held at the University of Sydney on March 22<sup>nd</sup>, 2018. I am indebted to Mark Allon, Royce Wiles, Jim Rheingans, Barbara Nelson and other attendants for their pertinent questions and comments. However, any errors remain my own responsibility.

- Facts or Fictions: Reconsidering Śāntideva's Names, Life, and Works (Saito) 13

  \*\*Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra\*. The Sanskrit text of the enlarged version had probably 10 chapters and more or less 913 verses in total.
- ca. late 10c.: Prajñākaramati's story about the ascription of the three works, Bodhi (sattva) caryāvatāra, Śikṣāsamuccaya, and Sūtrasamuccaya, to "Śāntideva" was created and thereafter became influential. His extensive commentary was called Bodhicaryāvatāra-pañjikā and not Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra-pañjikā.
- ca. late 10c.: The enlarged *Bodhicaryāvatāra* was also translated into Chinese by the Indian monk Tiān Xí-zāi (天息災), who titled it Pú-tí-xíng-jīng (菩提行経,\**Bodhicaryāsūtra*) and ascribed it to Nāgārjuna (龍樹).
- ca. early 11c.: Rin chen bzang po (958–1055) *et al.* translated the enlarged version of the *Bodhi* (*sattva*) *caryāvatāra*.
- ca. late 11c. to early 12c.: Blo ldan shes rab (1059-1109) et al. retranslated and completed the enlarged version of the  $Bodhi(sattva) cary\bar{a}vat\bar{a}ra$  (BSA-3).
- ca. late 12c.: Following Prajñākaramati's account of the three works, Vibhūticandra established the biography of Śāntideva, which was placed at the head of his commentary, *Bodhicaryāvatāratātparyapañjikā Viśeṣadyotanī*. This biography supplied the later Tibetan tradition with the basic ideas about Śāntideva's life and works.

#### **Abbreviations**

- BSA-1: *Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra* written by "\*Akṣayamati" and translated by dPal brtsegs and Sarvajñādeva, which was discovered in the Tibetan manuscripts from Dūn-huáng. See above note 13.
- BSA-2: Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra retranslated by Rin chen bzang po, Śākya blo gros, and Dharmaśrībhadra in accordance with a manuscript from Madhyadeśa which most probably was composed of 1,000, or strictly 913,

- 14 Facts or Fictions: Reconsidering Śāntideva's Names, Life, and Works (Saito) verses in total. See Saito 1993, (16)-(18), and 1999.
- BSA-3: *Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra* retranslated and completed by Blo Idan shes rab and Sumatikīrti.
- BCA: Bodhicaryāvatāra, Sanskrit manuscripts and edited text. See Minayev 1890.
- BCAP: *Bodhicaryāvatārapañjikā* by *Prajñākaramati*. See La Vallée Poussin 1901–1914.

#### **Bibliography**

- Bachelor, S., tr., 1979, A Guide to the Bodhisattva's Way of Life, Dharamsala.
- Barnett, L. D., tr., 1909, The Path of Light, rendered for the first time into English from the Bodhicaryāvatāra of Śāntideva, a manual of Mahāyāna Buddhism, London.
- Bendall, C. ed., 1897–1902, Śikṣāsamuccaya, Bibliotheca Buddhica, vol.1, St.-Petersburg, repr. Osnabrück 1970, Tokyo 1977.
- Bendall, C. and Rouse, W. H., tr., 1922, Śikṣāsamuccaya: A Compendium of Buddhist Doctrine, London, repr. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1971.
- Brassard, F., 2000, *The Concept of Bodhicitta in Śāntideva's Bodhicaryāva-tāra*, Albany: State University of New York Press.
- Chandra Das, S., 1908, Pag Sam Jon Zang (dPag bsam ljon bzang), Part I, History of the Rise, Progress and Downfall of Buddhism in India by Sum pa mkhan po Ye shes dpal 'byor, Calcutta: The Presidency Jail Press, repr. Kyoto: Rinsen Book Co., 1984.
- Chattopadhyaya, Alaka, tr., 1970, *Tāranātha's History of Buddhism in India*, Simla, repr. Calcutta: K P Bagchi & Company 1980, Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass Publishers, 1990.
- Clayton, B. R., 2006, Moral Theory in Śāntideva's Śikṣāsamuccaya: Cultivating the fruits of virtue, London and New York: Routledge.
- Crosby, K. and Skilton, A., tr., 1996, Śāntideva: The Bodhicaryāvatāra, Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press.

- Facts or Fictions: Reconsidering Śāntideva's Names, Life, and Works (Saito) 15
- De Jong, J. W., 1975, "La légende de Sāntideva", *Indo-Iranian Journal* 16–3, 161–182.
- Dietz, S., 1984, *Die buddhistische Briefliteratur Indiens*, Asiatische Forschungen 84, Wiesbaden: Otto Harrassowitz.
- Dungkar Losang Khrinley ed., 2002, *Dungkar Tibetological Great Dictionary*, Beijing: China Tibetology Publishing House.
- Dwarika Das Shastri, Swami, ed. & tr., 1988, Bodhicaryāvatāra of Ārya Śāntideva with the Commentary Pañjikā of Shrī Prajñākaramati, Hindi Translation, Bauddha Bharati Series 21, Varanasi.
- Eimer, H., 1979, rNam thar rgyas pa. Materialien zu einer Biographie des Atiśa (Dīpaṃkaraśrījñāna), 1.Teil: Einführung, Inhaltsverzeichnis, Namensglossar, 2.Teil: Textmaterialien, Asiatische Forschungen, Band 67, Wiesbaden: Otto Harrassowitz.
- Eimer, H., 1981, "Suvarṇadvīpa's Commentaries on the *Bodhicaryāvatāra*," Studien zum Jainismus und Buddhismus, Alt- und Neu-Indische Studien 23, 73–78.
- Ejima Yasunori (江島惠教), 1966, "Nyūbodaigyōron no Chūshakubunken nitsuite (「入菩提行論」の註釈文献について) [Commentaries on Śāntideva's *Bodhicaryāvatāra*]," Indogaku Bukkyōgaku Kenkyū [Journal of Indian and Buddhist Studies] 14-2, 190-194.
- Filliozat, J., 1964, "Śikṣāsamuccaya et Sūtrasamuccaya," Journal Asiatique, 472–478.
- Finot, L., tr., 1920, *La marche à la lumière* (*Bodhicaryāvatāra*), Paris: Les Deux Océans.
- Harrison, P., 2007, "The Case of the Vanishing Poet: New Light on Śāntideva and the Śikṣāsamuccaya," in K. Klaus & J.-U. Hartmann, eds., Indica et Tibetica: Festschrift für Michael Hahn, Zum 65. Geburtstag von Freunden und Schülern überreicht, Wiener Studien zur Tibetologie und Buddhismuskunde 66, Wien, 215–248.
- Harrison, P., 2009, "Verses by Śāntideva in the Śikṣāsamuccaya: A New

- 16 Facts or Fictions: Reconsidering Śāntideva's Names, Life, and Works (Saito)

  English Translation," *Bulletin of the Asia Institute* 23, 87–103.
- Hedinger, J., 1984, Aspekte der Schulung in der Laufbahn eines Bodhisattva, Freiburger Beiträge zur Indologie 17, Wiesbaden: Otto Harrassowitz.
- Ishida, Ch., 1988, "Some New Remarks on the *Bodhicaryāvatāra* Chap.V", *Journal of Indian and Buddhist Studies* 37–1, 476–479.
- Ishida, Ch., 2001, "Notes on the Deśanā-ritual in the *Bodhicaryāvatāra*: Evidence of its Revision," *Bukkyōshisō-Bukkyōshigaku-Kenkyū*: Volume in Honour of Prof. Dr. Ryūgen Taga on His Seventieth Birthday, 199–216.
- Kajihara, Mieko (梶原三恵子), 1991, "Bodhicaryāvatāra no Kihon-Seikaku: Ichi-Ninshō no Imisurumono (Bodhicaryāvatāra の基本性格— 一人称の意味するもの一) [The Bodhicaryāvatāra for Ritual Recitation]," Machikaneyama Ronsō (Philosophy) 25, 25–28.
- Kanakura, E., tr., 1965, *Satori e no Michi* (さとりへの道) [The Way to Awakening], Sāra Sōsho (サーラ叢書) [Sāra Series] 9, Kyoto: Heirakuji-Shoten (平楽寺書店).
- La Vallée Poussin, L. de, ed., 1901–1914, Bodhicaryāvatārapañjikā, Prajñākaramati's Commentary to the Bodhicaryāvatāra of Śāntideva, Bibliotheca Indica, Nos. 983, 1031, 1091, 1126, 1139, 1305, 1399, Calcutta.
- Lalou, M., 1953, "Les textes bouddhiques au temps du roi Khri-sron-ldebcan," *Journal Asiatique* 241, 313–353.
- Lokesh Chandra ed., 1971, *The Collected Works of Bu-ston*, Part 24 (Ya), from the Collections of Prof. Dr. Raghu Vira, Śatapiṭaka Series 64, New Delhi: IAIC.
- Lindtner, Chr., 1991, "Text-critical Notes on Sanskrit Texts, I, *Bodhi-* (*sattva*) *caryāvatāra*," Papers in Honour of Prof. Dr. Ji Xian-lin on the Occasion of his 80<sup>th</sup> Birthday, Vol.2, 651–660.
- Matics, M. L., tr., 1970, Entering the Path of Enlightenment: The Bodhicaryāvatāra of the Buddhist Poet Śāntideva, London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd..

- Facts or Fictions: Reconsidering Śāntideva's Names, Life, and Works (Saito) 17
- Minayev, I.P., ed., 1890, "Bodhicaryāvatāra," Zapiski Vostochnago Otdeleniya Imperatorskago Russkago Arkheologicheskago Obshchestva 4, 153–228.
- Mochizuki, Kaie (望月海慧), ed., 1999, "Zum *Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra* des Dīpaṃkaraśrījñāna," *Hokke-bunka Kenkyū* (法華文化研究) 25, 39–121.
- Mrozik, S., 2007, Virtuous Bodies: The Physical Dimensions of Morality in Buddhist Ethics, Oxford University Press.
- Nishioka, Soshu, ed., 1982, "Bu-ston *Bukkyō-shi*, Mokurokubu Sakuin (『プトゥン仏教史』目録部索引) [Index to the Catalogue Section of Bu-ston's *History of Buddhism*] II," *Annual Report of the Institute for the Study of Cultural Exchange* 5, Faculty of Letters, The University of Tokyo, 43–94.
- Obermiller, E., tr., 1932, *History of Buddhism (Chos-hbyung) by Bu-ston*, Part II, Heidelberg, repr. Tokyo 1964.
- Pezzali, A., 1968, Śāntideva, mystique bouddhiste des VII<sup>e</sup> et VIII<sup>e</sup> siècles, Firenze.
- Pezzali, A., tr., 1982, Śāntideva e il Bodhicaryāvatāra e le kārikā del Śiksāsamuccaya, Bologna.
- Saito, Akira (斎藤明), 1986, "Tonkō Shutsudo Akṣayamati Saku Nyūbodaigyōron to sono Shūhen (敦煌出土『入菩薩行論』とその周辺) [Akṣayamati's *Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra* as Found in the Tibetan Manuscritpts from Dūn-huáng]," Chibetto no Bukkyō to Shakai (チベットの仏教と社会) [Buddhism and Society in Tibet], Tokyo: Shunjūsha (春秋社).
- Saito, A., 1993, A Study of Akṣayamati (=Śāntideva) 's Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra as Found in the Tibetan Manuscripts from Tun-huang (Research Report of the Grant-in-Aid for Scientific Research (C), Mie University), Mie.
- Saito, A., 1996a, "Śāntideva in the History of Mādhyamika Philosophy", Buddhism in India and Abroad, Mumbai, 257–263.

- 18 Facts or Fictions: Reconsidering Śāntideva's Names, Life, and Works (Saito)
- Saito, Akira (斎藤明), 1996b, "Nyūbosatsugyōron-Saisho no Śāntideva Rikai (『入菩薩行論解説細疏』のシャーンティデーヴァ理解) [Interpretations of Śāntideva's Philosophy as Found in the Anonymous Commentary, \*Bodhisattvacaryāvatāravivṛtti]," Indoshisō to Bukkyōbunka (今西順吉教授還暦記念論集・インド思想と仏教文化) [Indian Thoughts and Buddhist Culture: Essays in Honour of Professor J. Imanishi on His Sixtieth Birthday], Tokyo: Shunjūsha (春秋社), 582-594.
- Saito, A., 1997, "Bu ston on the sPyod 'jug (Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra)", Transmission of the Tibetan Canon (Proceedings of the 7th Seminar of the International Association for Tibetan Studies, Graz, 1995, vol. III), Österreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften, Philosophisch-Historische Klasse, Denkschriften, 257.Band, Wien, 79–85.
- Saito, A., 1999, "Remarks on the Tabo Manuscript of the *Bodhisattvacary-avatāra*", *Tabo Studies II: Manuscripts, Texts, Inscriptions and Arts*, Serie Orientale Roma 87, Rome, 175–189.
- Saito, A., 2000, A Study of the Dūn-huáng Recension of the Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra (Research Report of the Grant-in-Aid for Scientific Research (C), Mie University), Mie.
- Saito, Akira (斎藤明), 2001, "Bodhi (sattva) caryāvatāra to Śikṣāsamuccaya (Bodhi (sattva) caryā-vatāra と Śikṣāsamuccaya) [Bodhi (sattva) caryāvatāra and Śikṣāsamuccaya]," Indotetsugaku Bukkyōgaku (印度哲学仏教学) 16, pp. 326–353.
- Saito, Akira (斎藤明), 2002, "Akṣayamati to Śāntideva (アクシャヤマティとシャーンティデーヴァ) [Akṣayamati and Śāntideva]," *Higashi-Ajia Bukkyō sono Seiritsu to Tenkai* (東アジア仏教 その成立と展開) [East-Asian Buddhism and its Development], Tokyo: Shunjūsha (春秋社), 533-551.
- Saito, A., 2004, "Notes on the Interpretation of *Bodhi* (sattva) caryāvatāra V.104–106", *Gedenkschrift J. W. de Jong*, ed. by H.W. Bodewitz and M.

- Facts or Fictions: Reconsidering Śāntideva's Names, Life, and Works (Saito) 19

  Hara, Tokyo: The International Institute for Buddhist Studies, 135–147.
- Saito, A., 2010, "An Inquiry into the Relationship between the Śikṣāsamuc-caya and the Bodhi(sattva)caryāvatāra," Studies in Indian Philosophy and Buddhism 17, 17–24.
- Schiefner, A., ed., 1868, *Tāranāthae de doctrinae buddhicae in india propagatione*, Petropoli, repr. Tokyo: Suzuki Research Foundation, 1963.
- Schiefner, A., tr., 1869, *Tāranātha's Geschichte des Buddhismus in Indien*, St. Petersburg, repr. Tokyo: Suzuki Research Foundation, 1963.
- Schmidt, R., tr., 1923, Der Eintritt in den Wandel in Erleuchtung (Bodhicaryāvatāra), Paderborn: Verlag von Ferdinand Schöningh.
- Seyfort Ruegg, D., 1981, *The Literature of the Madhyamaka School of Philosophy in India*, A History of Indian Literature 7–1, Wiesbaden.
- Seyfort Ruegg, D., 1982, "Towards a Chronology of the Mādhyamika School," *Indological and Buddhist Studies*, Canberra, 505–530.
- Steinkellner, E., tr., 1981, Śāntideva: Eintritt in das Leben zur Erleuchtung (Bodhicaryāvatāra), Düsseldorf/Köln: Eugen Diederichs Verlag.
- Stearns, C., 1996, "The Life and Tibetan Legacy of the Indian Mahāpaṇḍita Vibhūticandra," *Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies* 19–1, 127–171.
- Tashi Dorje, reproduction, 1975, *Byang chub sems dpa'i spyod pa la 'jug pa'i rnam bshad gZhung don rab gsal snang ba*: A detailed exposition of the Bodhicaryāvatāra of Ācārya Śāntideva by Sa bzang mati Paṇchen 'Jam dbyangs blo gros. Reproduced from a print from the late 19th Sde-dge blocks. Delhi: Tibetan Bonpo Monastic Centre.
- Tsukamoto, Keishō (塚本啓祥) et al., ed., 1990, Bongo-Butten no Kenkyū (梵語仏典の研究) III Ronsho-Hen (論書篇) [A Descriptive Bibliography of the Sanskrit Buddhist Literature, Vol.3: Abhidharma, Madhyamaka, Yogācāra, Buddhist epistemology and Logic], Kyoto: Heirakuji-Shoten (平楽寺書店).

- 20 Facts or Fictions: Reconsidering Śāntideva's Names, Life, and Works (Saito)
- Wakahara, Yūshō (若原雄昭), 1990, "Nyūbodaigyō-ron no Daijōbussetsuron (『入菩提行論』の大乗仏説論) [On the Ascription of Mahāyāna Buddhism to Buddha Gautama as Discussed in the *Bodhicaryāvatāra*], "*Ryūkoku-Daigaku-Bukkyōgaku-Kenkyūshitsu Nenpō* (龍谷大学仏教学研究室年報) 4, 45-54.
- Williams, P., 1998a, Altruism and Reality: Studies in the Philosophy of the Bodhicaryāvatāra, Richmond: Curzon Press.
- Williams, P., 1998b, *The Reflexive Nature: A Tibetan Madhyamaka Defence*, Richmond: Curzon Press.
- (This research is supported in part by a Grant-in-Aid for Scientific Research (A) from JSPS No.16H01901)

Professor
International College
For Postgraduate Buddhist Studies